



J. Besson

B. Chevannes

The continuity-creativity debate : the case of Revival

Argues that the attempts to polarize the debate around Caribbean culture into an African continuity versus a creole creativity position is misplaced. The authors use Revivalism as an example of both continuity in African-derived Myalim and an on-going process of re-creation.

In: New West Indian Guide/ Nieuwe West-Indische Gids 70 (1996), no: 3/4, Leiden, 209-228

This PDF-file was downloaded from <http://www.kitlv-journals.nl>

JEAN BESSON & BARRY CHEVANNES

THE CONTINUITY-CREATIVITY DEBATE:
THE CASE OF REVIVAL

INTRODUCTION

The republication of Sidney Mintz and Richard Price's classic work, *An Anthropological Approach to the Afro-American Past* (1976), under the new title *The Birth of African-American Culture* (1992), clearly indicates that the debate on the African cultural heritage is still alive. In the Preface to their republished essay, Mintz and Price (1992:viii-ix) outline this debate in terms of reactions to their first edition, which advanced a linguistic model of underlying African "grammatical" principles and a dynamic process of Caribbean culture-building to replace the more static approach of African cultural survivals advanced by M.J. Herskovits (e.g. 1937, 1941; Herskovits & Herskovits 1947):

The argument aimed to build on the insights of Herskovits and his peers. But it was greeted in some quarters by a – for us – surprising hostility, accompanied by the charge that it denied the existence of an African heritage in the Americas. It seemed that many such reactions originated in a desire to polarize Afro-Americanist scholarship into a flatly "for" or "against" position in regard to African cultural retentions. For instance, Mervyn Alleyne dubbed us "creation theorists," charging us with exaggerated attention to the cultural creativity of enslaved Africans in the New World; yet his own book reaches conclusions close to our own. (Mintz & Price 1992:viii)

Likewise, in relation to Besson's (1979, 1984) reinterpretation of the customary freehold tenure of "family land" as a Caribbean institution, Carnegie (1987) claimed that she had dismissed the African heritage. How-

ever, Besson had been concerned to show that family land is not a passive survival from either ancestral or colonial cultures. This approach explicitly left room for the possibility that family land may reflect the underlying grammar of West and Central African kin-based landholding (Besson 1987:108), but such unilineal systems have been transformed within Caribbean societies to create adaptive creole tenures.

Consistent with this approach, Besson (1995b:46) has argued that the Jamaican Revival worldview "highlights the dynamic process of Caribbean culture-building as the context for African continuities in Caribbean culture." This perspective advances Chevannes's (1990, 1995a) approach to Rastafari, which goes beyond Alleyne in the search for the African heritage in African-Jamaican religion.

Based on his 1968-69 fieldwork, Chevannes had approached Rastafari as an entirely new and innovative movement that had superseded Revival. Not only was prevailing scholarship focused on the millenarian and political impact of this new religious movement (Smith *et al* 1961; Thrupp 1962; Patterson 1964), but the social and religious characteristics of the Rastas themselves (the dreadlocks, foodways, monotheism, hostility to spirit possession, etc.) served to isolate them from the mainstream. Rastafari thus appeared as an entirely new creation of Jamaicans, one which was clearly on the ascendancy, attracting the urban youth and posing a serious challenge for the colonial and post-colonial state, in a manner reminiscent of the challenge posed by the Revival leader Bedward in the period from 1895 to 1921.

Meanwhile, Revival had undergone a decline. While the 1943 census showed a total of 332 Bedwardites, down from 1,309 in 1921, by 1960 it was too insignificant to include as a separate category. "Pocomania," which as a census category encompassed both Zion and Pukumina, also registered a decline, from 4,230 in 1943 to 811 in 1960. The pealing drums, announcing a Revival meeting, had disappeared from the St. Catherine and St. Andrew hills, and so too had the street meetings of Revival bands prevalent in the 1950s (Simpson 1956). Pentecostal-type churches, on the other hand, were showing increasing strength, from 3.9 percent in 1943 to 12.8 percent in 1960. And, as Mother Burn's search for legitimacy revealed, this growth was at the expense of Revival. Chevannes (1978) therefore concluded that Revival was "A Disappearing Religion," superseded by Rastafari and Pentecostalism, the old giving way to the new.

It was not until his 1973-75 fieldwork among the Rastafari and later in his urban fieldwork among Revivalists that Chevannes came to appreciate the dynamism of African-derived religion. Thus, while Alleyne (1988:103), in his search for the African heritage in African-Jamaican religion, found

such continuities in Myal, Native Baptism, and Revival, but denied their presence among Rastafari. Chevannes (1990, 1994, 1995a) uncovered direct deeper level continuities between Rastafari and Revival, arguing that Rastafari might also be considered an African-derived religion with direct continuity with Revival and through Revival with the earlier antecedant Myal and Native Baptist movements. And in his current urban fieldwork, ongoing since 1992, Chevannes (1995b) has found overwhelming evidence of a deep-rooted continuity and transformation of Revival itself that can be seen to be central, not marginal, to the wider issue of Jamaican worldview and identity. The "disappearing religion" has not disappeared at all; it has been undergoing transformation and regeneration. Meanwhile, based on long-term recurrent fieldwork in rural Trelawny over the period 1968-95, Besson (1987, 1993, 1995b) also found that Revival was still thriving at the heart of a Jamaican peasant culture rooted in the slavery past, but on the basis of continued transformation.

This recent research by the authors leads to the conclusion that Revival not only represents continuity with African-derived Myalism, but also an on-going process of re-creation. It reinforces the contention by Mintz and Price that the attempts to polarize Afro-Americanist scholarship into a creation versus retention position are totally misplaced. Such attempts we believe are based on a reified rather than dynamic understanding of culture. No-one disputes the African roots of Revival such as the spirit pantheon, spirit possession and its role in healing and personal empowerment, the cosmology of an integrated world incorporating the spirits, the living and the dead, the symbolism of water and other objects of nature as mediators between the unseen and the living dimensions of this undivided world, or the use of music and dance in ceremonial worship. However, this article is concerned to show how these African cultural "grammatical" themes have been re-created and transformed in varying social contexts from slavery to the present day, and therefore that Revival, both as religion and worldview, represents both continuity and re-creation. Thus what was taken by Chevannes to be the disappearance of Revival can now be seen to be a further stage in the dynamic process of transformation.

In advancing this argument we focus first on the pre-Christian era during slavery, until the late eighteenth century. We then turn to the Christian era encompassing both the later slavery period and the aftermath of emancipation in 1838 up to the Great Revival in the early 1860s. The impact of Bedward after 1860, and especially following the Morant Bay Rebellion of 1865, is then considered, up until the apparent disappearance of Revival noted by Chevannes. The continuity of Revival in Trelawny peasant culture is then outlined, followed by an examination of the current

situation in urban Kingston. However, we are not advancing a rural-urban dichotomy, for the networking of Revival, the dynamics of rural-urban migration, and improved media communication open up further avenues for articulation and transformation between the urban-rural scenes.

THE PRE-CHRISTIAN ERA

On the Jamaican plantations the slaves were untouched by Christianity until the arrival of the Nonconformist missionaries in the late eighteenth century. In this pre-Christian era, the slaves forged a cosmology from the elements of their African religions. This process of re-creation remolded the African baseline beliefs in witchcraft, medicine, ancestral cults, and a pantheon of gods and spirits within the social context of the slave plantation system. This re-creation crystallized in Myalism and Obeah.

Myalism was centered around community rituals including spirit possession and the Myal dance, which honored the African-derived minor spirit deities of the Myal pantheon (rather than the distant Supreme Deity) and the departed ancestors who, it was believed, could possess the living. Integral also to Myalism was the belief in a dual spirit or soul. One spirit was called the *shadow* of the living person, the other being the *duppy*.

Obeah both contrasted with and complemented Myalism. Obeah was "essentially a type of sorcery" using "charms, poisons, and shadow catching" (Patterson 1973:188). Involving clients and an Obeahman, it was practised at an individual level for protection, punishment, or revenge. Obeah was, however, also instrumental in slave rebellions, and in this defensive function and in other respects, such as the manipulation of spirits, overlapped with Myalism.

Through Obeah one's *shadow* could be caught and separated from one, thus causing disorientation and mania; through Myal it could be restored, making the person whole again. The other spirit, the *duppy*, was believed to leave the body at death and, after remaining for a few days at the place of death or burial, to journey to join the ancestors. The elaborate mortuary ritual was practised to mark and effect the transition and placing of this dual soul. Myalism was thus both a belief system and a religious organization modelled on West African secret cult societies. Myalism united the slaves in resistant response to slavery and European values, and was thought to protect their communities from internal and external harm. The unification of disparate ethnic groups was accomplished and sustained by an integrating network of communication and exchange that we believe

has come to characterize the religious and secular life of Jamaicans right through to the present.

The diary of Thomas Thistlewood (Hall 1989) provides insight into Myal mortuary ritual in the life of Jamaican slaves. On Saturday January 5, 1771, "Abba's Johnie died" (p. 184). Abba was a female slave, purchased by Thistlewood in 1758, who became his "chief domestic slave" and "his most prolific child-bearing female" (p. 186). Johnie, Abba's son, was about six years old when he died. Thistlewood "[G]ave Abba rum to entertain her company at the burial," and "[M]ade Lincoln dig a grave for Abba's Johnie, near her house. At night they buried him." Thistlewood also "gave some boards, nails, &c. to make him a coffin, which Mrs Bennett's Sam and Cumberland performed. Venus, Johnie, Shalle, Mr Say's Vine, several of Egypt and Kirkpatrick Negroes, &c. at the burial. Sang, &c.&c." (p. 185). Abba and her "new sweetheart, Cudjoe" reciprocated by giving Thistlewood presents of a roasted pig and oranges (pp. 184-85).

Several months later, on Sunday July 7, Thistlewood gave Abba leave:

to Throw Water (as they called it) for her boy Johnie who died some months ago; and although I [Thistlewood] gave them strict charge to make no noise, yet they transgressed, by beating the Coombie loud, singing high, &c. Many Negroes there from all over the country. (Hall 1989:185-86)

This ritual, with its libation of Jamaican rum to Johnie's spirit, African-derived "Coombie" or "Gumbe" drumming, and the participation of slaves from throughout the island was, as Hall (1989:214, n.5) notes, "[A] later continuation of the death rituals in which, until a final 'play' about a year after death there were recognised periodic returns to celebration." Thistlewood's help was reciprocated by gifts from the slaves. Slaves came to the burial from Egypt and Kirkpatrick, a sugar plantation and livestock pen respectively, elsewhere in the Parish of Westmoreland (Hall 1989:xvi, 160).

This description of Johnie's death has all the essential features of mortuary ritual in Jamaica even at the present time, namely, the protracted nature of the funeral rites; the mobilizing of a network of friends and kin, far and wide, including overseas; the burial in the family plot or garden near the house; the entertainment character in the drumming, singing, and drinking; and, not least, relations of reciprocity.

THE CHRISTIAN ERA

Near the end of the eighteenth century, the war of independence in the American colonies, the abolition movement, and the religious revival in England led to Nonconformist missionaries being sent to Jamaica. The Moravians, who had arrived in 1754, were joined by American Negro Baptist preachers in 1784, the Methodists in 1789 and the English Baptists in 1813. This missionary activity had a great impact on the African population. The Established Anglican Church was violently opposed to the preaching of these missionaries, which they regarded as a threat to the slave system (Patterson 1973:40-41, 207-9; Besson 1995b:47).

The Baptists were the most successful in converting the slaves. The main reason for this was the reliance on Negro preachers in the late eighteenth century – the most important being George Lisle and Moses Baker – combined with the use of the Wesleyan ticket-and-class-leader system, which facilitated Myal continuity through the Baptist religion.¹ In the last decades of the eighteenth century and early decades of the nineteenth century this continuity was reflected in the term Native Baptist Movement. It was in response to this subversion of the Baptist faith that George Lisle called on the Baptist Missionary Society in England for reinforcement; and it was in this context that the Reverend William Knibb, an outspoken opponent of slavery and the Established Church, came to Falmouth in Trelawny in 1830.

Following the so-called “Baptist War” slave rebellion in Jamaica’s western parishes in 1831, Knibb, regarded by the plantocracy as one of the ringleaders of the rebellion, was arrested and briefly imprisoned. In 1832, as a deputy for the Baptist Church in Jamaica, Knibb contributed to the anti-slavery campaign in Britain, and in the Falmouth Baptist Church on August 1, 1838 celebrated the full emancipation of the slaves. Following emancipation, he negotiated the first wage settlement in Jamaica with the Trelawny plantocracy on behalf of the former slaves. With another Baptist minister, the Reverend James Phillippo, Knibb also initiated the island’s church-founded Free Village System within a context of acute plantation-peasant land and labor conflict. By 1840 Knibb estimated that there were nearly 8,000 cottages in 200 such villages throughout the island; by 1845 his estimate was that 19,000 ex-slaves had purchased land and were erecting their own cottages (Paget 1964; Knibb Sibley 1965; Wright 1973; Mintz 1989:131-79). By 1860, “the number of holdings under 50 acres in extent had reached 50,000” (Marshall 1985:6), and Jamaica’s “reconstituted” post-slavery peasantry was established.

Within this context of the Christian era of the late eighteenth century,

especially after 1791 (Schuler 1979:133), until the 1860s, Myal was further consolidating through transformation. The slaves embraced the Baptist faith at a formal level while remaining committed to their Myalist traditions. As a result, two variants of Baptist Christianity emerged among the slaves: the "Orthodox" form, taught by the missionaries and practised by the slave congregations in the churches; and the "Native" or "Black" Baptist variant, controlled by Myalism. Thus Myal identified itself as Christian and in so doing took up a clear-cut position of opposition to Obeah, which was seen as a source of divisiveness within communities. Such Black Baptist Christianity played a central role in the 1831 slave rebellion, led by the Native Baptist class leader, "Daddy" Sam Sharpe, a domestic slave in Montego Bay in the Parish of St. James.

After emancipation, the parallel commitment to two variants of Baptist Christianity continued among the former slaves. Orthodox Baptist faith provided the formal framework of free village life (Mintz 1989:157-79); while the Native Baptist variant, rooted in Myalism, formed "the core of a strong, self-confident counter-culture" against the persisting plantation system (Schuler 1980:44) and the basis of a black ethnicity (Robotham 1988:35-36). Emancipation itself was a significant catalyst in the transformation of Myalism; for emancipation enabled Myal to come out into the open (for example, drumming was no longer forbidden except in relation to the Night Noises Law), to be opposed to missionary Christianity, and even to subvert it while appearing to uphold it.

In the 1860s, Native Baptist beliefs, reinforced by the Myalist Revival of the 1840s and 1850s, and by the religion of post-emancipation African indentured immigrants, contributed to and controlled the Great Evangelical Revival. This produced a new African-Christian variant, "Revival," which is the basis of Jamaica's Revival cults, Revival Zion and Pukumina (or Pocomania) today.² Alleyne (1988:96, 101) describes these contemporary religious forms as "important meeting points in the continuum of religious differentiation created by the meeting of Myalism and Christianity," with Pukumina being the closer of the two to Myalism, and Revival Zion being nearer to Baptist Christianity.

In the aftermath of emancipation Myal, and then Revival, took root in the Baptist church-founded free villages, where such creole religion was regarded by the missionaries as "backsliding" to an African way of life (Mintz 1989:177-78). In such villages family land was also evolving in a process of both continuity and transformation from the proto-peasant past. Moreover, through burial on family land within the context of the Myal-based worldview, Revival was literally embedding itself in post-emancipation villages (Besson 1995b).

The process of transformation during this period was that of incorporating Christian elements. These included the incorporation of Jesus Christ, John the Baptist, and other Christian prophets as Revival spirits. The Bible also became central to Revival, although it was imbued with Revival interpretations. In addition, preaching became a significant element of Revival ritual, as in Christianity. The practice of digging up Obeah also placed witchcraft and medicine in a new, Christian, context of cutting out pagan destruction. Spirit possession, which was central to the Myal dance, remained, but possession could now be by Christian spirits. Revival was therefore re-creating the Jamaican worldview in the context of free village communities.

THE IMPACT OF BEDWARD

After the re-establishment of Crown Colony Government following the Morant Bay Rebellion in 1865, the role of Bedward was central to the continued re-creation of Revival. First, from the Christian period the Bible was a central basis of moral authority among Revivalists and this was appropriated by Bedward in his role of preacher. Bedward also skilfully used the Bible against the ruling class, especially the plantocracy who either consolidated their monopoly of sugar plantations in the western parishes, such as Trelawny, and south-central Clarendon, or re-established their position through the expansion of banana plantations or livestock pens in the east and south of the island (Satchell 1990). This opposition to the ruling class included denouncing the whites as Pharisees and Saducees. In the aftermath of the Morant Bay Rebellion, Bedward therefore both reinforced the tradition of Revival as resistance and involved Revival in a struggle for legitimacy at a time of growth among the Established and Nonconformist churches, reflected for example in educational developments and the consolidation of church-founded villages. By establishing a church of his own, the "Jamaica Baptist Free Church," Bedward made a bid for legitimacy.

Second, healing became a major dimension of Revival with the beginning of the "balm-yard," which elaborated the significance of the yard from the proto-peasant past (cf. Mintz 1989:225-50); a development associated especially with Bedward and Mammy Forbes, who passed the tradition on to her daughter Mother Rita (Beckwith 1929; Barrett 1979) and others. Healing rituals involved the use of water, anti-Obeah charms, the Bible, as well as prayer. Third, Bedward was a charismatic leader who almost believed himself to be God, telling Beckwith that he could set the

date for the end of the world. This merging of identity between humanity and God (which would subsequently evolve within Rastafari with the conceptualization of "I and I") was a variation on the Revival possession theme.

The impact of Bedward, then, in the aftermath of Morant Bay, was a further re-creation of Revival under the new conditions and ambivalent developments of freedom; and in the context of the continuity or re-establishment of the plantation system within a class situation that was much clearer, and even worse, than during slavery. For poverty was now exacerbated and the peasantry was becoming saturated within the constraints of the consolidated plantation system and its transformation to corporate capitalism (Beckford 1972; Satchell 1990). Bedward's role within this context of oppression was that of a God, a Savior, a "Lord and Master," a great healer. Bedwardism also reflected the culmination of the antagonistic class dynamic, which would later give rise to Rastafari. Bedwardism therefore posed a challenge to the state structure and was soon crushed, with Bedward himself being incarcerated by the state. However, while Bedwardism fell into decline, Revivalism did not, at least not immediately, or uniformly. As the census figures quoted above show, Revivalism (under the general category "Pocomania") did not decline in numbers until the period after 1943.

REVIVAL AMONG THE TRELAWNY PEASANTRY

In his article on Revivalism as a disappearing religion, Chevannes (1978: 15) concluded that "as far as the peasantry is concerned, it [Revival] is no longer a force." However, Besson's fieldwork provides strong evidence that Revival not only remains embedded in the island's peasant culture and – a point of view shared by Chevannes (1994, 1995b) – continues to shape the Jamaican worldview (Besson 1993, 1995b), but is also undergoing transformation in keeping with the new, more modern context.

Research in Trelawny focused on five free villages at the persisting plantation-peasant interface: The Alps, Refuge, Kettering, Granville, and Martha Brae.³ The villagers are still Baptist in formal faith, and Baptist churches and class houses provide symbols of the free villages, moral guidelines for daily life, and a significant focus for community activities. However, Baptist Christianity co-exists with the Revival worldview, which orders the villagers' entire world including perceived relations between the living and the dead. This worldview was studied in depth in Martha Brae, where there were three Revival yards. The oldest of these

"bands" (now also known as "churches") was established around 1948 and still endured in 1995, marked by a tall seal or pole with a flag representing the Revival spirit pantheon (cf. Simpson 1956, Chevannes 1978: 6) and led by a "Pastor" and a "Mother." In addition, by 1995 Revivalism had spread to Martha Brae's satellite squatter settlement of Zion (where Revivalism co-exists with Rastafari as in Martha Brae), which has several Revival yards including a "balm-yard" with a female healer.⁴

Revival cosmology in Martha Brae closely resembles that outlined by Chevannes (1978, 1990, 1995a) for the traditional Revival worldview. Revival is essentially a spirit possession cult based on a perception of an integrated world of living beings, God, the spirits, and the dead. While the unseen portion of this world includes the Christian Trinity, the total spirit pantheon is Africa-derived (cf. Patterson 1973:182-207; Schuler 1979: 133). Likewise, spirit possession and baptism through immersion stem, as Schuler (1979:133) noted of Myal, "from an African and not a Christian or European tradition." The spirits, including those of the deceased, are thought to cause good fortune and misfortune, and to be open to influences for good and evil. The latter is believed to be effected through an Obeahman, while the former is regarded as the true role of Revival.

Spirit possession, which is manifested at meetings, is believed to be induced through drumming, dancing, singing "sankeys," and "trumping" around the basin of holy water which stands on the subsidiary altar (cf. Chevannes 1978:8-9).⁵ Possession, which culminates in trance and sometimes in glossolalia, is regarded as enabling communication with the spirits for protection, prophesy, and healing. It is believed that the spirit world may also be revealed to individuals through visions in dreams. Contact with the Revival spirit pantheon is perceived as being a source both of power and of danger, and this is especially reflected in the symbolic colors of red and white: white symbolizing the sacred spirit world, red standing for the power and the danger involved in spirit contact. Revival turbans are therefore usually white or red, and women often dress in red or white for meetings.⁶

As in the slavery past, the Revival worldview is reflected in elaborate mortuary ritual, where Revival plays a complementary role to the Baptist Church. While the Baptist minister from the William Knibb Memorial Baptist Church in Falmouth generally conducts the funeral and oversees the burial, Revival cosmology is reflected in a number of significant features of ritual and belief. These include, first, a series of "set-ups" in the "dead-yard" whereby members of the community visit and keep company with the household of the deceased. Sankey-singing and merrymaking involving jesting and playing dominoes are aspects of these community

gatherings. Feasting on coffee, bread, and rum at these set-ups reflects further creole innovations, as at Abba's Johnnie's death in slavery.

These community rituals in Martha Brae are undergoing transformation. The traditional set-up, whereby the corpse was laid out in the house – with a saucer of salt placed on the body to keep the dual spirit (see below) at bay – and the household and community sat watch over the deceased, was beginning to die out in the late 1960s and early 1970s. The corpse was sometimes kept in the hospital morgue in Falmouth, especially if the death occurred in hospital. However, villagers explained that there were only five drawers in the morgue, one of which was kept for “dem what squash out a road”; that is, for road accident victims. When the morgue was full, the body was “iced” in the house-yard by the village's male mortician, nicknamed “Sam Isaacs” after one of Jamaica's leading undertakers in Kingston and Montego Bay.

At that time too the Nine Night wake, traditionally held nine nights after death to mark the transition of the *duppy* to the spirit world, was beginning to change: it being re-scheduled to the nearest Saturday to accommodate the demands of wage labor which is an increasing dimension of the peasant economy. In addition, a Forty Night was sometimes held approximately forty nights after death to further assist the *duppy's* journey, which was regarded as completed by the tombing one year after death.

By 1995, these rituals had been transformed. Nine Night and Forty Night are dying out, while there is increasing emphasis on the set-up (now known as “Singing Night”) the night before the funeral as the culmination of the set-ups at the house-yard of the deceased. Moreover, despite this increasing significance of Singing Night, the corpse is now routinely removed to a funeral parlor beyond the village such as to a recently established “dead-house” at the nearby land settlement of Hague. The rising cost of mortuary ritual, referred to by villagers as a reason for the decline of Nine Night, seems an insufficient explanation for this change. The removal of the corpse, the increasing practice of vaulting (completed at the funeral), and the logistics of return migration from the urban areas (and sometimes from overseas) for the funeral appear to be contributing to this transformation within the continuity of the set-up complex.

A second continuity with the slavery past concerns the elaborate funeral itself. If the deceased was a paid-up member of “The Martha Brae Come-Together [sic] Society,” a friendly society whose main function is the provision of mutual aid for sickness and burial, the Society contributes to the costs of the mortuary ritual. At the funeral a procession of the Society – with banners and regalia, and members dressed in black and white – escorts the coffin from Martha Brae to the Falmouth Baptist

Church and back to the village cemetery. Prior to this, the body may have "lain in state" in the Society Hall. When the Baptist minister has completed the burial service and left the cemetery, Revivalists dance (waving their Society regalia) on the grave. In addition to perpetuating the elaborate funerary ritual of Myalism during slavery, the institution of the friendly society itself appears to be rooted in mutual aid among the slaves as well as in European and African influences (cf. Karasch 1979; Johnson 1991).⁷ Free community grave-digging, in return for breakfast and rum provided by the bereaved, reflects further continuity in relations of reciprocity.

A third significant continuity lies in the distinction between the *duppy* and the *shadow* inherent in the concept of the dual soul. The elaborate mortuary ritual in Martha Brae continues to be practised to place the *duppy* in the spirit world and settle the *shadow* in the grave. However, as in slavery, it is believed that the *shadow* may continue to be active among the living causing harm. This belief was highlighted on several occasions which reflected three variations on the tombing theme. First, an untombed *shadow* may cause illness and death by wandering from the grave. Second, even with proper tombing, a *shadow* may be invoked by Obeah to cause misfortune. Third, even with proper tombing (including vaulting) and without invocation, a *shadow* may cause misfortune and death of its own volition.

A fourth continuity is that Revival mortuary ritual provides a basis for inter-community networking in Martha Brae, as with the Myal rituals surrounding Abba's Johnie's death and burial during slavery. Individuals from other communities attend funerals and wakes, while Martha Brae villagers attend such rituals elsewhere. In addition, friendly societies from other communities, especially from the neighboring village of Granville, attend burials in Martha Brae; while the Martha Brae Come Together Society processes at funerals in other villages and in Falmouth. Membership of such societies also cross-cuts communities; for example, some Martha Brae villagers belong to friendly societies in Granville or Wakefield, while Martha Brae's Come Together Society includes members from Daniel Town, Rock, Granville, Zion, Hague, and the rural town of Falmouth. More extensive inter-community networking, linking villages and other urban centers, such as Montego Bay in western Jamaica, and Port Antonio and Kingston in the east of the island, typifies the annual fundraising "Anniversaries" held by these friendly societies, including the Come Together Society in Martha Brae.

Revival meetings likewise provide a basis for inter-community networking. This was especially apparent in 1983 and 1995. In the summer of

1983, there was a spate of Revival meetings involving visitors to Martha Brae. These included Revival Mothers from Sav-la-Mar in Westmoreland and Watt Town in St. Ann, a Messenger⁸ from Lime Hall in St. Ann, a Pastor from Freeman's Hall in Trelawny, and visitors from Lethe in St. James (Besson 1993). In June 1995, a Revival convention (see below) lasting one week likewise drew visitors from rural communities in western, central and eastern Jamaica to Martha Brae. These visitors came from neighboring Granville and Zion, Duanvale in Trelawny, Lime Hall in St. Ann, Tower Isle in St. Mary, and Negril on the border of Hanover and Westmoreland. Such visits are reciprocated by Revivalists from Martha Brae. Reciprocal visits for river-baptism, such as at Lethe on the Great River in St. James and at the Martha Brae River (at the edge of Martha Brae village), reflect further continuity in inter-community networking.

THE CURRENT URBAN SCENE

Chevannes has found that the transformations of Revival at the present time, especially in urban Kingston, focus on legitimizing African-Caribbean culture. By way of background it is important to note that Chevannes's fieldwork since 1992 was focused on a Revival church in West Kingston. But because of the highly articulated nature of networking, his research has embraced Revival groups in several other sections of the city such as Kintyre, Maverly, Rockfort, and Waterhouse, and in communities, especially in eastern and central Jamaica, such as Spanish Town, Bog Walk and Riversdale in St. Catherine, Yallas and Bull Bay in St. Thomas, and Watt Town in St. Ann.

First, the organization of Revival has been transformed from a loose individualized system of groupings to the establishment of churches and dioceses, which also means that many of the former Pastors are now Bishops. These changes mirror the structure and organization of some of the more mainstream religions, such as the Moravians and Pentecostals, and therefore legitimate Revival. However, despite these changes, the individuality of members in Revival has been retained. Second, these organizational changes in turn have implications for the naming of churches, which are no longer known as "bands" but by Pentecostal-type names such as "Apostolic Church." Third, there is increasing legitimacy of Revival through the performance by Pastors and Bishops of state rituals such as funerals, from the "churching" or lying in state to interment in the Dovecot and May Pen cemeteries. Fourth, preaching has become a more noticeable part of the ceremony highlighting the liturgy of the word. Fifth,

annual conventions – like synods – with similarities to those of the Pentecostalists have been instituted. By 1995 Revival in Trelawny was appropriating some of these developments, namely, the increasing use of “church” instead of “bands,” the emphasis on preaching and the significance of conventions. A sixth transformation has been the merging, in Kingston, of the two variants of Revival, Zion and Pukumina, through members of the same church being possessed by both Zion and Pukumina spirits. Indeed, Chevannes has not been able to identify any purely Pukumina group in Kingston. Likewise Besson, in Trelawny, found only Zionist groups (who defined themselves in contrast to Pukumina). In all of these transformations within organized Revival, Revivalism remains unmistakably linked to the Myal past.

Finally, there has been both continuity and change in the Revival worldview as reflected in mortuary ritual. When a death occurs, there is still a “set-up” with the family of the deceased. There is also still a Nine Night. However, rather than being held nine nights after death or on the nearest Saturday, Nine Night in urban Kingston is held the night before the funeral – like Singing Night in Martha Brae; this change being due in part to the gathering of returned migrants from overseas to participate in mortuary ritual.

Evidence of the current vitality of Revival in Kingston is that it is now attracting younger members, in contrast to the situation that Chevannes found in 1968 when adherents were mainly older persons. In addition, Revival is attracting middle-class adherents,⁹ whereas previously members were working class or unemployed. Membership continues to be predominantly female, as in the rural areas. However, in Kingston, leadership is mainly male (Pastors and Bishops), in contrast to the rural areas where women play significant leadership roles as Mothers and healers. Post-modern, post-Rasta urban Revival therefore reflects a male bias in its status system paralleling that of Rastafari. In addition to these transformations based on age, class, and gender, urban Revival is incorporating the Rastafarian colors of red, green and gold in its quest for legitimizing African-Jamaican identity.

Therefore in contrasting and complementary ways, linked with both continuity and change, Revival is central in the processes of African-Caribbean culture-building and identity-creation in both rural and urban Jamaica. The networking of Revival, the dynamics of rural-urban and overseas migration, and improved media communication and transportation open up further potential avenues of transformation between the urban and rural areas,¹⁰ and between island-based Revival and transnational migration networks.

CONCLUSION

The central argument of this article has been that any attempt to polarize the debate around Caribbean culture into an African continuity versus a creole creativity position is misplaced. A correct understanding of the processes of cultural development in the Caribbean region must take account of the wider social framework of everyday life in which the African cultural heritage has been drawn on and expressed. In addition, such cultural traditions and social contexts should be viewed from a dynamic historical perspective (Mintz & Price 1992:64).

We have used the case of Revival to explore the themes of continuity and re-creation in the process of culture-building in the Caribbean, at the core of African-America, because what first seemed to be the destiny of Revival to disappear turned out to be only a transformation in which aspects of the African heritage were being remolded in the context of modern urban life, while Revival stood fast in many rural villages. In Kingston the structure and organization of Revival have undergone changes, in which ritual and belief nevertheless remain identifiable links of continuity with the past. In rural Trelawny such links have never been threatened with disappearance and the strength of continuity can still be clearly seen in structure, organization, ritual, and belief.

However, the continuance of the Revival complex itself in rural Trelawny is part of a constantly transforming peasant culture, which is expanding from a culture of resistance to the still-persisting plantation system towards an even greater role in forging modern Jamaican identity (cf. Besson 1995a; Chevannes 1995b). For not only is Revival itself, in all its pristine forms, seen to have been and to have continued at the core of proto-peasant, post-emancipation, and contemporary peasant culture and identity, but also the wider complex of peasant culture itself, of which Revival is a central part, is undergoing transformation. For example, family land and the kinship system have become transnational institutions through international migration. In addition, family land is transforming the national legal system, for example through the 1976 Status of Children Act, towards a greater appreciation of equality independent of birth order, gender status, or Eurocentrically-defined legitimacy (Besson 1984:76, n. 9, 1987:111; Carnegie 1987:97, n. 3). The marketing system, in which women play a central role – as in family land and Revival – interrelates both with the proto-peasant past (Mintz 1989:180-224) and the global situation, as informal commercial importers commute throughout the Caribbean region and to Miami and New York. Revival, too, has become internationally dispersed through migrant networks and is part of an evolving matrix of

religious variants in the diaspora, where it is seeking to establish a recognized place within this religious complex. Chevannes has uncovered evidence of Revival networking in Toronto and Brooklyn.

Thus in conclusion, turning again to the continuity-creativity debate, it can be seen that Revival is both an African continuity and a Caribbean creation. Put another way, Revival is a living manifestation of Africa in the new context of emerging Caribbean nationhood. Therefore our aim is to show that the methodology used in this paper in relation to Revival, inspired by Mintz and Price's understanding of the dialectic of cultural change and continuity, does point the way forward for future study of the African heritage within the wider context of Caribbean culture-building.

NOTES

1. George Lisle (or Liele) was an ex-slave from Virginia and Georgia, who came to Jamaica in 1784. Moses Baker, also an American ex-slave, was baptized by Lisle in 1787. In 1788 Baker began preaching in the parish of St. James bordering the new Parish of Trelawny that had been created from eastern St. James in 1771 (Patterson 1973:210-12; Alleyne 1988:89; Besson 1995b:47).

An invention of John Wesley, the ticket-and-class-leader system involved establishing small groups of converts and giving a lay leader responsibility for their spiritual and moral well-being. In the hands of the Baptists, "the leaders, commonly called 'daddies,' were responsible for weeknight prayer meetings in class-houses on estates or in the villages, for the day-to-day spiritual oversight of class members [...] It was a common occurrence for the people to form their own classes, select their own leaders, and have them accepted by the missionary, a procedure never followed by the Wesleyans" (Stewart 1992:8).

2. Chevannes 1971; Patterson 1973:187-88, 214-15; Schuler 1980:40-41, 104-5; Alleyne 1988:99-100; Besson 1995b:58.

3. The Alps (New Birmingham) was Trelawny's first free village and, with Sligoville, St. Catherine, Jamaica's first Baptist free village, served as a model for the island's Free Village System. In the case of Martha Brae, the free village was established on the site of a former planter town, which was founded in 1762 (Besson 1987). Fieldwork in Trelawny was partly funded by the Ministry of Education, Jamaica; the Social Science Research Council (U.K.); the Carnegie Trust for the Universities of Scotland; the University of Aberdeen; and the Nuffield Foundation.

4. The squatter settlement of Zion was established and consolidated during the period 1968-95, primarily by migrants from Martha Brae, on government-owned land on Holland plantation bordering Martha Brae. The settlement's name reflects both Revival and Rastafarian themes.

5. The "sankeys" sung at such meetings derive "from the collection of *Sacred Songs and Solos* by Ira Sankey" (Chevannes 1978:9). For a detailed description of "trumping" see Chevannes 1978:8.

6. Chevannes (1978:7) in his early fieldwork found that "Meaning is attached to each colour: yellow brings on the Spirit, green is for healing, white for purity, blue for prosperity and red for the blood of Jesus and for cutting and clearing evil spirits." In Trelawny the predominant Revival colors are red and white (with blue as a subsidiary theme), but in 1995 yellow was a major theme for decorating the church during the Revival convention in Martha Brae.

7. While Johnson's study of friendly societies in the post-slavery Bahamas provides no information on slave cosmology and ritual, focusing on the "practical" reasons for such societies, he observes that: "The prompt formation of friendly societies after the abolition of slavery suggests that an organisation of that type, on a more informal basis, might have existed during the slavery era, especially in the final three decades when slaves exercised extensive control over their own lives" (1991:184-85). He further notes that "Such an organisation existed in British Guiana during slavery" (1991:196, n. 12). Karasch (1979:139) shows that slaves in urban Brazil manipulated the institution of the Catholic lay brotherhood to serve their own needs, the most significant being "as burial and mutual aid societies."

8. In rural Jamaica, the Holy Spirit and its manifestations in the Revival spirit pantheon are referred to as "Messengers" (cf. Chevannes 1978:5). However, Evangelists carrying spiritual messages may also be called "Messengers."

9. Cf. Henry (1983) on Orisha in Trinidad, Wright (1984) on Pentecostalism in Britain, and Van Dijk (1988) on Rastafari in Jamaica for similar developments.

10. For example, in Trelawny in 1995 Pastors and Bishops were increasing in significance. Several Pastors (mostly male, but one of whom is female) from beyond the community attended the convention in Martha Brae. Likewise, the village Pastor and one of the Revival Mothers (his wife) from Martha Brae are strengthening their allegiance to a recently-established male Bishop in urban Falmouth.

REFERENCES

- ALLEYNE, MERVYN C., 1988. *Roots of Jamaican Culture*. London: Pluto.
- BARRETT, LEONARDE., 1979. *The Sun and the Drum: African Roots in Jamaican Folk Tradition*. London: Heinemann.
- BECKFORD, GEORGE L., 1972. *Persistent Poverty: Underdevelopment in Plantation Economies of the Third World*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- BECKWITH, MARTHA WARREN, 1929. *Black Roadways: A Study of Jamaican Folk Life*. Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press.
- BESSON, JEAN, 1979. Symbolic Aspects of Land in the Caribbean: The Tenure and Transmission of Land Rights among Caribbean Peasantries. In Malcolm Cross & Arnaud Marks (eds.), *Peasants, Plantations and Rural Communities in the Caribbean*. Guildford: University of Surrey and Leiden: KITLV/Royal Institute of Linguistics and Anthropology, pp. 86-116.

—, 1984. Family Land and Caribbean Society: Toward an Ethnography of Afro-Caribbean Peasantries. In Elizabeth M. Thomas-Hope (ed.), *Perspectives on Caribbean Regional Identity*. Liverpool: Liverpool University Press, pp. 57-83.

—, 1987. Family Land as a Model for Martha Brae's New History: Culture-Building in an Afro-Caribbean Village. In Charles V. Carnegie (ed.), *Afro-Caribbean Villages in Historical Perspective*. Kingston: African-Caribbean Institute of Jamaica, pp. 100-32.

—, 1993. Reputation and Respectability Reconsidered: A New Perspective on Afro-Caribbean Peasant Women. In Janet H. Momsen (ed.), *Women and Change in the Caribbean*. London: James Currey, pp. 15-37.

—, 1995a. Free Villagers, Rastafarians and Modern Maroons: From Resistance to Identity. In Wim Hoogbergen (ed.), *Born Out of Resistance: On Caribbean Cultural Creativity*. Utrecht: ISOR, pp. 301-14.

—, 1995b. Religion as Resistance in Jamaican Peasant Life: The Baptist Church, Revival Worldview and Rastafari Movement. In Barry Chevannes (ed.), *Rastafari and Other African-Caribbean Worldviews*. London: Macmillan, pp. 43-76.

CARNEGIE, CHARLES V., 1987. Is Family Land an Institution? In Charles V. Carnegie (ed.), *Afro-Caribbean Villages in Historical Perspective*. Kingston: African-Caribbean Institute of Jamaica, pp. 83-99.

CHEVANNES, BARRY, 1971. Religion and Black Struggle. *Savacou* 5:27-37.

—, 1978. Revivalism: A Disappearing Religion. *Caribbean Quarterly* 24 (3&4):1-17.

—, 1990. Rastafari: Towards a New Approach. *Nieuwe West-Indische Gids* 64:127-48.

—, 1994. *Rastafari: Roots and Ideology*. Syracuse: Syracuse University Press.

—, 1995a. New Approach to Rastafari. In Barry Chevannes (ed.), *Rastafari and Other African-Caribbean Worldviews*. London: Macmillan, pp. 20-42.

—, 1995b. Revivalism and Identity. In Wim Hoogbergen (ed.), *Born Out of Resistance: On Caribbean Cultural Creativity*. Utrecht: ISOR, pp. 245-52.

DIJK, FRANK JAN VAN, 1988. The Twelve Tribes of Israel: Rasta and the Middle Class. *Nieuwe West-Indische Gids* 62:1-26.

HALL, DOUGLAS, 1989. In *Miserable Slavery: Thomas Thistlewood in Jamaica, 1750-86*. London: Macmillan.

HENRY, FRANCES, 1983. Religion and Ideology in Trinidad: The Resurgence of the Shango Religion. *Caribbean Quarterly* 28 (4):63-69.

HERSKOVITS, MELVILLE J., 1937. *Life in a Haitian Valley*. New York: Knopf.

—, 1941. *The Myth of the Negro Past*. New York: Harper.

HERSKOVITS, MELVILLE J. & FRANCES S. HERSKOVITS, 1947. *Trinidad Village*. New York: Knopf.

JOHNSON, HOWARD, 1991. Friendly Societies in the Bahamas, 1834-1910. *Slavery & Abolition* 12:183-99.

KARASCH, MARY, 1979. Commentary One on Monica Schuler, Afro-American Slave Culture. In Michael Craton (ed.), *Roots and Branches: Current Directions in Slave Studies*. Toronto: Pergamon Press, pp. 138-41.

KNIBB SIBLEY, INEZ, 1965. *The Baptists of Jamaica 1793-1965*. Kingston: Jamaica Baptist Union.

MARSHALL, WOODVILLE K., 1985. Peasant Development in the West Indies since 1838. In P.I. Gomes (ed.), *Rural Development in the Caribbean*. London: Hurst, pp. 1-14. [Orig. 1968.]

MINTZ, SIDNEY W., 1989. *Caribbean Transformations*. New York: Columbia University Press. [Orig. 1974.]

MINTZ, SIDNEY W. & RICHARD PRICE, 1976. *An Anthropological Approach to the Afro-American Past: A Caribbean Perspective*. Philadelphia: Institute for the Study of Human Issues.

—, 1992. *The Birth of African-American Culture: An Anthropological Perspective*. Boston: Beacon Press.

PAGET, HUGH, 1964. The Free Village System in Jamaica. *Caribbean Quarterly* 10 (1):38-51.

PATTERSON, H. ORLANDO, 1964. Ras Tafari: The Cult of Outcasts. *New Society* 111, November:15-17.

—, 1973. *The Sociology of Slavery*. London: Granada. [Orig. 1967.]

ROBOTHAM, DON, 1988. The Development of a Black Ethnicity in Jamaica. In Rupert Lewis & Patrick Bryan (eds.), *Garvey: His Work and Impact*. Mona: Institute of Social and Economic Research and Extra-Mural Department, University of the West Indies, pp. 23-38.

SACHELL, VERONT M., 1990. *From Plots to Plantations: Land Transactions in Jamaica, 1866-1900*. Mona: University of the West Indies.

SCHULER, MONICA, 1979. Afro-American Slave Culture. In Michael Craton (ed.), *Roots and Branches: Current Directions in Slave Studies*. Toronto: Pergamon, pp. 121-55.

—, 1980. 'Alas, Alas, Kongo': A Social History of Indentured African Immigration into Jamaica, 1841-1865. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press.

SIMPSON, GEORGE EATON, 1956. Jamaican Revivalist Cults. *Social and Economic Studies* 5:321-442.

SMITH, M.G., ROY AUGIER & REX NETTLEFORD, 1961. *Report on the Rastafari Movement in Kingston, Jamaica*. Mona: Institute of Social and Economic Research, University of the West Indies.

STEWART, ROBERT J., 1992. *Religion and Society in Post-Emancipation Jamaica*. Knoxville: The University of Tennessee Press.

THRUPP, SYLVIA L. (ed.), 1962. *Millennial Dreams in Action: Essays in Comparative Study*. The Hague: Mouton.

WRIGHT, CHRISTOPHER, 1984. Cultural Continuity and the Growth of West Indian Religion in Britain. *Religion* 14:337-56.

WRIGHT, PHILIP, 1973. Knibb, 'The Notorious': Slaves' Missionary 1803-1845. London: Sidgwick and Jackson.

JEAN BESSON

Department of Anthropology
Goldsmiths College, University of London
New Cross, London SE14 6NW, U.K.

BARRY CHEVANNES

Department of Sociology and Social Work
University of the West Indies, Mona
Kingston 7, Jamaica

KELVIN SINGH

CONFLICT AND COLLABORATION: TRADITION AND
MODERNIZING INDO-TRINIDADIAN ELITES (1917-56)

When the census of the twin-island colony of Trinidad and Tobago was taken in 1921, the system of Indian indentured labor in Trinidad, as in other parts of the British Empire, was virtually at an end. The Indian indenture-ship system had come under increasingly bitter attack from Indian nationalists, who in 1916 succeeded in having legislation passed in the Indian Parliament committing the British imperial government of India to abolish that system of labor within five years (Singh 1986:50-57). In 1917 war conditions led to the suspension of voyages of immigrant ships from India to the British Caribbean, and Indian indentured emigration was not resumed thereafter. In Trinidad only a few hundred Indians who were still fulfilling their contracts remained as bonded laborers on the plantations.

The 1921 census revealed that of a total Trinidad population of 342,523 souls, approximately 121,420 or 35 percent were natives of India or their locally-born descendants. In terms of religious persuasion, Hindus made up 82 percent of the Trinidad Indian population: Muslims 16 percent; Presbyterians 5 percent; Catholics 4 percent; Anglicans 2 percent; Parsees 0.5 percent; and Buddhists 0.3 percent (Census of Trinidad and Tobago 1923: 18, 34). The remaining Indians were numerically insignificant in terms of religious persuasion. The censuses of 1931 and 1946 would show the Indian population of the island varying between 33 and 35 percent of the total population, with Hindus remaining the numerically largest religious sector of the Indian population (approximately 77 percent), followed by Muslims (20 percent). By the time of the 1946 census, Buddhists and Parsees would virtually disappear from the classification.

The largest sector of the non-Indian population were of African ances-

try, comprising by 1946 approximately 47 percent of a total Trinidad population of 530,809. By that year the island's Indian population had risen to 35 percent of the total population; the white population was put at 2.7 percent of the total population; the Chinese were calculated to be 1 percent of the total population; and the Syrians were a mere 0.2 percent of the population (West Indian Census 1949: part G; Census of Trinidad and Tobago 1948: 9).

In the period under study, from the end of indenture in 1917 to 1956, the year that marks the beginning of a new epoch with the coming to power of Eric Williams's People's National Movement, the Indians were in the process of social emergence from the legacy of indentureship, as reflected in their predominance as agricultural laborers and the social stigma attached to their indentureship experience, and their cultural heritage, in particular their non-Christian religious background. Between 1921 and 1946 Indians comprised the most illiterate sector of the total population. In 1921 over 87 percent of the Indian sector ten years of age and over were illiterate. By 1946 this figure had declined to 51 percent, but it was still disproportionately high. With such a high level of illiteracy, it is hardly surprising that the Indian middle class, and especially its professional vanguard, was extremely small. Up to 1931, the last year in which the official censuses give a break-down of the Indian population by occupation, there were just nine Indians in the legal profession and seven in the medical profession (all males), while there were 368 males and seventy-two females in the teaching profession (mostly in Presbyterian schools). Another sixty-eight males and one female were classified as public officers; while 123 males and four females were retail merchants and shopkeepers. In contrast there were 24,638 males and 11,326 females engaged in agricultural labor, while another 6,784 males and 863 females were classified as general laborers. Indian peasant proprietors consisted of 3,303 males and 755 females (Census of Trinidad and Tobago 1933: appendix B).

The small Indian middle class that emerged from the indentureship experience had to undertake the burden of a modernizing elite within the Indian sector of the population that would help to adapt that sector to the political and cultural environment of a predominantly Western/creole colonial society and to provide it with some degree of political and social leadership. Though not disposed to completely reject their Indian cultural heritage, the emerging Indo-Trinidadian modernizing elite¹ would find itself in increasing competition with an Indo-Trinidadian traditional elite, led by Hindu and Muslim religious leaders. The traditionalists' major preoccupation was to vindicate their religions from the slurs and denigration by Christian evangelists, as well as to preserve their traditional ceremonies,

their languages, their forms of dress, their music, and their dance forms. Indeed, some members of the Hindu traditional elite would even attempt, as we shall see, to re-establish the *varna/jati* (caste) system which, in its Indian social and ritualistic forms, had already been largely, if not entirely, subverted by the capitalist relations of production of the host society and replaced by an essentially race-based system of caste relations, mediated by the emergence of class-based relations generated by the limited educational and economic achievements of Trinidadians of African, Indian, or mixed ancestry.²

Throughout the period 1917-56, both the modernizing and traditional Indo-Trinidadian elites focused almost exclusively on matters of concern to Indians. The most notable exceptions were F.E.M. Hosein, C.B. Mathura, and Adrian Cola Rienzi, who at some point in their public careers did identify with, and participate in, political movements that transcended exclusively Indian concerns. Even with them, as indeed, with their black and colored middle-class counterparts, there was always an ambivalence or duality in their political and social concerns. Eventually circumstances would conspire to propel them back into their ethnic fold.

There were, of course, quite understandable reasons for this pre-occupation with ethnic interests. In the colonial society of Trinidad, like most other Caribbean societies, race and/or ethnicity was the fundamental organizing principle adopted by the white ruling class, and the consciousness of race permeated the whole society. In the case of the Indians, their initial entry into the society as indentured laborers, despised even by the recently emancipated slaves and their immediate descendants, coupled with the Indians' equally despised "heathen" or "pagan" religious beliefs and practices in a period of fervent Christian evangelization, inevitably made all Indians acutely aware of their degraded social status. Education and conversion to Christianity did not significantly diminish the Indian consciousness of the modernizing elite. They were largely educated and converted under the auspices of the Canadian Mission, which had targeted the "heathen" sector of the population, which was almost exclusively Indian. The converts, therefore, retained within the Canadian Mission schools and churches their strong Indian identity. Unlike those converted to Christianity under the auspices of the Anglican and Catholic churches, they did not feel as culturally alienated from the Hindu and Muslim sectors of the Indian population. Indeed, some of the Canadian Mission churches were given Indian names such as "Susamachar" (Good Tidings) and "Aramalaya" (Place of Rest), while many of the hymns were rendered in Hindi. The modernizing elites were also aware that so long as the mass of the Indian population remained in a socially degraded con-

dition, their own status within the larger society would continue to be adversely affected.

Up to about 1930, the modernizing elite retained considerable influence over the leadership of the two major Indian representative organizations, the East Indian National Association (EINA) and the East Indian National Congress (EINC).³ Though both organizations contained within their leadership Hindu, Muslim, and Christian elements as well as emerging professionals, merchants, and landowners, the traditional elite generally deferred to the leadership of the Christian and Western-educated elements in these organizations. The traditional and modernizing elites were driven initially to cooperation by, among other things, the consciousness of the social stigma attached to the status of indentured laborers, which they felt was carried over to all Indians, particularly through the indiscriminate use of the designation "coolie" by officials and lay persons alike.⁴ They were also concerned with the special disabilities Indians were subject to in civil matters, especially with respect to Indian marriages performed under traditional rites, which in India received automatic recognition by the state as legitimate and legal, but in Trinidad did not receive such recognition unless subsequently registered at the Registrar General's or a Warden's office. This required the reappearance of the bride and bridegroom with relatives and witnesses at the place of registration, which the parties to the marriage often considered an embarrassment and humbug, from which Christian marriages were exempt because of the legal right of Christian priests to function as registrars of the marriages performed by them.⁵ This issue of the legal status of Indian marriages performed under traditional rights would be an on-going one for Muslims until 1932 and Hindus until 1946, involving both the modernizing and traditional elites in considerable controversy. The modernizing elite also addressed the plight of canefarmers, predominantly Indian after 1920, and street vagrants, almost exclusively Indian, in the two main cities of Port of Spain and San Fernando.⁶

When in 1922 the commission of enquiry headed by Major E.F.L. Wood visited Trinidad and Tobago to examine the feasibility of reforming the Crown Colony system of government, the first signs of fragmentation began to appear within the Indo-Trinidadian modernizing leadership. The EINA and the EINC, while retaining their separate identity, had generally collaborated before 1922 on matters affecting the Indian population in Trinidad.⁷ But on the issue of introducing the franchise into the colony, the EINA, heavily influenced by the mercantile and Presbyterian elements of San Fernando and Princes Town, opted for the retention of the Crown Colony system on the grounds that the majority of the Indo-Trinidadian population were illiterate in the English language and not sufficiently

educated to participate in politics. This, they felt, would put the Indo-Trinidadian population at an even greater political disadvantage than they were under the Crown Colony system, which had by then partially accommodated Indian interests via the nomination system. It is likely that the EINA was anticipating that an English language test would be made a condition for exercising the vote (Singh 1994:49). In contrast, the EINC adopted the strategy of supporting reform of the Crown Colony system, but on the basis of communal/proportional representation, which the British government had applied to India and Ceylon. The EINC also wanted the payment of taxes, no matter how small, to be the basis for exercising the franchise. The EINC was confident that if its proposals were accepted, Indo-Trinidadians would have no need to fear that they would be under-represented in the reformed legislature. The campaigns mounted by the two organizations to persuade the Indian middle class and the Colonial and Imperial governments to accept their positions were attended by much recrimination and marked the beginning of the eventual demise of the EINA (Singh 1994:50-52).

The visit of the Wood commission, however, inspired the formation of a new Indian middle-class organization or political club, based in Port of Spain, and led by the lawyer F.E.M. Hosein who by virtue of his Bachelor of Arts and law degrees from England enjoyed considerable prestige among the middle class, both Indian and non-Indian, during the 1920s. The new organization called itself the Young Indian Party, with Hosein as its leading light. It explained that it was not so much a party of young men as a party of young ideas, and its main interest was in carrying through a process of political education among the Indo-Trinidadian population, who were largely ignorant of politics and whose involvement in political movements therefore was minimal.⁸ With the prospect of electoral politics being introduced at the level of the central government, it felt that such a program of political education was essential. But what made the Young Indian Party really distinctive from the EINA and the EINC was its position on the issue of the franchise. It was critical of both the EINA for supporting the retention of the system of nomination and the EINC for proposing communal or proportional representation. Hosein, speaking for the party, argued that both these organizations feared that the identity and interests of the Indian population in Trinidad would suffer if not protected by nomination or by communal representation.

Against this view, Hosein contended somewhat disingenuously that "hitherto there has been no legislation which affects one community more adversely than another"; that the majority of Indians would still be "engaged in agricultural pursuits with the rest of the community"; and that

the introduction of the elective principle would not produce more class legislation than hitherto or adversely affect the agricultural interests of the colony. He therefore failed to see how the welfare of the Indians in the colony would be prejudiced. For him "communal representation would remain a phrase to conjure with. It cannot be translated into practical politics in Trinidad." As for proportional representation, Indians could not expect to have on that basis more seats in the legislature than their proportion of the population warranted; that is, one third of the seats. And if, as the advocates of communal or proportional representation seemed to believe, the non-Indian population was hostile to Indian interests, such a form of representation offered no real protection for Indian interests. Further with the passage of time, Indians would be subjected to the process of "denationalization" and "will be completely assimilated with and absorbed by the Coloured race." Therefore such a form of representation was unlikely to strengthen Indian interests in the future.⁹

The imperial government eventually settled the issue in a manner consistent with its own interests and those of its principal colonial ally, the white ruling class: a franchise restricted by property, income, and language qualifications, which, combined with the retention of a majority of nominated members in the Legislative Council, guaranteed the supremacy of imperial and local ruling class interests. The Indian middle class was upset. It felt that the Indian population was badly done by, especially in the light of their contribution to the economic development of the colony. Nevertheless, it began participating in the limited electoral politics for representation in the Legislative Council. An Indian middle-class proprietor of Couva, Sarran Teelucksingh, captured the leadership of the EINC, which was then converted into an electoral machine. Until 1930, he collaborated with the urban-based Trinidad Workingmen's Association (TWA) led by the French Creole Arthur Andrew Cipriani. Subsequently both men fell out over the divorce bill of that year. Another Indian businessman, Timothy Roodal, emerged as a collaborator with Cipriani and the TWA in the later 1920s. F.E.M. Hosein was likewise elected to the Legislature in 1928 with the support of the TWA. Krishna Deonarine, the later Adrian Cola Rienzi, became an active organizer for the TWA in the southern portion of the island. The journalist C.B. Mathura by the later 1920s had also become actively involved with the TWA (Singh 1994:135-37).

In the second half of the 1920s, therefore, it appeared that the Indian middle class was joining the mainstream of nationalist politics, as advocated by Hosein. Perhaps no one articulated better than Mathura, through the columns of the *East Indian Weekly*, the feeling of optimism and confidence that the Indian modernizing elite was beginning to experience. In

an editorial written in early January 1929, Mathura showered praise on Hosein for the political stance he had adopted at the time of the Wood commission's visit, convinced in retrospect that Hosein had "rendered a signal service to the whole Indian race in the colony." Mathura further elaborated:

In a community of this sort where all races are interdependent; in a community of this sort where the Indian people have so much to learn from the other races; in a community of this sort where the progress of one race is inextricably bound up with the progress of all the other races, a policy like that of the upholders of Crown Colony government could never have worked satisfactorily. The three Indians who are now members of the Legislative Council do not claim to represent, specially, Indians. They represent all races, all creeds, all colours. Similarly, non-Indian members of the Council indirectly represent a great number of Indians, and he would, indeed, be very bold who should affirm that the Indian people of this colony are losing their identity.¹⁰

In other words, Mathura was arguing that their participation in national politics in no way threatened the ethnic identity of Indians, though he was clearly over-optimistic, if not naive, in believing that the interests of all the races were being thus reconciled. He also evidently did not appreciate that he was implicitly repudiating Hosein's prediction that the Indians would be completely absorbed and assimilated over time by "the coloured race."

By 1929, however, it was already becoming evident that the limited electoral participation conceded by the Colonial Office to the colony made little practical difference to the working and living conditions of the mass of the non-white inhabitants, and especially the African and Indian working classes. Cipriani's reliance on the British Labour Party and peaceful agitation for constitutional reform to improve their lot was proving to be futile. The professional and mercantile leaders of the Indian middle class had thus far steadfastly avoided any embroilment in religious controversy and focused their attention on those issues that they felt degraded the whole Indian population in the colony: the malnourished and ragged Indian destitutes on the pavements and squares in Port of Spain and San Fernando, for whom they demanded that the Government provide night-shelters; and when their pleas failed to move the government, they engaged in voluntary efforts to construct the night-shelters. They continued, as well, to protest the indiscriminate use of the word "coolie" by colonial officials, including governors, and lectured them on what the word really meant and the social stigma it attached to Indians in every occupation.¹¹ The Indian middle-class leadership also protested against what appeared to be a deliberate policy of the colonial government to severely restrict the

entry of qualified Indians into the Civil Service, the Magistracy, and the government-controlled schools. Breaking with tradition, they began to advocate the cause of Indian women, stressing the need to improve their status through education and training in skills other than those of housewife and laborer.¹² They likewise became involved in the campaign to legalize traditional Indian marriages, an issue in which the traditional Indian elite had a vital interest, and, especially in the case of the Hindus, proved to be a complicating and obstructionist force, enabling the colonial government to postpone the implementation of the needed legislation until 1946 (Jha 1975).

The modernizing elite recognized the importance of adapting to the demands of a society dominated by Western social and cultural values, and they consistently praised the work of the Canadian mission schools,¹³ tending to overlook the role that the Christian missionary zeal associated with these schools played in the negative portrayal of Indian religion and philosophy – one of the major reasons why the traditional elite resented the mission schools. Like every upstart elite, and especially one engaged in combatting the negative stereotyping of their race and ancestral civilization, the Indo-Trinidadian modernizing elite, especially those based in Port of Spain, wished to imitate the social life style of the upper class, largely the white elite, something which the Portuguese and Chinese in Port of Spain were already doing. At a time when the mass of the Indian and African working classes were experiencing harrowing conditions of life, some leading members of the Indian modernizing elite remained pre-occupied with the issue of erecting a club house, which, among other things, would be provided with such facilities as tennis courts, cricket grounds, a boxing gymnasium, and a golf course.¹⁴ But even in this limited objective the modernizing elite could achieve no unity in the 1920s and 1930s. One of the fundamental sources of division was the still prevalent view that it was in San Fernando that the cream of Indo-Trinidadian society was to be found. There was an emerging Indian professional elite in Port of Spain, however, and it was their contention that, since Port of Spain was the capital of the colony, the location of the club there would be more strategic in terms of social and political influence.¹⁵ It would not be until 1945, in the context of the mass mobilization of the Indo-Trinidadian population on the issue of the language test for the exercise of the franchise, that the struggle over the location of the club would be resolved in favor of Port of Spain.

In the meantime historical circumstances were conspiring to provide the traditional elite with the opportunity to reassert their authority over the social life of the non-Christian Indians. Until the end of the 1920s, they

had found it expedient to collaborate with the modernizing elite because of the latter's Western education, their ability to articulate Indian grievances in the English language, and the higher moral status which Christianized Indians received within the larger society. With the arrival in the Caribbean of educated emissaries of the Indian nationalist movement, who were able to give public lectures vindicating Indian civilization, the traditional elite received the morale booster they were lacking before. Indeed, these Indian emissaries even heavily influenced the modernizing Indo-Trinidadian elite.

The initial and later reaction of the *East Indian Weekly* to the arrival of the Vedic missionary Mehta Jaimini in Trinidad in early 1929 gives some idea of his impact. The *East Indian Weekly* at first thought that Jaimini's arrival might have a negative influence on the process of acculturation that Indo-Trinidadians were undergoing. It argued that the latter had discarded some of their Eastern customs for Western habits and manners, and that this was not inimical to their interests; that indeed, Indians were "infinitely happier" than they would have been in India, enjoyed "the goodwill and affection" of the other races, and were "part and parcel of the harmonious whole." This rosy picture of Indian existence in the colony was quite inconsistent with its sordid reality, which was propelling thousands of Indians in this post-indentureship period to seek to return to India.¹⁶ The editor of the paper, C.B. Mathura, probably feared that the links that were being forged by middle-class Indians like himself with the Cipriani-led TWA would come under threat by an appeal to Indian ethnic solidarity. A few weeks later, however, a feature columnist writing under the pen name of Diogenes, whose style bore a marked resemblance to Mathura's, had this to say of Jaimini's visit:

To use a happy expression, Pundit Jaimini's coming has changed the whole aspect of Indian thought in this island. Whereas previously there has been some sort of losing of ground, a new spirit of renaissance or race determination or race consciousness has gone forward throughout the whole Indian community. This is a healthy sign and a happy augury.¹⁷

One of the middle-class converts to the Indian nationalist cause was Adrian Cola Rienzi, who throughout most of his political career would do what most black middle- and working-class leaders were doing in the colony, that is, alternating between a concern for the welfare of their race and participation in middle- and/or working-class politics, sometimes combining both. At the time of Jaimini's arrival, Rienzi was being marginalized within the TWA because of his pro-Soviet sympathies. After absorbing some of

Jaimini's lectures, he became an ardent convert to the Indian nationalist cause, and at the same time revealed something of the alienation and schizophrenia the Westernized Indian elite in Trinidad were suffering. He credited Jaimini with helping to erase "the last bit of inferiority complex" among local Indians. The latter were now walking "with a feeling of pardonable pride, realizing that they are the inheritors of a sublime literature, a philosophy unrivalled, and that they belong to a race whose mission in the future, as in the past, is again to be the torch-bearer of the world."¹⁸

This very resurgence of ethnic pride in ancestral India gave to the traditional Indian elite the moral authority they were previously lacking in the Eurocentric, Christian-dominated colony. They had made sporadic attempts previously to move beyond priestly rituals and to re-establish their social influence on the traditional Indian basis. An example of this was the attempt by some Brahmins in the town of Tunapuna to mediate in 1918 in a family conflict involving a lower-caste couple. At the urging of the estranged wife, Goolbie, who had eloped with another man, with whom she subsequently had a child, a *panchayat* or traditional village council was summoned to hear her request for a divorce from her husband Outar. Ramoutar in his capacity as *Maradge* (Maraj), a member of the Brahmin caste, presided over the *panchayat*. After hearing both Goolbie and Outar state their cases, the *panchayat* decided to grant Goolbie a divorce because of the treatment she suffered at the hands of Outar, her long separation from him, and her bearing a child for her lover. Outar's response to the decision, however, indicated how difficult it was to have the *panchayat*'s authority re-established among Indians in Trinidad. Outar stated he would have accepted the decision of the *panchayat* if the latter had been held in India, but in Trinidad he did not feel bound by its decision. Eventually Goolbie's case had to be heard at the Tunapuna Magistrate's court, where Goolbie was granted a divorce.¹⁹

There is no evidence that the traditional elite made any concerted effort to re-establish the *panchayat* as a judicial institution among Hindu Indians in Trinidad after this case. But with the new wave of Indian nationalism lapping the shores of the island in the late 1920s and early 1930s, the traditional elite became more assertive and confident enough to challenge the Western-oriented modernizing elite for social control over the mass of the Indian population. The first significant sign of this was the formation of Hindu and Muslim religious organizations on an island-wide basis, which posed a challenge both to the older secular/political organizations, like the EINC, and to the newer middle-class organizations which were beginning to mushroom in the two main towns. The establishment of the Anjuman Sunnat-Ul-Jamaat to represent orthodox (Sunni) Muslims and the Sanatan

Dharma Board of Control to represent orthodox (Sanatanist) Hindus in the early 1930s represented the most powerful potential challenges to the modernizing elite.²⁰ Their principal interest was in reasserting the moral validity of their respective religions against both evangelizing Christians and Hindu and Muslim reformers.

Sarran Teelucksingh, who was able to use the EINC as his political base, apparently interpreted the establishment of the Sanatan Dharma Board of Control as a potential threat to his social and political influence, and he immediately moved to form a rival Hindu organization under his control based in the town of Couva. The meeting of Hindus that he summoned at his Couva Electric Theatre in January 1932, reveals the growing assertiveness of the local Brahmins in this period against the social leadership of the Western-oriented Indo-Trinidadian leadership. The meeting reportedly included "Hindus of numerous castes," and on the stage where the leading figures sat a screen separated Brahmins from the lower castes. Teelucksingh in his opening address emphasized the need for Indians to be organized in order to secure their rights from the government. He claimed that he was fighting for the cause of the Hindus, since the Hindu religion was that of his forefathers.²¹ Upon which Teelucksingh, an Anglican with a Christian surname, Michael, was reproached by one Jairam Gosein for his conversion to Christianity and told that he must accept the Hindu religion in order to be identified with the cause of the Hindus. Asked by Teelucksingh what he meant by "accepting the Hindu religion," Gosein replied: "You must hear Katha and Bhagwat. You must come to our church. You must marry according to the rites of our religion if you want to be heart and soul with it."²² Dispute further developed as to whether the High Priest and Secretary of the projected organization should be practising pundits or simply Brahmins. The subsequent election of Teelucksingh as president of the new religious organization, which was registered as the Sanatan Dharam Association, provoked the wrath of the more orthodox rival body. The latter was affiliated to the Sanatan Dharma Pratinidhi Sabha of Lahore, India, which engaged in a prolonged campaign to discredit Teelucksingh's organization. Quite clearly what Teelucksingh was attempting to do was to capitalize on the resurgence of traditional Indian values generated by intelligent and articulate emissaries from India. But he did not have the credentials for assuming a leadership role in what was supposed to be a religious organization, which he evidently intended to use as a reinforcement for his secular political organization, the EINC. The on-going rivalry between the two leading Sanatanist organizations would extend into the early 1950s, when a political leader of Brahmin stock, Bhadase Sagan Maraj, would preside over the merger of both parties.

The rivalry of the two leading Sanatanist Hindu organizations was just one manifestation of a fissiparous tendency among Hindus, and to a less extent Muslims, during the 1930s. During this period the modernizing Hindu religious movement, the Arya Samaj, claiming to base its authority on the most ancient of Hindu religious texts, the Vedas, established a base in Trinidad. Its repudiation of caste and social segregation provoked criticism from the orthodox Sanatanist Hindus of the upper castes and led to much bitter disputation. This was matched by similar disputation between the Muslim Tackveeyatul Association and the more recently formed Anjuman Sunnat-ul-Jammat. In a period when the Indian masses in the plantation sector and in the main towns were experiencing economic hardship, religious controversy rent their traditional social leadership.²³

The divisions, however, were not confined to the religious organizations. Within the modernizing middle class, several small factions, each claiming to be interested in forging Indian unity, emerged. There was Rienzi's Indian Nationalist Party, A.C.B. Singh's East Indian League, C.W. Julumsingh's Colonial Indian Committee, and the San Fernando-based Trinidad Indian Union Club, all of which were formed in opposition to Teelucksingh's EINC, which by the early 1930s was being perceived by the younger members of the Indian middle class as having failed effectively to mobilize and organize the Indo-Trinidad population in order to improve their lot.²⁴ The Indian middle-class leadership recognized the organizational fragmentation of the Indian population into "pocket bodies" but demonstrated their incapacity in this period to do anything beyond engaging in premonitory declamation and self-reproach. Their assimilation of Western values and their limited upward mobility, coupled with their awareness that the socio-economic status of the Indian masses had not improved, made them sensitive to their threatened marginalization as Indian leaders.

Nothing demonstrates this better than the All Indian Round Table Conference held in San Fernando in August 1936. A.A. Sobrian, a close friend of the white planter elite and highly regarded in official circles, presided over the meeting. He warned that Indians were in danger of being "denationalized" and if that happened "there was nothing the West could give that would compensate for it." This was an unusual statement from a Southern-based middle-class Indian, and indicates the impact the Indian nationalist movement was having. If, however, Sobrian expressed apprehension over the process of Indian "denationalization," M. Hosein, who was elected pro-tem secretary of a projected organization, focused on "the degradation and disadvantages under which the Indian masses laboured." He recalled his own childhood experiences when he was subjected to

"despotic taskmasters" and pointed to the growing skepticism with which working-class Indians were viewing the Indian middle class as social leaders. The latter, he reproached, were Indians only so long as they were poor and helpless. Once they had become lawyers, doctors, and schoolmasters, they regarded themselves as Sahibs and did nothing to help lift their unfortunate brethren from the gutter. He also warned that no matter how much the upwardly mobile Indians distanced themselves from the Indian masses, they would still be called coolies. R.B. Ramkeesoon spoke in a similar vein of middle-class self-reproach: individual Indians like himself had done well, but not the Indian community as a whole, and that was due to the failure of "the Indian intelligentsia." Not to be outdone, T. Parasram lamented that no matter how much individual advancement he had made, in the eyes of the public he was still a coolie and concluded that "the only time I am not going to be a coolie is when the vast majority of my countrymen stopped being coolies."²⁵

Yet events were soon to overtake both the modernizing and traditional Indian elites. Like their African counterparts, the Indian working class was beginning to resort to direct mass action to draw official attention to their harrowing plight. In 1934 they undertook "hunger marches" along the main streets in the sugar plantation sectors and attempted to reach Port of Spain on foot (Basdeo 1983:103-23; Singh 1994:117-19). The following year African oil workers in the southern oil district of Fyzabad mounted a similar march, in which Tubal Uriah Butler, soon to emerge as the most feared working-class agitator, participated. Similar hunger marches were being mounted in Port of Spain by the urban unemployed. Of all the Indian middle-class leaders, only A.C. Rienzi understood that at the root of Indian working-class distress was the structure of the colonial economy, and that such a structure could not be effectively challenged without active collaboration between the African and Indian working classes. He had already begun to move in the direction of promoting Afro-Indian political collaboration when in 1936 he founded the Trinidad Citizens League. The strikes and mass working-class unrest of the following year catapulted him into a leading role in the formation and legitimization of trade unions (Singh 1994:170-77; 204-15). But while Rienzi in this critical period placed emphasis on the "class struggle," the leading elements of the East Indian National Congress, still the officially recognized political representative for Indian ethnic interests, continued to plead separately for Indian interests.²⁶ For the next six years it would be Rienzi and the ideology of working-class solidarity that would be in the ascendant, until his political opponents based in Port of Spain began to collaborate with

the followers of the incarcerated T.U. Butler to discredit him (Singh 1994:208-22).

It was the issue of the language test, which began to receive prominence after the publication of the local franchise committee's report of 1943, that once again brought together the traditional and modernizing Indian elites. The white elite, headed by Governor Bede Clifford, made a language test a condition for the exercise of the franchise. This political manoeuvring finally forced Rienzi out of the working-class movement and once again into the ranks of the defenders of Indian interests (Singh 1994:208-22). In addition, the Indian middle class, led by professionals and merchants, resolved the long-simmering rivalry between its San Fernando-based and Port of Spain-based factions as to where a representative Indian club should be located. Premises were bought in Maraval and the India Club was established there.²⁷ It became the meeting place for the Indian Central Committee which the Indian intelligentsia formed to wage the campaign against the language test. The campaign lasted for approximately six weeks, in the course of which meetings and addresses were delivered at all the main centers of Indian settlement on the island and a spate of letters sent to the press. The campaign mobilized the Indian population as never before, incorporating for the first time Indian women in a political capacity.²⁸

The Indian intelligentsia had also in the meantime brought forth a journal, *The Observer*, which analyzed the Indian situation on the island and placed heavy emphasis on the need for Indians to educate both their sons and daughters.²⁹ The connection many members of the intelligentsia had to the Indian Nationalist movement added further weight to their campaign against the language test and the Colonial Office eventually deemed it expedient to order the Governor, despite the latter's own reluctance to do so, to use his reserve powers to override a majority vote in the Legislative Council in support of the language test. Announcement of the Colonial Office's decision to abolish the language test was deliberately withheld until the eve of the centenary of the arrival of the first batch of Indian indentured workers on the island.³⁰

The decision by the modernizing Indian elite to commemorate the centenary of the first arrival of Indians on the island, overlooking the fact that their arrival was on terms which led to the very degraded status of Indians against which they had so frequently protested, is partly to be explained by the intensification of race consciousness that the mobilization over the language test engendered, the manipulative role played by the white elites, and the final stage of the independence struggle in India itself, the historical significance of which both the traditional and modernizing Indo-

Trinidadian elites were fully alive to. Yet no attempt was made to capitalize on this racial euphoria to launch an Indian-based political party. This might have been due in part to the awareness that the still surviving East Indian National Congress claimed that role. But this organization had come under increasing criticism from both the traditional and modernizing elites since the early 1930s, and when Sarran Teelucksingh relinquished its presidency in the mid-1940s, it came under the leadership, not of an Indo-Trinidadian, but of an India-born British-educated engineer with police experience, Ranjit Kumar, who had entered the island as an Indian film distributor (Kumar 1975:2-12). Kumar was able to contest successfully for a seat in the Legislative Council in 1946, but his victory was probably due less to the support provided by the EINC than to his own personality and his Indian credentials in what was predominantly an Indian rural constituency, Victoria.

The majority of the modernizing Indo-Trinidadian elite remained uninvolved politically at this time, preferring to concentrate their efforts on promoting the educational and cultural development of the mass of the Indians. Such efforts were generally the work of Western-educated Indians who established cultural clubs and literary and debating societies, though some Muslim and Hindu traditional leaders since the early 1930s were also attempting to establish their own denominational schools that would teach Hindi and Urdu as well as English.³¹ But they did not yet have the government patronage that the Christian schools enjoyed. The historic opportunity for the traditional Indian elite to make a massive incursion into the educational system had not yet arrived.

While Ranjit Kumar was presiding over what proved to be the final rites of the East Indian National Congress, the majority of the politically active Indians, some professionals like the Sinanan brothers, Mitra and Ashford, others formerly working-class Indians who had risen into the ranks of the middle class through commerce and property, did not seek membership in the East Indian National Congress or propose the formation of any new Indian political organization.³² Instead they often entered into ententes with the Butler Party, named after the charismatic and daring African working-class leader who had been twice incarcerated, but re-emerged after the war, as defiant as ever, to galvanize the working class to renewed militancy for better working and living conditions. Among the areas targeted by Butler was the sugar plantation sector, where living and working conditions continued to be quite depressing despite the massive labor unrest of the middle and later 1930s (Dalley 1947: par. 68-69). At a time when the trade union movement was fragmenting, it was Butler who was perceived by supporters and enemies alike to be the most powerful threat

to the colonial establishment. The decision by many of the politically active Indians to refrain from promoting an Indian-based party in the period 1946 to 1954 and to align themselves with the Butler Party proved to be an astute one. It gave them more flexibility and leverage in dealing with the colonial establishment than would have been possible had they joined one of the middle-class factions or remained entrenched in an ethnic political enclave.³³ Had the alliance persisted beyond the mid-1950s the course of the island's political history might have been fundamentally different from that taken after 1956, that is, the consolidation of the two largest ethnic groups into separate and competitive political blocs.

To a considerable extent the traditional Indian elite was responsible for this consolidation. It had since the early 1930s been assiduously engaged in mobilizing and organizing Hindus and Muslims in every major district and town on the island.³⁴ Their principal objective remained religious: to rescue and vindicate their Asiatic religions from the slurs of Christian evangelism. The majority of the Indians were Hindus, and the majority of the Hindus were Sanatanists. But the rivalry of their two major organizations, the Sanatan Dharma Board of Control and the Sanatan Dharam Association, still weakened the Sanatanists. It required the emergence of a caudillo-type leader, Bhadase Sagan Maraj, of Brahmin stock, but reared in the tough school of violent feuding during his boyhood in the cane-growing village of Caroni, to preside over the eventual merger of the two organizations in 1952, which henceforth operated under the name of the Sanatan Dharma Maha Sabha.³⁵

We do not know all the inner details of the confabulations and motivations that led to this feat. Suffice it to say that by 1949 Maraj had become a wealthy man through speculation in surplus material left by the departing Americans at their military bases in Trinidad. With his wealth, he was able to play the role of patron to needy Hindus and in 1950 he successfully contested the Tunapuna seat. He next entered into an entente with the incumbent Minister of Education, the Syrian-creole Roy Joseph, who authorized the construction of a number of Hindu schools in the Indian populated rural areas of Trinidad (Maraj:39-40). Maraj justified this on the morally and sociologically valid ground that the rural Indians had remained the overwhelmingly illiterate sector of the population. In this educational drive he was probably influenced by the heavy emphasis put on education by the modernizing elite; indeed, as explained further down, the first Hindu college established by the Sanatan Dharma Maha Sabha was the result in large measure of the support of Presbyterian leaders in the eastern town of Sangre Grande. Maraj concurrently entered into the field of trade unionism in the sugar plantation sector, where there was intense

rivalry for control over the sugar workers, though he did not emerge as the supreme leader of the sugar workers before 1957.³⁶

The establishment of the Sangre Grande Hindu College in 1954 is perhaps the best example of collaboration between the modernizing and the traditional Indian elites. In 1944, when the Indian nationalist movement was increasing its momentum and local Indians were accelerating the drive to educate Indians in the context of local constitutional reform and the widening of the local franchise, a group of local Presbyterian church elders of Indian ancestry, led by Kenneth Mahase, formed an organization they called the Bharat Sumati Sabha, embracing Indians of all religious denominations. It was intended initially to be a cultural association, blending both Eastern and Western cultural influences. Out of its own resources and using voluntary labor, the organization built on land donated by its secretary, James Ramdass, also a Presbyterian elder, a club house on Brierley Street, Sangre Grande. It became a major center for lectures and cultural events, including creole/Western dances. But by the early 1950s, as Bhadase Maraj was in the process of consolidating the Hindus as a religious and political force and began the drive to extend education to the rural areas, the leadership of the Bharat Sumati Sabha decided to donate its club house and the land on which it stood to the Sanatan Dharma Maha Sabha to be used for the purpose of secondary education. Thus was established the first Hindu college in the island.³⁷

The staffing and curriculum of the college reflected the continuing trans-denominational cooperation of the Indian elites. For the first five years of its existence, its principals were Christian, mostly Presbyterians. Despite its establishment in the heat of Indian nationalist sentiment, it never offered instruction in any Indian religion. Rather, its students officially studied the New Testament as part of the syllabus options for the Cambridge School-leaving certificate. Although aimed principally at serving low-income rural Indians, it never closed its doors to students of other classes and races. Culturally, many rural students were introduced for the first time to school uniforms, coerced into wearing socks with their shoes, and instructed by their Westernized teachers into Western social graces. Also a great deal of emphasis was placed on sports – cricket, table tennis, and volley-ball principally.³⁸

The college, however, suffered from inadequate financing and therefore the inability to keep good staff. This would be due partly to the determination of the Sanatan Dharma Maha Sabha and its local governing board not to convert the institution into a government-assisted secondary school. Another reason was the distance of the institution from the dense centers of Indian population in the sugar zones and therefore the difficulty

of drawing financial support from a larger popular base. Also to affect the college would be the factional squabbles that later emerged within the Sanatan Dharma Maha Sabha.³⁹ Despite these difficulties, the college gave the children of hundreds of rural Indo-Trinidadians the opportunity to achieve a secondary education within an ethnically congenial environment. Several were able to move into the higher professions. Yet, ironically, the college's significance in a period when state-sponsored mass secondary education was not yet a reality has never been officially recognized by the Sanatan Dharma Maha Sabha, and the college today is a sad relic of its pristine days.

Since the mid-1950s it has been the traditional elite that has achieved ascendancy at the mass level of Indo-Trinidadian community organization. Now the traditional Hindu and Muslim leaders project the public image of the Indian population through their cultural activities. That public image is an alien image to the rest of the population and to the increasingly urbanized Indo-Trinidadian population, in that it is a pale reflection of the culture of ancient and medieval India, village India, in an environment that is overwhelmingly Western/creole. This partly explains the alienation of increasing numbers of younger Indo-Trinidadians from the traditional Indian leadership and their attraction to new Christian evangelical movements like Pentecostalism.⁴⁰ At the political level, the projection of traditional cultural images of the Indo-Trinidadian population, combined with the stark alternative of a political party with an overwhelmingly rural Indian base, has served to deter the non-Indian population, particularly those of African and mixed ancestry, from shifting their support away from the urban, African-based People's National Movement, even when the latter seems unable to solve the problems of massive unemployment and crime on the island.⁴¹

The ousting of the modernizing Indo-Trinidadian elite from positions of cultural leadership at the mass level since the mid-1950s has, in this writer's view, been a significant factor in the institutionalization of the bi-racial political system that has been effectively exploited by the political leadership of the two ethnically based parties and by the smaller ethnic groups. The white (English, Scottish, Spanish and French creole) elite has been historically the principal collaborator with, and beneficiary of, capitalist imperialism⁴² in Trinidad, as in the other former Caribbean colonies. They have since assimilated into their class and ideological interests the other small ethnic minorities, the Portuguese, Syrians, and Chinese, and, by playing the role of ethnic neutrals or mediators in the bi-racial politics of the island, have been able to retain their positions of economic pre-eminence in it. Moreover, since the concession of formal political independence to

the island in 1962, they have been reinforced ideologically by the majority of local professional elites of all races and the Indian and African economic bourgeoisie that have arisen in the private and state corporate sectors. The projection of the alien image of the Indian population by the traditional elite has worked at the political level mostly against the interests of the Indian and African working-class population, who are made to bear the burden of seemingly perpetual sacrifice prescribed by the dominant elites and their foreign allies for the effective operation of the local economy.

This is not an argument for the complete abandonment of traditional Indian cultural forms or the assimilation of the crude aspects of the creole cultural forms. Rather, it is an argument for the creation of new Indo-Trinidadian cultural forms that can meaningfully fit into the larger cultural milieu of what we might call Atlantic civilization, while at the same time maintaining the poise, dignity, and gracefulness that are characteristic of traditional Indian cultural forms.⁴³ Only then could the cultural barriers to effective political collaboration by the working classes of the two numerically larger ethnic groups in the island be transcended without either group feeling potentially threatened by the other.⁴⁴

NOTES

1. There is still much controversy about the concept of modernization. I think, however, it will generally be agreed that it involves the following changes: the emergence of popularly elected governments; the placing of high value on the natural sciences and technological innovation; the hegemony of achievement over ascription as the principal avenue to upward social mobility; and the practical separation of the secular from the religious spheres of life. As Western Europe was the first area of the globe to experience these societal changes, modernization is often associated, though not synonymous, with Westernization.

2. This is not to suggest that race or color did not play a significant role in historically shaping the Indian caste system. Sagar (1975:2-9) cites several verses in the Hindu religious classics – the Rg Veda, the Ramayana and the Mahabharata – to argue the contrary. But it is also known that as Indian society evolved from the Vedic age, the subdivisions of the four *varnas* (the *jatis*) were increasingly related to occupation and/or tribal affiliation rather than to race or color, which became incidental. The *varnas* and *jatis*, however, remained strongly ascriptive and endogamous. In the more recently formed plantation societies of the Caribbean, the lines of race/color stratification were naturally sharper, since Europeans and their descendants, until the last three decades of this century, have been in positions of economic, political, and social dominance vis-à-vis the numerically preponderant non-European peoples.

3. Before 1922 there existed no significant differences between the EINA, founded in 1897, and the EINC, founded in 1909. The former was based in the south of Trini-

dad (Princes Town/San Fernando) and the latter in Central Trinidad (Caroni/ Couva). Both took up the same causes. Probably distance in a period of slow communications led to the formation of two separate organizations.

4. *The Mirror*, May 10, 1916.

5. For an enlightening explanation of the issue, see F.E.M. Hosein's contribution to the debate in the Trinidad and Tobago *Hansard*, April 5, 1929. The EINC raised the issue as early as October 1919 because of its relevance for Indian rights of inheritance to property, including oil-bearing lands. See *Trinidad Guardian*, October 22, 1919.

6. As early as 1916 the EINC was representing the cause of canefarmers (*The Mirror*, January 7, 1916). On Indian street vagrants, see *The Labour Leader*, November 21, 1925; Letter from K. Deonaraine; *Port of Spain Gazette*, December 8, 1924; Letter from G.D. Mahabir; and the *East Indian Weekly*, June 15, 1929.

7. The decision to collaborate while preserving their separate identities was taken at a joint meeting at Chaguanas in October 1919 (*Trinidad Guardian*, October 22, 1919).

8. *Port of Spain Gazette*, July 28, 1922.

9. *East Indian Weekly*, January 12, 1922: Letter to East Indian Committee by F.E.M. Hosein. The *East Indian Weekly* described the letter as a "historic document." Hosein, however, later revolted against both the cultural and biological assimilation of Indians. In late 1928 he advocated the formation of Indian *sabhas* (councils), urged the teaching of Hindi and Urdu, and criticized educated Indian men for marrying outside of their race. *East Indian Weekly*, October 20 and October 27, 1928; see also Ramesar 1994:147.

10. *East Indian Weekly*, January 12, 1929.

11. *East Indian Weekly*, February 9 and June 8, 1929.

12. *East Indian Weekly*, February 9 and June 8, 1929.

13. Hosein, for example, was willing to excuse those Indians who had undergone some degree of Westernization on the ground that in a colony like Trinidad "western culture and habits are a passport to the best society" (*East Indian Weekly*, November 3, 1928). For favorable comments on the work of the Canadian Presbyterian Mission, see Kirpalani 1945:53-55 and Ramesar 1994:144-45.

14. For reviews of these attempts to establish a club house, see *Port of Spain Gazette*, August 9, 1936: Letter from N.E. Ramcharan; and *Port of Spain Gazette*, May 9, 1937: Review by C.B. Mathura.

15. In 1921 Rev. C.D. Lalla, at the time the leading spokesman for the Couva-based EINC, told Governor J.R. Chancellor that Indians in Trinidad regarded San Fernando as in a special sense "the Home of the East Indian people", and he went on to say that it had produced the first Indian lawyer, the first Indian medical doctor, the first Indian minister of the gospel, the first Indian mayor, the first member of the Legislative Council "and possibly the first of everything noteworthy in the East Indian commonwealth" (*Trinidad Guardian*, May 19, 1921).

16. *East Indian Weekly*, January 5, 1929. The Sanatan Dharma Pratinidhi Sabha of

Lahore, India, writing on behalf of the Sanatan Dharma Board of Control in Trinidad, reported that when an Indian commissioner of enquiry, Kunwar Maharaj Singh, visited Trinidad (in 1925) destitute Indians lined the streets with banners on which were inscribed "We are Starving"; "We have No Place to Sleep"; and "Send Us Back to Our Country." The Pratinidhi Sabha further alleged that Rev. C.D. Lalla, who chaired a reception committee for Maharaj Singh, prevented the latter from speaking directly to the people. Public Record Office, Colonial Office 295/575/9576, Letter no. 47 dated January 9, 1933, from the Sanatan Dharma Pratinidhi Sabha of Lahore, India, to W. Christie, Deputy Secretary to the Government of India. As late as August 1936, large numbers of poor and destitute Indians were besieging the Immigration Office in Port of Spain to be allowed to return to India (*Port of Spain Gazette*, August 7, 1936).

17. *East Indian Weekly*, February 9, 1929.

18. *East Indian Weekly*, February 16, 1929.

19. *Trinidad Guardian*, April 24, 1918.

20. The Anjuman Sunnat-ul-Jamaat was established under Ordinance No. 24 of 1935. It became the major rival of the earlier Tackveeyatul Islamic Association, established under Ordinance No. 39 of 1931. The Sanatan Dharma Board of Control (SDBC) and its rival, the Sanatan Dharam Association (SDA) were both established in 1932 under Ordinances No. 19 and No. 15 respectively. Despite the numerical sequence of the ordinances, the SDBC preceded the formation of the SDA.

21. *East Indian Weekly*, January 23, 1932.

22. *East Indian Weekly*, January 23, 1932. Katha and Bhagwat are Hindu prayer-meetings usually of one day's and one week's duration respectively. The prayer-meetings are usually followed by a communal feast.

23. See, for example, the controversy over the celebration of the first day-time Hindu wedding reported in the *Trinidad Guardian*, December 13, 1933. But what generated the bitterest controversies among Hindus were the several attempts by the government to enact a Hindu marriage bill, leading one Westernized Indian to comment that "Hindu priests themselves jeopardize the moral, social and intellectual progress of the Hindu community" (*Port of Spain Gazette*, January 17, 1937: Letter from George D. Mahabir). On the disputes between Arya Samajists and Sanatanists, see Forbes 1979. The Muslims also had their controversies: for example, the challenge of the Ahmadis to the Sunnis (*Port of Spain Gazette*, February 13, 1937).

24. See for example, Rienzi's bitter attack on the EINC and its moribund counterpart, the EINA in *East Indian Weekly*, February 16, 1929. It was the growing organizational fragmentation of the Indians that prompted the Trinidad Government to establish in early 1937 an East Indian Advisory Board, whose composition led to new recrimination; see *Port of Spain Gazette*, February 6, 1937: Letter from George D. Mahabir; and *Port of Spain Gazette*, February 6, 1937: Article by C.B. Mathura.

25. All citations in this paragraph taken from *Port of Spain Gazette*, August 6, 1936.

26. *Trinidad Guardian*, July 4 and July 29, 1937. The EINC gave separate testimony before the Foster commission of enquiry into the labor unrest in Trinidad and Tobago in September 1937 (*Trinidad Guardian*, September 18, 1937).

27. Kirpalani 1945:79, 91. Also *Trinidad Guardian*, April 21, 1942.
28. *The Observer*, May, 1945.
29. *The Observer*, December, 1941.
30. PRO, CO 295/630/70097/44. Stanley to Clifford, Outward conf. tel. no. 1217, December 15, 1944. Also Clifford to Stanley, Inward Conf. Tel. no. 1426, December 9, 1944. And *The Observer*, May, 1945.
31. Ramesar 1994:142-46; Campbell 1992:60-63. As early as 1929, Pundit Gharbaran Doobay of British Guiana came to Trinidad to establish a school for the teaching of Hindi (*East Indian Weekly*, February 2, 1929). Later that year a Hindu School was founded at Marabella by Pundit Hariprasad Sharma (*East Indian Weekly*, September 21, 1929). By 1932 there was a Hindu-Muslim School at Chaguanas, with an Arya Samajist as principal; this provoked criticism from a Sanatanist (*East Indian Weekly*, February 27, 1932).
32. Up to 1939 Mitra Sinanan was associated with the EINC, but thereafter he became involved with T.U. Butler, first as his legal representative, later as his political collaborator. By 1953, however, he had begun to distance himself from Butler. Other Indians who entered into ententes with Butler in this period were Timothy Roodal, regarded as a financial patron of Butler, Ranjit Kumar, Chanka Maraj, Stephen Maharaj, and Bhadase Maraj (Cardinez 1990: 172-76; 181-82).
33. B.S. Maraj, as he was in the process of consolidating his own political following among the Hindus, made overtures to Butler for an alliance. The governing elite regarded such an alliance as "a dangerous and irresponsible combination." The proposed alliance never formally materialized, but it was in the context of that possibility that Maraj was able to extract from the colonial administration financial support for his Hindu school-building program; see Cardinez 1990:196-200.
34. Perhaps the most assiduous work was that undertaken by Pundit Dinanath Tewari, of the Sanatan Dharma Board of Control, who went to India in 1937 and enlisted the help of Dr. Parashu Ram Sharma. The latter accompanied Tewari back to Trinidad, arriving in early January 1938. He spent nearly two years organizing Hindus in Trinidad and British Guiana. By the time of his departure in late December 1939, he, Tewari and other members of the SDBC had established twenty-one district branches of the SDBC in major centers of Indian settlement in Trinidad, *Port of Spain Gazette*, January 22, 1939.
35. *Port of Spain Gazette*, June 10, 1952. Also Maraj 1991:12-13. Ranjit Kumar later accused Maraj of being behind the assassination of two opponents, a charge Maraj is alleged to have responded to by confronting Kumar with a drawn revolver (*Trinidad Guardian*, January 19, 1956).
36. Catchpole: pars. 12-39. According to Knowles (1959:84-85), "prominent Trinidadians" he had interviewed accused Maraj of "bringing Chicago-style racketeering methods to Trinidad and feared that he would succeed in joining together in Al Capone manner politics, business, trade unionism and religion."
37. *The Observer* in its May, 1944, issue gives the first notice of the formation of this organization. Details of its activities have been gathered from interviews with the following: J.N. Nath, of Brierley Street, Sangre Grande, who was the organization's

first treasurer; Dr. Anna Mahase, former principal of the St. Augustine Girls' High School, who is the daughter of the organization's first president; L.B. Mahadeo, of Guaico, Sangre Grande, who is a retired school principal, an Elder of the Presbyterian Church, and a former member of the Bharat Sumati Sabha; and Kissoon Ragoonanan of Boodooville, Sangre Grande, a Hindu gas station owner and also a former member of the organization.

38. The author was one of the first-generation students of the college, having enrolled in 1955. He received both his Cambridge School Certificate and Cambridge Higher School Certificate at this institution, and in the early 1960s was a member of its teaching staff.

39. In the 1960s a rival faction of the SDMS took the Maraj-led faction to court in a dispute over its internal elections. This resulted in the freezing for a number of years of the financial grant (for religious purposes) provided by the state to the organization, pending the settlement of the dispute.

40. Whereas in 1960 there were just 1,695 Pentecostals in the whole of Trinidad and Tobago, in 1990 it was estimated that the Pentecostals numbered 84,066 members compared to 38,740 Presbyterians in a total population of approximately 1,200,000. While there are no figures for the percentage of Indians within the Pentecostal fold, it is significant that the Pentecostals are most numerous in the regions where the Indians are most concentrated: St. George (27,354 members), Victoria (18,832), and Caroni (12,456). See Vertovec 1992 and *Annual Statistical Digest* 1966 and 1992, tables 13.

41. Middle-class professionals of African and mixed African ancestry have been frequently the most critical of Indian cultural activities. Thus in 1944 Henry Hudson-Phillips warned that Trinidad could become "a little India in the Caribbean". He was opposed to the teaching of Hindi and Urdu in schools (*Trinidad Guardian*, November 1, 1944). Both Eric Williams and C.L.R. James expressed opposition to this as well. Williams felt denominational schools made social integration more difficult. He condemned the SDMS school-building program, and denounced the teaching of Hindi (*Trinidad Guardian*, September 18, 1956). C.L.R. James, for his part, argued that "West Indians have to accept that the civilisation of the Caribbean, of Trinidad and Tobago, exists in a European framework and in particular ... a British framework. In search of our own identity we have to recognize ... that our language is that of the British people" (*Sunday Mirror*, July 10, 1966). A few years later, Dave Darbeau (now Khafra Kambon and a local Pan-Africanist ideologue) argued in a teachers' training college debate that "because of their cultural attachments, East Indians were not prepared to be assimilated into the society, and because of this political parties were organized along racial lines" (*Trinidad Guardian*, February 13, 1960).

42. One of the few instances in which I have seen this more accurate variant of the generic *imperialism* used is in the work of a former governor of Jamaica and later chairman of the 1930 commission of enquiry into the West Indian sugar industry; see Olivier 1929:14.

43. An attempt is being made to do so by local Indian musicians and other artistes, but often in a direction which has offended the sensibilities of those who wish to preserve the traditional Indian (upper-caste?) values of dignity, poise, and gracefulness. Thus the Lawa dance, which is performed as part of Hindu nuptial ceremonies, and is a sexual rite of passage dance, strictly in-house and confined to female partici-

pants and viewers, has been transferred to the public stage under the name of Chutney, with both male and female dancers engaging in what many Indians consider to be scandalous pelvic gyrations to the accompaniment of the frenzied beating of skin drums and other percussion instruments.

44. This is not to suggest that cultural barriers alone create political division between the working classes of these two numerically largest ethnic groups, who, at the time of the last censuses in 1990 each constituted approximately 42 percent of the island's total population. But the cultural factor cannot be underestimated. Perhaps no one has stated this problem more cogently than Afro-Guyanese novelist and social commentator George Lamming: "A perception of the Indian as alien and other, a problem to be contained after the departure of the imperial power, has been a major part of the feeling of West Indians of African descent, and a particularly stubborn conviction among the black 'plantation' middle classes of Trinidad and Guyana" (*Sunday Express*, September 6, 1992).

REFERENCES

- ANNUAL STATISTICAL DIGEST, 1966. Port of Spain: Central Statistical Office.
- , 1992. Port of Spain: Central Statistical Office.
- BASDEO, S., 1983. *Labour Organization and Labour Reform in Trinidad, 1919-1939*. St. Augustine, Trinidad: Institute of Social and Economic Studies, University of the West Indies.
- CAMPBELL, C., 1992. *Colony and Nation: A Short History of Education in Trinidad and Tobago*. Kingston: Ian Randle.
- CARDINEZ, T., 1990. Politics in Trinidad and Tobago. M.Phil. thesis, University of the West Indies, St. Augustine, Trinidad.
- CATCHPOLE, F.C., 1955. *Report by F.C. Catchpole*. Port of Spain: Government Printing Office.
- CENSUS OF TRINIDAD AND TOBAGO 1921, 1923. Port of Spain: Government Printer.
- , 1931, 1933. Port of Spain: Government Printer.
- , 1946, 1948. Port of Spain: Government Printer.
- DALLEY, F.W., 1947. *Trade Union Organization and Industrial Relations in Trinidad: Report by F.W. Dalley*. Port of Spain: Government Printing Office.
- FORBES, R.H., 1979. Arya Samaj as a Catalyst: The Impact of a Modern Hindu Reform Movement on the Indian Community between 1937 and 1939. Unpublished paper, East Indians in the Caribbean: A Symposium on Contemporary and Political Issues, St. Augustine, Trinidad.

JHA, J.C. , 1975. The Background of the Legalisation of Non-Indian Marriages in Trinidad and Tobago. Unpublished paper, East Indians in the Caribbean: A Symposium on Contemporary and Political Issues, St. Augustine, Trinidad.

KIRPALANI, M. *et al.* 1945. *Indian Centenary Review*. Port of Spain: The Centenary Review Committee.

KNOWLES, W.H., 1959. *Trade Union Development and Industrial Relations in the British West Indies*. Berkeley: University of California Press.

KUMAR, RANJIT, 1975. *Thoughts and Memories of Ranjit Kumar*. Port of Spain: Inprint Caribbean.

MARAJ, B. SEETAL, 1991. *Master and Servant: Bhadase Maraj*. St. Augustine: Publications Committee SDMS.

OLIVIER, SYDNEY, 1929. *White Capital and Coloured Labour*. London: Socialist Library. [Orig. 1910.]

RAMESAR, MARIANNE, 1994. *Survivors of Another Crossing: A History of East Indians in Trinidad*. St. Augustine: School of Continuing Studies, University of the West Indies .

SAGAR, SUNDAR LAL, 1975. *Hindu Culture and Caste System in India*. Delhi: Uppal Book Store.

SINGH, KELVIN, 1986. " The Abolition of Indian Indentureship and the Response of the Planter Interests in Trinidad." *Antilia* 1(3): 50-57.

—, 1994. *Race and Class Struggles in a Colonial State: Trinidad, 1919-1945*. Calgary: University of Calgary Press and Mona, Jamaica: The Press, University of the West Indies.

VERTOVEC, STEVEN, 1992. *Hindu Trinidad: Religion, Ethnicity and Socio-Economic Change*. London: Macmillan Caribbean.

WEST INDIAN CENSUS 1941, 1949. Kingston: Central Bureau of Statistics.

KELVIN SINGH
Department of History
The University of the West Indies
St. Augustine, Trinidad

R. BERLEANT-SCHILLER

THE WHITE MINORITY AND THE EMANCIPATION
PROCESS IN MONTSERRAT, 1807-32.¹

INTRODUCTION

Most recent studies of the emancipation process in the formerly British Caribbean have treated such topics as the plight and progress of free persons of color; the role of metropolitan politics and humanitarian ideologies in emancipation; the role of slaves in achieving their own legal freedom; and the links between the sugar economy, rising capitalism, and emancipation.² The white population, by contrast, and especially the governing elite, has tempted few scholars of the emancipation period since the 1960s and early 1970s, when studies of slavery and hitherto silent groups – slaves, women, free persons of color – began to flourish. The literature shows clearly that white elites in the British Caribbean during the first third of the nineteenth century have attracted but little research since Lowell Ragatz's seminal work of 1928, *The Fall of the Planter Class in the British West Indies*. Between 1928 and 1950, only two major works dealt deeply with any aspect of planter society and economy: Eric Williams's *Capitalism and Slavery* (1944) and Richard Pares's *A West India Fortune* (1950). D.J. Murray's work on colonial government (1965) and Claude Levy's on pre-emancipation Barbados (1959) returned to the 1800-34 period, and in 1968 Roger T. Anstey's critique of Williams appeared, followed by William Green's critique of Ragatz in 1973. Richard Sheridan's work is confined to the eighteenth century (1961; 1970; 1971; 1976). Otherwise, the burst of research on slavery and plantations in the Americas in the 1970s and 1980s rarely treated planter classes and white society.³ Indeed, in 1985 J.R. Ward emphasized the need for research on

the behaviors and attitudes of planter elites during the pre-emancipation period, pointing out that even though the causes of West Indian decline are no longer disputed, there is still a "main area of doubt concern[ing] the planters' performance and state of morale in conditions of adversity" (Ward 1985:18). Nothing substantial has been done exclusively on this topic since 1973, even though it is treated briefly in a few works with other emphases.⁴ The one exception is a recent conference paper by Karl Watson (1995), which possibly indicates a revival of interest in white segments during the emancipation period.

We may therefore profitably return to the study of the white population in the British Caribbean colonies during the early nineteenth century with insights gained from recent research on slavery and plantation economies. This paper examines white society on the island of Montserrat in the period between 1807, when the British slave trade was abolished, and 1832, when Montserrat was forced to pass legislation that ensured voting rights for free persons of color.⁵ This period encompasses the intermediate steps in the emancipation process that culminated in legal slave emancipation and apprenticeship of slaves in British territories from 1834 to 1838: the abolition of the slave trade, slave registration, legal recognition of free colored citizenship, and amelioration of slavery. It is also the time when global political and economic processes squeezed Montserrat and the other old British sugar colonies (but not Trinidad and British Guiana) out of the prosperity and economic centrality they had enjoyed in the eighteenth century. New cane production in the Americas and elsewhere (for example, Cuba, Trinidad, Java, Mauritius); sugar beet competition; new Spanish and Portuguese policies for colonial economic development; rising industrialization in the temperate Americas and its effect on immigration and population distribution; and the end of favored status in Britain all had their effects on the West Indies. There were also humanitarian assaults on British slavery and the ridicule and vilification of West Indian planters. Other influences on West Indian prosperity included the profitability of slavery, mounting slave resistance, and planter agricultural practices.

During this socio-economic upheaval the white segments of Montserratian society were neither homogeneous nor solidary, as they are reported to have been in the eighteenth century (Goveia 1965:204-7). This essay focuses particularly on the governing elites, and argues that salient features of their behavior and attitudes were responses to the emancipation process, which they resisted and tried to thwart, and to the divergence of the society they lived in from the ideals they envisioned. These features included increasingly tough treatment of slaves and free persons of color, illegal and criminal behavior on both institutional and individual levels,

governmental incompetence, and self-serving images of themselves that clashed with their management of the island's legal, governmental, and economic affairs as well as with the perceptions of the Colonial Office. It also argues that these responses exacerbated rather than strengthened their fragile political and economic status.

But why focus on Montserrat? The island has always been obscure and marginal to the other members of the former Leeward Islands Colony, and today is unique among them in choosing colonial rule over independent statehood. Montserrat is not typical, but neither is any other Caribbean island. All are mixes of distinctiveness and likeness. A close look at any of the Leewards during the emancipation process can refine the history of the British Caribbean, which has too often been perceived as the history of the larger and more politically central colonies of Jamaica and Barbados. This examination of Montserrat illuminates individual behavior that generalizations obscure and yields new material for regional syntheses. A new assessment of white society on Montserrat can enhance collective versions of history and society in the formerly British Caribbean and augment the growing literature on its smaller islands.

ECONOMY, DEMOGRAPHY, AND WHITE SOCIAL STRUCTURE BEFORE EMANCIPATION

The sugar economy in the British West Indies had been shrinking since at least the late 1770s, and Montserrat was part of the regional pattern (Carrington 1987). During the period from 1756 to 1780, the mean annual export of sugar from Montserrat was 2136 tons. This was not great by comparison with Antigua or St. Kitts, but encompasses Montserrat's peak years. By contrast, from 1807 to 1832 the mean annual export was 1360 tons, a drop of 36.4 percent.⁶

The pangs of this decline were intensified by grave economic mismanagement. Because Montserrat lacked a deep water harbor, freight was carried between shore and vessel by lighter. Most of it passed through either Antigua or St. Kitts, which added delay and expense. This situation did not in itself cause Montserrat's problems; rather, the absence of planning and foresight in dealing with it repeatedly sabotaged the import and circulation of necessary goods. Montserrat's improvidence was sharply exposed when a hurricane struck on September 16, 1816. The storm washed out the hillside gardens of the poor and the enslaved, destroying their staple foods – cassava, bananas, and plantains. It wrecked most other food supplies as well, but no trading vessel was due from the North

American mainland until Christmas, leaving a three-month period during which there were no "flour, bread, or provisions of any description." The storm razed houses and sugar works, but there were no stocks of material for even stopgap repairs.⁷ Montserrat's legislative council begged the Colonial Office to ease the disaster by lifting trade barriers, but its pleas had become tiresome: within the previous six months the Colonial Office had twice opened the port because – even without a hurricane – food, lumber, and plantation goods were almost gone.⁸

The hurricane taught nothing: in 1819, for example, the council claimed an "alarming" shortage of the building supplies necessary for agriculture and shipping, and complained of the "ruinous" cost of getting them from other British colonies.⁹ Critical shortages persisted into 1821, when the island had had no shingles, lumber, provisions, or mules for a year. "Cash is extremely scarce and Provisions very dear, owing to the long drought and little trade ... It is said there are but two or three barrels of Flour now on the island." Montserrat pleaded lack of ships and high freight costs, but the Colonial Office thought that "want of precaution and timely exertion" was a more likely explanation.¹⁰

In 1824 the governor of the Leeward Islands Colony described Montserrat as "impoverished and ruined," while the council reiterated its usual complaints. Sugar brought in a "mere nothing"; there was almost no commerce; and the costs of bringing goods in from Antigua in small vessels "often exceed the value of the goods."¹¹ Yet, no positive responses to the island's routine calls for help and open trade ever shook the legislature out of its lax planning or established Montserrat securely.

In the midst of their fading sugar economy, economic incompetence, and dwindling prestige, white Montserratians also saw what must have been to them a disquieting change in the island's population composition. Whites had first become a numerical minority in Montserrat early in the eighteenth century. By then the expanding plantation system had forced out white small farmers, and white servitude all but disappeared as the Atlantic slave trade supplied plantation labor (Sheridan 1974:173; Berleant-Schiller 1989). By the early nineteenth century, white Montserratians had seen within their lifetimes their own numbers shrink alarmingly, and a formerly insignificant population group loom large.

As Table 1 shows, the white population halved between 1805 and 1822 while the free colored population grew by 274 percent to outnumber it. Similar changes occurred elsewhere in the British Caribbean, but unlike the whites of Jamaica and Barbados, the white oligarchy in Montserrat stubbornly excluded free persons of color and did not recruit them as allies against the slave majority.¹²

TABLE 1. POPULATION OF MONTSERRAT 1787-1851

Year	Free White	Free Colored	Enslaved	Total
1787	1300	260	10,000	11,560
1805	1000	250	9,500	10,750
1811	444	?	6,728	?
1822	421	685	6,586	7,692
1824	398	550	6,395	7,337
1828	315	818	5,986	7,119
1834	312	827	5,026	6,165
		all free persons of color		
1851	150	6,903		7,053

Compiled from Davy 1854; Montgomery 1839:90; PRO, CO177/17, February 16, 1811; PRO, CO10/8, Montserrat Bluebook, 1824.

Tabel 2 shows that adult women outnumbered adult men. White children were few; in 1811, for example, there were only 91 children out of the 444 whites present.¹³ The white population fluctuated, but remained few in absolute numbers. Despite its minuscule size it was stratified, discordant, and divided, as it also was in Barbados (Watson 1995).

TABLE 2. WHITE POPULATION OF MONTSERRAT 1811-33

Year	White Men	White Women
1811	154	199
1822	197	224
1824	175	213
1828	139	176
1833	150	162

Compiled from Davy 1854 and PRO, CO177/17, February 16, 1811.

The top of Montserrat's white hierarchy was much the same as the top in the other Leeward Islands: an elite oligarchy made up of planters and merchants, with resident attorneys and managers just below. The power of this planter oligarchy emanated from its control of capital and labor, and from the consequent governmental authority granted it within the British colonial structure. Until the later nineteenth century Montserrat had, as did other British legislative colonies, a bicameral legislature that included an assembly elected by and made up of white male freeholders, and a council, which was the upper chamber, also white and male, appointed by the crown through the agency of the Colonial Office (Thomas 1988:24-25). The council had both judicial and legislative powers, whereas the assembly had only legislative powers. The white men who made up these chambers were both a tiny fraction of the population and minuscule in absolute

numbers (see Tables 1 and 2). Other public offices were filled by appointees from the same minuscule pool.

Montserrat also had in theory, though not in practice, a full system of British courts and legal officers, drawn from the same pool. Beyond these, there were no public institutions or public life, unless the established Anglican church, which received public funds, is counted.

Outside the oligarchic and managerial groups were white women and poor, non-elite whites, categories that overlapped. Indeed, most of the poor were women and children, which fits with the skewed sex ratio of whites (Table 2). Charles Lanion, Methodist missionary in 1822, mentioned a scattering of "poor white Families, in a most ignorant and almost barbarous State," who lived in the northeastern mountains.¹⁴ Some of the poor, mainly town-dwellers, lived on poor relief that the legislature doled out. Of nine grantees in "very great Distress" in 1815, seven were women. The legislature qualified need by moral judgment: Mrs. Perry, for example, was stricken from the poor list because of her "immoral and disgraceful conduct." Elizabeth Weldon was exempted from taxes as a "destitute orphan" receiving assistance from local benefactors.¹⁵ Poor white children were of no account. In 1811 the Council considered Francis McNemera's plan for a boarding school for poor boys. His plan gives us a peephole into the marginalized life of poor whites in the British Caribbean of the time. McNemara proposed to keep the boys "neat and clean" and to "reclaim" them from "Cursing, Swearing, Gaming, and drinking." They would be taught good behavior, Catechism, reading, figures, and English grammar. The cost for the twelve white pauper boys on the island was to be £720 currency per year, plus "extraordinary" expenses, such as castor oil and "wine of the Doctors desire." McNemera concluded, "To instruct the Ignorant and Inferior, I may say, the lost, members of Society, is a design equally well founded in Religion, Humanity, and Civil Policy." The Council tabled the plan, and did not consider it again.¹⁶ This incident illustrates Gordon Lewis's (1983:97) contention that the planter mentality "mixed up" its class and race prejudices.

Outside the categories of planter elites, attorneys and managers, women, and poor whites were a few transient Methodist missionaries and their families. They constituted a very small white group that the other segments of white society did not easily accommodate. They were English representatives of an aspiring middle-class and religious way of life who came with the stated purpose of teaching slaves to read and write in order to convert them to Christianity. Their latent functions were more complex. Certainly they tried to inculcate English, nineteenth-century, middle-class values and ways of life. Whether they helped maintain the slave system by

teaching Christian resignation, or challenged it by teaching literacy is debatable; Lewis (1983:200) argues that the missionary enterprise was "basically quietistic." Probably both functions went on at once. Methodist missionaries also acted as brokers between the slave majority, which was their main target, and the white minority. They did not proselytize whites, who presumably were already Christians, but offered them Christian education. Neither were they openly abolitionist. Thomas Hyde, for example, was horrified at the public auction of an old woman for 42 shillings (while a horse went for £60), but restrained himself from buying and freeing her because of the risk to his reputation and work.¹⁷

Since women and free persons of color were barred from public service, and the transient Methodist missionaries were also excluded, the handful of other white men on the island – planters, merchants, managers, and attorneys – filled all offices. Thus the members of the two legislative chambers along with holders of one or more key positions in the judiciary and civil establishment made up a powerful oligarchy with interlocking personnel. The inevitable holding of multiple offices by a single person and the conflicts of interest that followed had a predictable and corrosive influence on governmental and legal functioning. We have already seen the economic mismanagement that resulted. Most other British Caribbean colonies, also short of competent white men and rejecting free persons of color, were in the same pass (Ragatz 1931).

Not all white men, however, had the same opinions and interests. There were competing views on such urgent issues as the amelioration and ultimate end of slavery, the rights of free persons of color, and local as opposed to colonial control of government. On an institutional level the legislature was the main locus of strife, the crown-appointed council attempting to control the elected assembly and the assembly routinely balking the council. In 1815, for example, the issue of colonial and local control was highlighted when the council, incensed if not punctuated, accused the assembly of sneaking off to the governor in St. Kitts "to dispute deny infringe the priviledges Power and Authority" of the council, which was the "Representation of Majesty," and protested the

Feuds ... which have for a few years prevented Public Business being carried on with harmony disunited Individuals drawn down the Animadversion of our Sister Colonies and thrown the Public Funds in the greatest discredit.¹⁸

The antagonism in the legislature was structural, since it persisted through personnel changes in the assembly and even when former assemblymen became councillors.

Matters concerning slave amelioration and rights for free persons of color were especially bedeviling. One clash concerned the cost of extraditing and prosecuting Joe Blake, a white man who had fled to St. Martin after committing "one of the most atrocious murders that ever was committed on an unfortunate Slave." The responses of the two chambers expose significant oligarchic attitudes. The council was as much concerned with the "everlasting Stigma" of failing to prosecute as it was with justice, but the assembly thought that neither Montserrat's reputation nor justice for the murder of a slave warranted an expense of £19/7s.¹⁹ Another serious and ongoing wrangle concerned voting rights for free persons of color. Let us see how these two issues stoked oligarchic resistance to the emancipation process and influenced the overlapping systems of government and justice.

"MERELY CONSTITUTIONAL": RIGHTS FOR FREE PERSONS OF COLOR

Montserrat's white oligarchs not only conflated their class and color prejudices, they also confused color and citizenship status. Free persons of color, whether landed or not, suffered pervasive and daily discrimination on both institutional and individual levels. White men, for example, outraged missionary Enoch Wood by their refusal to bear the coffin of a man "tainted by colour."²⁰ People of color were not eligible for poor relief.²¹ They were fined and imprisoned without jury trials. The assembly refused to administer the oath of office to a colored appointee to the custom-house and rejected a qualified colored constable (Great Britain 1826:35). One incident especially encapsulates the oligarchy's obstruction of reform and its subversion of law and constitution.

In 1813 the governor of the Leewards directed Montserrat to hold its first assembly election in thirty-one years.²² Freeholders of color took this opportunity to exercise for the first time their constitutional right to vote. It also gave the assembly an opportunity to thwart that constitutional right. The newly-convened assembly immediately expelled Dudley Semper, a white man, because the votes of free persons of color had elected him. It justified Semper's expulsion on the grounds of "immemorial custom": it had always been the "undeniable right of the assembly to be the sole Judges of what concerns themselves" and to determine their own privileges. The right of colored freeholders to vote for assembly members was, they argued, "merely constitutional" and liable to abuse. The members argued that the election officer had violated unwritten law – the "ven-

erable Custom of the Country" – by accepting the votes of colored freeholders and had thereby sabotaged proper caste barriers, and thus dismissed the constitution as a guide to legal behavior.²³

Twenty-four white male freeholders promptly repudiated the assembly's action and supported the freeholders of color, who petitioned the Leewards governor for their rights.²⁴ Governor D'Urban lacked power to intervene in the matter, and the Colonial Secretary, Lord Bathurst, declined to. He urged D'Urban to dissolve the assembly so that the white supporters could elect their own candidates to a new assembly, and closed further discussion.²⁵ Bathurst must have known that the attorney general of the Leewards had advised against dissolution, and that his rebuff insulted Montserrat's colored freeholders and embarrassed D'Urban.²⁶ I think he wished to avoid ruffling the Montserratian oligarchy, whose cooperation he needed for the urgent amelioration legislation that loomed. Semper's expulsion expressed the gathering anxiety of the oligarchy and intensified factionalism within the legislature.

Another petition, one of many between 1813 and 1822, vividly exposes the continuing resistance to the rights of free persons of color in Montserrat. In 1820, forty-nine colored freeholders protested once again to the governor that the election officer had refused their ballots in the election of that May. They declared

That your petitioners although undistinguished from the White Inhabitants by any incapacity, either actually to to enjoy or duly appreciate the Liberties and immunities which are granted by the British Constitution to its meanest Subjects, are yet deprived of exercising in this Island the Right of Elective Franchise.

They pointed out that Antigua did not bar colored freeholders from voting, but that the Montserrat legislature treated them as a

class of beings entirely distinct, (though Sprung, from the white Inhabitants) whose advancement in Wealth and respectability it was advisable to retard, and whose enjoyment of Political privileges, it was their bounden duty and Vital Interest to Prevent.²⁷

The assembly that threw out Dudley Semper in 1813 rebelled against the violation of custom. By 1820, their outrage had become an unshakable political position founded on a change that surely seemed to them ominous: in 1798 only two freeholders of color had existed on the island. Since then their numbers had grown and they had become educated, skilled contributors to the welfare of the island, maintaining a crack militia

corps and successfully repulsing French privateers.²⁸ The assembly formally conceded the voting rights of freeholders of color only in 1822. In fact, the election officers continued unhindered to reject their ballots (Wesley 1934:149).

Montserrat continued to thwart the rights of free persons of color after most other British Caribbean colonies had begun to yield. In Jamaica free persons of color had gained the rights to testify against and inherit from whites in 1796, and full legal equality by 1830 (Sio 1976:8). By 1832 all British Caribbean colonies except Montserrat and St. Kitts had purged their legal codes of discrimination. The Montserrat legislators passed a citizenship bill in May 1832 but tied it to a new import duty to offset the tax losses and pauper payments that they claimed would follow, and the bill was therefore rejected in the Colonial Office. Six months later the legislature finally gave in (Wesley 1934:160-66). Within two years, at least four out of twelve elected assembly members were free men of color, an event that to white Montserratians would have seemed to justify their resistance.²⁹

THE JUSTICE SYSTEM AND OLIGARCHIC BACKLASH

During the period from 1807 to emancipation in 1834, the interlocking and overlapping governmental and legal systems in Montserrat grew increasingly inept and corrupt. The report of a commission sent by the Colonial Office in 1822 to examine justice in the colonies bears this out. The report, written in 1823 and published in 1826, summarizes the West Indian justice systems as inconsistent, unpredictable, discriminatory toward slaves and free persons of color, and in general "rash, crude, and discordant" (Great Britain 1826:32).

Montserrat was no exception. The commissioners who visited the island investigated the entire legislative, court, and justice system; they took testimony from whites, free persons of color, and, as far as they could, slaves. The evidence exposes the chronic disorder and corruption in Montserratian institutions, as well as the oligarchy's judicial tactics for resisting change, and deepens our understanding of local society and the white oligarchy in the years before emancipation.

We have already seen how the assembly fought the voting rights of free persons of color. Their judicial participation was also abridged. In 1811, for example, a jury of five had included a free person of color, and a woman too.³⁰ But by 1828 the courts barred both colored and female freeholders, and, in defiance of law, summoned white men to duty whether they were

freeholders or not.³¹ The effects of this discrimination were ruinous.

Without colored freeholders it was impossible to assemble able and disinterested juries. The court of King's Bench and Common Pleas, which heard civil suits and acted as superior court of common law, could not make "dispassionate" judgments. Peter Wheatland, who was coroner, assembly member, and leader of white support for the rights of free persons of color, testified that he often attended trial there "without meeting a competent jury" (Great Britain 1826:35).

Illegal barriers against the service of free persons of color affected the bench as well as the juries. Suitable, trained white candidates were almost non-existent. The justices were "men of fortune," untrained in law, who served part-time. Their appointment was haphazard and expedient. For example, the single person on the island in 1823 who was qualified by training to be a justice was the resident Crown Officer (the legal representative of Britain in the colonies). The legislature did not appoint him to the bench, even though it was usual to do so in the other British Caribbean colonies. This dereliction was surely the intentional weighting of the system in favor of oligarchic interests (Great Britain 1826:34).

The Court of Error was also undermined to benefit the oligarchy. As the appeals court, it potentially challenged the council's judicial authority. The council therefore failed to appropriate funds for its meeting. The legislature also set high fees which deterred people from using the courts (Great Britain 1826:35).

Thus a tiny coterie of white oligarchs made up the overlapping civil and legal establishments. Their resistance to citizenship rights for free persons of color was a first line of defence against parliamentary pressure toward the amelioration of slavery. They bolstered their own authority by hobbling the judicial system and, in effect, blocking the rights of all Montserrians to fair trial and judicial relief.

SLAVES' RIGHTS AND THE WHITE OLIGARCHY

Parliamentary action toward the amelioration of slavery in the British colonies began with the slave registration requirements of 1815. In 1823 Parliament imposed other measures, but only in the Crown Colonies, where there were no legislatures. These included limits on physical punishment, abolition of Sunday markets, religious education, recognition of slave marriage, and limited legal rights for slaves, such as the acceptance of slave testimony in court (Rice 1975:251-54). The legislative colonies, which made their own laws, were pressured to pass similar legislation. Many

balked, but Montserrat was the last of the Caribbean colonies to recognize the rights of slaves even though, as C. Duncan Rice (1975:252) points out, quiet acceptance of amelioration might well have staved off emancipation for many years.

Nevertheless, Montserratians obsessively mulled amelioration issues, which could not be separated from the question of emancipation. In 1826 missionary Thomas Hyde wrote that amelioration and the "aniliation" of slavery were an "endless theme" discussed behind the closed doors of the council and assembly and out among individual whites and free persons of color. Most slaveholders, he wrote, were afraid of losing slaves without compensation and prophesied "immediate destruction" if slaves were to get wind of any possible emancipation.³² Resistance to amelioration of slavery may account for the increased severity of sentences that the council meted to slaves around 1823, even though slaves were at that time supposedly entitled to jury trials rather than council hearings. Early in the century the council had not been especially harsh toward slaves committing first offenses.³³

By 1823 the council was treating slave matters more harshly. It sentenced one slave to death for stealing a goat, although the sentence was commuted to hard labor in the street gang. Another was barred from suing or prosecuting the white woman who had cheated him of his freedom by accepting his £200 manumission payment while knowing that her own creditors would never allow his manumission (Great Britain 1826:36-37). The courts also hardened against slaves, just as they had hardened against free persons of color ten years earlier. The legislature bolstered judicial resistance by defying Colonial Office mandates and quashing acts to ensure slaves' judicial rights.³⁴ Court discrimination against slaves continued: free persons accused by slaves did not need to take oath; slaves could not make depositions and could not be bailed; and slaves' houses could be searched without warrant, although an owner or overseer was supposed to be present (Great Britain 1826:36-38).

The courts did not even take slave deaths seriously. Peter Wheatland told the justice commission that inquests were almost never held, no matter how suspect the death. In ten years there had been but one, and the defendant was acquitted. The commissioners saw that everywhere in the West Indies "the exclusion of slave testimony" was a chief cause of injustice.³⁵ Later in the year the legislature did pass a bill, presented by Richard Dyett, admitting slave testimony under oath and conceding jury trials to slaves accused of criminal offenses.³⁶

But once more, just as in the case of voting rights for free persons of color, legal rights were not achieved in practice, since juries were partial

and illegally constituted. In 1828 three slave defendants, backed by white supporters, challenged the court on the grounds that they could not get a fair trial because the jury members were not qualified freeholders. The court adjourned in consternation. It summoned every white man on the island in an attempt to assemble a jury, but Montserrat was breaking its own laws by calling white men without property to serve while snubbing colored freeholders.³⁷

Not all white persons shared the dominant oligarchic attitudes and behaviors concerning amelioration. The behavior of a few whites such as Peter Wheatland, Richard Dyett, and those who backed rights for free persons of color shows that the white segment was not monolithic, and that individual whites varied in their treatment of and attitudes toward slaves. However, the personal behavior of most whites reflected the institutionalized illegality and resistance that prevailed on a societal level. The letters and diaries of Methodist missionaries in Montserrat expose some of these behaviors and attitudes.

In 1822 Lanion wrote of "this ignorant and unstable people"; his successor Thomas Hyde called Montserrat a land of "darkness."³⁸ The barbarous punishments and the physical and religious neglect that slaves suffered appalled both of them. They abominated the sexual exploitation of women of color, both bond and free. One old slave woman told Hyde, "*bad* knocks all the *good* out of me heart on this Estate." One manumitted woman explained why she could not join his Methodist society:

I live with a man. A white man ... how can I help it? He bought me, and ... when white man free negroe woman he only free we for *that purpose*. Massa they make us wosse than beasts when them do so and if I was to leave him the world would say me ungrateful.³⁹

Hyde was grieved and angered to find on his return from a three weeks' absence that two or three girls in his congregation had "fallen" to the "acursed lusts and cunning of the Whites," "heathen" who exercised a "filthy abominable influence." The children born of such "unlawful intercourse," he reports, "are in dirt and rags and are often driven to and fro" between their parents for food, and given nothing by either. One manager's will, he recounts, directed that his family by a slave woman be freed. The executor ignored the will, used the money as he pleased, and kept the children as his own slaves. Hyde contrasted this behavior to that of many slave husbands, who took on extra work to secure a wife's freedom.⁴⁰

Hyde had little hope that whipping could be checked, even if outlawed. Some slaveholders had already replaced the outlawed whip and the driv-

er's lash by solitary confinement, but others talked of replacing them by cat and tamarind switch. "It will take great care to prevent the introduction of these things," Hyde cautioned, and pointed to their sadistic-erotic attraction: many young men of the estates "would sooner see a woman flogged than go out to a good dinner."⁴¹ It came about as he feared. In 1828 William Darliss Furlonge, a member of the council, beat his slave Patrick Ryan almost to death with a tamarind switch as punishment for a missing wooden board. The switch was said to sound more gentle than the cat, but to cut as cruelly.⁴²

The Colonial Office also pressed mandatory religious instruction for slaves. Governor D'Urban told Bathurst that Montserrat, in its "ruined" state, could hardly meet the expenses of government, much less the burden of clergymen and teachers for 6,000 slaves. Hyde, who had met with council and assembly to discuss the mandate, was skeptical: "It has appeared quite evident to me that they wish to make the matter as deterring to Government as possible."⁴³ A report of 1829 confirms Hyde's judgment about Montserrat's indifference to schooling (Incorporated Society 1828:33).

On a societal level, Montserrat refused to educate slaves at public expense. Individually, slaveholders responded diversely when Methodist missionaries attempted to provide education at Methodist expense. Some forbade, some cooperated, and some merely allowed missionaries to teach their slaves. Methodist teachers (and there were no others) insisted on basic literacy so that potential converts could read scripture. They depended on slaveholders' good will in making space and time available for education. In 1821 Lanion wrote to all Montserrat planters and managers asking permission to teach the slaves on their estates. Few replied. John Queely Fagan, attorney, refused politely on behalf of the owners of seven plantations. Robert Dobridge, proprietor and council member, agreed half-heartedly but would not release time. Francis Willock considered providing both time and chapels for religious education on his plantations, and by 1824 his manager had actually built a school on Willock's largest estate, and planned for schools on three others.⁴⁴

Only in Plymouth town, where slaves could attend by their own decision on their own free time and where masters were not asked to provide facilities, did Lanion and Hyde have any success with their intermittent classes and Sunday schools for adults and children. There was some progress: by 1826 the two missionaries had established a regular day school in Plymouth. Twenty to thirty children attended twice a week – black, white, colored, bond, and free – without "disapprobation" expressed anywhere. By 1830 the Plymouth school gained publicly funded teachers and a rented building for ninety-four boys and girls, with books supplied by the

Society for Promoting Christian Knowledge.⁴⁵ Thus some members of the Montserrat white elite began to bend individually if education could be provided without trouble or expense to themselves, but on a societal level continued to thwart universal education long after the end of slavery in 1834 (Berleant-Schiller 1995).

White slaveholders also held opposing positions on slave marriage. Missionary John Maddock married a slave couple in 1820. One proprietor (fortunately not the groom's owner) told the groom he deserved "nine and thirty" for daring to marry, and talked of throwing Maddock off the island. Other "respectable" whites, however, were "disgusted" by him.⁴⁶

Meanwhile, the Montserrat legislature continued to block amelioration legislation. For two years after mandate it stalled the act against transporting slaves between British colonies, passing it only in 1825.⁴⁷ It stopped Sunday markets in 1826 only when Richard Dyett, council member, discovered an applicable act of 1786. Then it subverted the intent of the mandate by ignoring its requirements for religious education and a different market day.⁴⁸ The third amelioration measure that Bathurst had demanded was the admission of slave testimony, which Dyett succeeded in pushing through in 1823.⁴⁹ As late as 1834, however, justice for slaves was careless and haphazard.⁵⁰

CORRUPTION AND CRIMINALITY IN THE OLIGARCHY

As we have seen, all civil and judicial offices were filled by the tiny number of white men on the island, many of whom held multiple and unrelated jobs, with and without salaries. Peter Wheatland was both customs waiter and coroner in 1822, in addition to being an elected assembly member. Henry Dyett was for many years King's Counsel (the public prosecutor), Clerk of the Assembly (the keeper of minutes and journals), and Powder Officer (the supervisor of the magazine). These two were, at least, able and honest in a system that countenanced conflict of interest and incompetence. Others were corrupt or inept or both. James Masters held eight offices in 1821, ranging from Captain Gunner (harbormaster) to Registrar of Slaves, and collected the salaries while passing off the work to hired deputies.⁵¹ Ragatz (1931:15-16) blamed absentee landlordism for poor governance and multiple office-holding in the Leewards, arguing that competent whites departed. A new perspective provides another explanation: a significant population of educated free people of color was excluded; further, as Douglas Hall (1964) argued, the problem was systemic.

Also striking, and inseparable from institutionalized squabbling in the

legislature and stymied legislation for social change, is the corrupt and criminal behavior of individual legislators. Four out of eight councillors – the highest officers on the island – were charged with, and had probably committed, misconduct, serious crimes, or both between 1816 and 1818: Bernard Gordon, Henry Hamilton, George Herbert, and Dudley Semper.

The Colonial Office had appointed Semper in 1814 to the council. He was also island treasurer and sat on the Bench of Justices. But on November 29, 1816 the council summoned him to answer charges of fraud, suborning, and violation of the Navigation Acts. He was accused of securing false papers for his brig, *Marquis of Wellington*, in Martinique in March 1816. He dodged a customs seizure in Montserrat on December 7 and made for St. Thomas, where he sold both vessel and cargo. The supercargo, called before the chief justice of the court of King's Bench and Common Pleas on December 13, denied that Semper had ordered him to get false papers or to smuggle anything from Martinique. The council agreed that the charge of fraud lacked merit, but found Semper guilty of suborning the supercargo to forgery and perjury. It also found him guilty of violating the Navigation Acts in his office as treasurer of the island.⁵²

Governor Ramsay suspended Semper from all his offices on December 20, 1816. The Prince Regent reinstated him to the council the following May, even though his innocence had not been established. Four councillors immediately resigned in protest: Henry Hamilton, Thomas Hill, William Shiell, and Bernard Gordon, members respectively of twenty-five, fourteen, nine, and eight years' standing. These were the same councillors who had allegedly helped organize Semper's expulsion from the assembly in 1813.⁵³ Governor Ramsay persuaded them to withdraw their resignations so that they could facilitate the vital Slave Registry bill, which was passed on July 10, 1817. Ramsay did not believe that Semper was innocent, but the Colonial Office stonewalled him, just as it had done to D'Urban when he sought justice for colored freeholders.⁵⁴ Once again, the priority Bathurst placed on legislation that would forward the emancipation process overrode malfeasance in Montserrat.

Gordon and Hamilton could hardly claim the moral high ground. Michael Semper, Dudley's brother, pointed out that Henry Hamilton had recently been charged with the murder of a free man of color. The coroner's inquest and the grand jury had found against him, but he had been "acquitted in this world" by the petit jury. Bernard Gordon had been found guilty of beating "a poor white inhabitant and I believe a freeholder of the Island," and fined 50 guineas in currency. Michael Semper implied that Ramsay colluded in smearing Dudley Semper and charged that the four councillors had plotted the rejection of colored votes "in order that

they may pack the assemblys as they please.”⁵⁵ That charge is plausible, given the assembly’s routine obstructionism. By March 1818 Bathurst had not only reaffirmed Dudley Semper’s seat on the council, but restored him to his other offices as well.⁵⁶

Despite Dudley Semper’s high standing with the Colonial Office, neither he nor his brother, both of whom were merchants, come across as savory or principled persons. They had a reputation for bill-buying and lending at high interests, and appear in many contexts as sharp operators motivated by political or financial expedience.⁵⁷ Dudley’s politics were limber, too. He did not sign the whites’ petition in support of the colored votes that had elected him, slipping smoothly from under the assembly’s denunciation of his “dangerous ideas of Equalization.”⁵⁸

Dudley Semper was also meddlesome and contradictory. In 1823 he threatened to spread damaging tales at the Colonial Office about Methodist missionary work among slaves, even though he had helped buy a horse to facilitate the missionary’s work.⁵⁹ He was certainly the unnamed assistant justice who had “reprobated” Peter Wheatland for taking slave testimony, since the bill to allow slave testimony had been introduced by the only other assistant justice at the time, Richard Dyett. Nonetheless, in 1826 the Colonial Office appointed Dudley Semper to be Chief Justice of Montserrat, perhaps because no other white man of intelligence and energy was available.⁶⁰

George Herbert, council president throughout the Semper affairs, undoubtedly transgressed in 1818, probably without criminal intent. Herbert owned a slave named Tom Dexter who, he claimed, repeatedly robbed Herbert and tried to poison him. Herbert forbore from prosecuting Dexter “from motives of humanity,” but finally hustled him onto a vessel and told the captain to take him away. When the captain found he could not legally transport a slave he brought Dexter back to Herbert, whom the council then charged with slave trading. Herbert insisted that he was only attempting to save Dexter’s life, but he was bailed and suspended from his offices. He went to England to clear himself, and half a year later was acquitted and reinstated.⁶¹ He apparently had not grasped that deporting Dexter amounted to illegal slave-trading, but witlessness does not excuse the highest official in the legislature. Interestingly, Dudley Semper’s name is missing from the list of the councillors who pursued Herbert’s prosecution. Perhaps he foresaw conflict without political gain.

These cases add up to a great deal of corruption in the governing elite: four out of eight councillors accused, and probably guilty, of serious offenses, including smuggling, suborning perjury and forgery, assault, slave-

trading, and murder. Each offense both reflected and intensified the rifts in the governing elite, small as it was and beleaguered as it felt itself.

THE OLIGARCHS REVEAL THEMSELVES

Neither politics nor ideology fully explains the self-defeating behavior of the white elites, as the case of Peter Wheatland suggests. Although Wheatland, in contrast to the Sempers and Hamiltons of the island, defended the voting rights of free persons of color, tried to seek (belated) justice for a slave who died of starvation, and openly described to the justice commissioners the shameful state of the courts, missionary Enoch Wood said in 1827, "How this man hates everything good." Perhaps by "good" the missionary meant "Methodist," for Wheatland provoked the remark by calling his slaves to fiddle, sing, play the tambourine, and beat a kettle in his yard while his next-door neighbor, Richard Dyett, entertained Wood at a soiree of hymn-singing. It is hard to know Wheatland's motive. He had contributed money to Methodist efforts toward slave education, and had sided with Dyett in support of admitting slave testimony in court. He also led a pack of sports to fire off old cannons at midnight just for fun.⁶² He was at once a slaveholder and a proponent of slaves' rights, and clearly a complicated person. Others are more transparent.

Both Henry Hamilton and Joseph Herbert have left evidence about how white oligarchs perceived themselves and interpreted their own predicament. Both were, or had been, planters and both were long-time members of the council. Indeed, Herbert had been council president for thirty years, except for his half-year's suspension over the Dexter affair in 1818-19. Both had been acquitted of grave offenses – murder and slave-exporting – that they in all likelihood committed. The fortunes of both were shriveling.

Joseph Herbert, who had been acquitted of slave trading, wrote to the colonial secretary in 1822. He had gone to Demerara when his Montserrat plantation no longer supported him, but was back again in a year and a half, administering the island in 1822 at no salary as before. Hearing of the need for officers to protect the interests of slaves, he presented himself for the job, explaining that he does not "own a slave or an acre of land." Happily for the slaves, Herbert was denied the office.⁶³ Hamilton, acquitted of murder, also wrote to the colonial secretary. By 1824 his property had sunk in value while his debts mounted. Nevertheless, he thought well of himself and considered himself an appropriate spokesman on the unsettling matter of slave emancipation. In this self-appointed capacity he wrote to Lord Bathurst offering suggestions for dealing with rumors of eman-

cipation among the slaves. "Humanity" and "security," he wrote, demand that slaves be disabused of any notion that emancipation could be on the way. He proposed a "conciliatory measure" that would show the slaves – "sensible creole people" – that coercion was still necessary, but that good behavior might earn indulgence. Hamilton suggested that slaves could become "His Majesty's Plantation labourers," or perhaps indentured servants. He conceded that their comfort should be improved, and suggested a wage in proportion to the crop. Finally, he proposed, the British government could purchase the slaves to form a fund for the aid of planters.

Resident planters were, he argued further, the people best suited to solve West Indian problems precisely because of "their present unparalleled distress," the consequence of high sugar taxes and London merchants who mortgaged and then devalued their property. They "feel their privation considerably augmented by not having the means of giving their slaves that liberal allowance of clothing they were in the habit of doing in their day of prosperity."

Hamilton offered himself as an example of West Indian hardship. His eight children had no provision. He could sell his property for only one third of its value. His own hardship was linked with that of his London merchant, Henry Dyett, who was himself without funds. "I trust that through your Interest, with the Treasury, I may be relieved from the pressure of my London merchant." Hamilton detailed a plan for the Colonial Office to rescue himself and Dyett. He also described how he lost both his paid positions – judge of Admiralty Court and Searcher of Customs. Since both were not to be held by same person, he resigned Searcher only to see the Admiralty Court withdrawn from the island. He closed by asking that he be remembered if any position should arise.⁶⁴

Even though he was transparently motivated by class and self-interest, and not very astute, Hamilton probably saw this letter as balanced and thoughtful. At the root of his self-serving and disingenuous proposals were the realities of a declining sugar economy, fear of slave revolt, and the dread of emancipation that obsessed all white Montserratians.⁶⁵ He is an excellent illustration of Lewis's (1983:119) contention that the West Indian planter "lived in a world of self-sustaining myth" that included "the myth of African degeneracy, the myth of Negro happiness, the myth of King Sugar."

CONCLUSION

It is hard not to conclude that the white oligarchy of Montserrat participated in its own decline, even while it felt itself imposed upon and victimized by the emancipation process. It is not plausible to argue that plantocratic life made other behavior inconceivable. Within the meager white minority diverse opinions and alternative models for behavior were available: the twenty-four supporters of colored freeholder voting rights; the judge, Richard Dyett, who pressed for the admission of slave testimony in court; Peter Wheatland, a slaveholder who supported legal rights for slaves; the Methodist missionaries working for slaves' rights to literacy, religious opportunity, and marriage; the nameless group of whites who backed accused slaves in their challenge to illegal jury selection. But the influence of such dissenters on institutional decisions and outcomes was minimal. Most members of the legal and legislative oligarchy continued to compound their mismanagement of the island by both institutional and individual resistance to the emancipation process, and as we saw in the period between 1810 and 1827, hardened their resistance to legal and judicial changes toward amelioration, voting rights, and emancipation.

Threatened by the emancipation process, the oligarchy subverted law and constitution to achieve immediate aims. The consequent wrangling, ineptitude, improvidence, misconduct and corruption weakened both the operation of government and its claims to credibility with the Colonial Office. Contempt for law and constitution are not extraordinary, but the behavior of Montserrat's white oligarchy was singularly self-defeating. In July 1834, a month before every British slave was legally freed, the legislature neglected proper procedure and undercut its own emancipation act, even though, as one Colonial official remarked, "all the inconvenience will be suffered only by the inhabitants of Montserrat."⁶⁶

NOTES

1. The University of Connecticut Research Foundation supported the research for this paper; Betsy Hoagg, librarian at the University of Connecticut, rendered essential inter-library loan services; Jay Mandle made useful comments. I thank them all.
2. See for example Sheridan 1961; Aufhauser 1974; Handler 1974; Anstey 1975; Drescher 1977; Ward 1978, 1985; Heuman 1981; Cox 1984; Beckles 1985; Bush 1985; Craton 1985; Solow & Engerman 1987.
3. A summary international conference on slavery in New World plantation societies held in 1976 included only three papers that even touched on white planter classes – in Brazil, Cuba, and St. Kitts (Fernandes 1976; Frucht 1976; Knight 1976).

4. For example, Levy 1980:16-27; Brereton 1981:52-69; Thomas 1988:24-33; Ward 1988:43-60; Olwig 1993:73-89.
5. The main sources are the Methodist Missionary Society (MSS) papers held at London University, School of Oriental and African Studies; Correspondence and Sessional Papers held in the Public Record Office (PRO), Colonial Office (CO), Kew, London; and *The Commissioners' Report on Justice*, which reports the work of a study commission sent to the West Indies in 1822 and published in 1826. The missionary papers relating to Montserrat have not been used in any publication yet.
6. Assembled from Deerr 1941, I:196-97. The years between the two periods are incompletely documented.
7. PRO, CO7/2, Montserrat Council to Captain General of the Leeward Islands, October 2, 1816. The vessel was Dudley Semper's notorious brig; see below.
8. PRO, CO7/3, Ramsay to Bathurst, February 28, 1817; PRO, CO177/1, Sessional Papers, Enclosure 9, Rawlins to Herbert, March 22 and July 4, 1816.
9. PRO, CO7/6, Council to Bathurst, October 22, 1819.
10. PRO, CO7/7, Hill to D'Urban, January 6, 1821; Herbert to D'Urban, July 18, 1821; D'Urban to Herbert, July 21, 1821; MMS, Box 117/2A no. 61, Lanion to MMS, October 2, 1821.
11. PRO, CO7/10, Herbert to Athill, July 24, 1824; D'Urban to Bathurst, March 12, 1824; PRO, CO393/1, Horton to Lowe, May 21, 1824; Council to Governor, October 2, 1816, PRO, CO7/2.
12. Hall 1972; Handler & Sio 1972; Cox 1984:10-32; Fergus 1994:88.
13. PRO, CO 177/17, Sessional Papers, February 16, 1811.
14. One of these rural households consisted of an aged woman and her daughter (herself not so young, since the woman's other daughter had grown children), and another of "two maiden ladies." MMS Box 118 no. 7, Charles Lanion to MMS, January 18, 1822; Box 118 no. 30, March 29, 1822. Lanion's name may possibly be Janion; both his signature and the hand list are ambiguous.
15. PRO, CO 277/18, Sessional Papers, January 7, 1815; CO177/22, Sessional Papers, July 20, 1833.
16. PRO, CO177/17, Sessional Papers, December 7, 1811.
17. MMS, Box 122 no. 78, Diary of Thomas Hyde, May 22, 1825.
18. PRO, CO177/18, Sessional Papers, February 11, 1815.
19. PRO, CO177/18, Sessional Papers, February 4 and February 11, 1815.
20. MMS, Box 126 no. 33, Enoch Wood's Journal, March 20, 1828.
21. MMS, Box 119 no. 97, Hyde to MMS, July 4, 1823.
22. PRO, CO 177/18, Sessional Papers, Proclamation of April 3, 1813.
23. PRO, CO177/18, Sessional Papers, May 22, 1813. Dismissing the constitution was within the English tradition of common law jurisprudence carried to the American colonies before emancipation. See Cover 1975:17-18; 140.

24. PRO, CO7/7, White Freeholders to D'Urban, June 21, 1820.
25. PRO, CO393/1, Bathurst to D'Urban, February 10 and March 10, 1822.
26. The attorney general in Antigua had already advised D'Urban against dissolution, PRO, CO7/7, Horsford to D'Urban, August 24, 1820.
27. PRO, CO7/7, Petition of Free Coloureds to D'Urban, June 21, 1820.
28. PRO, CO7/7, Petitioners to D'Urban, June 1820.
29. PRO, CO178/4, Montserrat Bluebook for 1834, pp. 58-60.
30. PRO, CO177/17, Sessional Papers, January 31, 1811.
31. MMS, Box 126 no. 57, Hyde to MMS, January 4, 1828.
32. MMS, Box 119 no. 137, Hyde to MMS, August 26, 1826.
33. In 1810, for example, a slave woman allegedly entered a white man's dwelling and stole "a Parcel of Salt fish and other Articles to the Value of fifty Shillings." The council sentenced her to a term in jail. In 1811 Quamina Cooper was charged with stealing a goat valued at £3 from Justin Daly, a free person of color. The council dismissed the charge for want of evidence other than Daly's word. In 1811 and 1812 a few slaves were jailed for stealing from other slaves. None of these cases prompted sentences of hard labor, whipping, or death. Two repeating offenders were whipped, however, for burgling the house of a free black woman. PRO, CO177/17, Sessional Papers, December 1, 1810; January 31, 1811; December 7, 1811; CO177/18, May 25, 1812. One accused slave even had a jury trial in 1811. His five-person jury included a woman and a free person of color. By 1823 no one in either category would have been called. PRO, CO 177/17, Sessional Papers February 16, 1811; March 2, 1811.
34. PRO, CO7/10, D'Urban to Herbert, July 2, 1823; CO7/9, D'Urban to Bathurst, October 10, 1823. Bathurst had directed D'Urban to get the local legislatures to initiate amelioration acts under threat of parliamentary action if they failed or delayed.
35. Great Britain 1826:34-35. Wheatland recounted the case of a slave who had died of starvation. Seeing signs of fatal neglect, he as coroner collected evidence from slave witnesses and pursued the case to King's Bench, the highest court. The court decided to "suppress" slave testimony and refused to transmit it to a grand jury. The commissioners asked Wheatland if perhaps he meant "reject" rather than "suppress," but Wheatland was firm about "suppress." No further inquiry took place and, Wheatland affirmed, "one of the assistant judges of the court, strongly reprobated my conduct in taking the evidence of slaves."
36. MMS, Box 119 no. 137, Hyde to MMS, August 26, 1823.
37. PRO, CO393/1, Bathurst to Administrative Officer of Montserrat, June 30, 1824; MMS, Box 126 no. 57, Hyde to MMS, January 4, 1828.
38. MMS, Box 118 no. 116, Lanion to MMS, September 7, 1822; Box 119 no. 92, Hyde to MMS, July 1, 1823.
39. MMS, Box 121 no. 51, Hyde to MMS, August 6 and 8, 1823.
40. MMS, Box 123 no. 63, Hyde to MMS, March 2, 1826; Box 119 no. 137, August 26, 1823.

41. MMS, Box 119 no. 137, Hyde to MMS, August 26, 1823.
42. MMS, Box 128 no. 133, Journal of Enoch Wood, March 18, 1828; Box 119 no. 137, Hyde to MMS, August 26, 1823.
43. PRO, CO7/10, D'Urban to Bathurst, March 12, 1824; MMS, Box 120 no. 21, Hyde to MMS, October 22, 1823.
44. MMS, Box 117/2a no. 72, Lanion to MMS, October 11, 1821; Box 121 no. 107, Hyde to MMS, September 7, 1824.
45. MMS, Box 118 no. 7, Lanion to MMS, January 18, 1822; PRO, CO7/10, Third Report of the Committee for Conducting the Wesleyan-Methodist Montserrat Schools, January 21, 1824; MMS, Box 123 no. 63, Hyde to MMS, March 2, 1826; PRO, CO10/14, Montserrat Bluebook, 1830.
46. MMS, Box 115 no. 46, Maddock to MMS, March 8, 1820. In 1822 Lanion married two plantation slave couples; the master of one groom wished he had been at the wedding and sent a gift of mutton. MMS, Box 118 no. 116, Lanion to MMS, September 7, 1822.
47. PRO, CO7/10, An Act for the More Effectual Suppression of the Slave Trade, January 1, 1825; D'Urban to Bathurst, March 12, 1824.
48. MMS, Box 123 no. 147, Hyde to MMS, June 7, 1826.
49. PRO, CO7/10, D'Urban to Herbert, July 2, 1823; MMS, Box 119 no. 137, Hyde to MMS, August 26, 1823.
50. PRO, CO395/5, Spring Rice to Macgregor, June 6, 1834; July 1, 1834; September 16, 1834.
51. Assembled from Montserrat statistical Bluebooks: PRO, CO10/5, Bluebook for 1821; CO10/6, Bluebook for 1822; CO10/9, Bluebook for 1825; CO10/14, Bluebook for 1830.
52. PRO, CO7/3, Symons and Shiele to Ramsay, December 7, 1816; Ramsay to Bathurst, February 28, 1817, enclosure dated December 13, 1816; Chambers's testimony; Fergus to Ramsay, November 29, 1816; Ramsay to Bathurst, February 20, 1817, enclosures dated December 12 and 14, 1816.
53. PRO, CO7/3, Ramsay to Herbert, December 13, 1816; Ramsay to Bathurst, May 13, 1817; Members of the Council to Ramsay, May 9, 1817; Semper to Bathurst, July 22, 1817.
54. PRO, CO7/3, Ramsay to Members of Council, June 7, 1817; Ramsay to Bathurst, July 10, 1817; Lack to Goulburne, March 22, 1817.
55. PRO, CO7/3, Semper to Bathurst, July 22, 1817.
56. PRO, CO7/4, Ramsay to Bathurst, March 21, 1818.
57. In a suspicious succession of events in 1823 the two brothers foreclosed a mortgage on the property of Sarah Dowdy. She had put up it up as security for a loan from the Sempers to one of her relatives, who was also kin to the Sempers. When the loan was not paid, the Sempers claimed Dowdy's property. Fearing destitution and arrest, she fled with her twenty slaves on an uncleared vessel to St. Eustatius,

pursued by Dudley Semper. Dowdy was defying the laws abolishing the slave trade, but the Sempers appear to have conspired with their common kinsman to do her out of her property. PRO, CO7/9, Hamilton to D'Urban, January 23, 1823; van Remondt to Hamilton, January 2 and 8, 1823; D'Urban to van Remondt, February 13, 1823; D'Urban to Bathurst, May 14, 1823.

58. PRO, CO177/18, Sessional Papers, March 14, 1814.

59. MMS, Box 121 no. 74, Hyde to MMS, July 30, 1824; Box 118 no. 116, Lanion to MMS, September 7, 1822.

60. PRO, CO393/1, Bathurst's approval of Semper's appointment, October 23, 1826.

61. PRO, CO7/4, Kerby to Herbert, October 27, 1818; Herbert to Kerby and enclosures, October 27, 1818; Kerby to Bathurst and enclosures, November 19, 1818; Kerby to Bathurst, December 3, 1818; Charge and bail of Herbert, December 15-17, 1818; Brown to Council, January 9, 1819.

62. MMS, Box 126 no. 61, Wood to MMS, November 4, 1827.

63. PRO, CO7/11, Herbert to Bathurst, December 3, 1822; CO7/8, Herbert to Horton, April 24, 1824; CO7/11, Bathurst to Horton, undated.

64. PRO, CO7/11, Hamilton to Bathurst, March 12, 1824.

65. Thomas Hyde described these fears and obsessions. MMS, Box 119 no. 137, Hyde to MMS, August 26, 1826.

66. PRO, CO393/5, Spring Rice to Macgregor, June 6, 1834 and July 1, 1834; CO393/15, Spring Rice to Macgregor, September 16, 1834.

REFERENCES

ANSTEY, ROGER, 1968. Capitalism and Slavery: A Critique. *Economic History Review* 21:307-20.

—, 1975. *The Atlantic Slave Trade and British Abolition, 1760-1810*. London: Macmillan.

AUFHAUSER, KEITH R., 1974. Profitability of Slavery in the British Caribbean. *Journal of Interdisciplinary History* 1:45-67.

BECKLES, HILARY MCD., 1985. Emancipation by Law or War? Wilberforce and the 1816 Barbados Slave Rebellion. In David Richardson (ed.), *Abolition and Its Aftermath: The Historical Context, 1790-1916*. London: Cass, pp. 80-104.

BERLEANT-SCHILLER, RIVA, 1989. Free Labor and the Economy in Seventeenth-Century Montserrat. *The William and Mary Quarterly* 46:539-64.

- , 1995. From Labour to Peasantry in Montserrat after the End of Slavery. In Karen Fog Olwig (ed.), *Small Islands, Large Questions: Society, Culture, and Resistance in the Post-Emancipation Caribbean*. London: Cass, pp. 53-72.
- BRERETON, BRIDGET, 1981. *A History of Modern Trinidad, 1783-1962*. Kingston: Heinemann.
- BUSH, BARBARA, 1985. Towards Emancipation: Slave Women and Resistance to Coercive Labour Regimes in the British West Indian Colonies, 1790-1838. In David Richardson (ed.), *Abolition and Its Aftermath: The Historical Context, 1790-1916*. London: Cass, pp. 27-54.
- CARRINGTON, SELWYN H.H., 1987. The American Revolution and the British West Indies' Economy. In Barbara L. Solow & Stanley L. Engerman (eds.), *British Capitalism and Caribbean Slavery: The Legacy of Eric Williams*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, pp. 135-62.
- COVER, ROBERT M., 1975. *Justice Accused: Antislavery and the Judicial Process*. New Haven: Yale University Press.
- COX, EDWARD L., 1984. *Free Coloreds in the Slave Societies of St. Kitts and Grenada, 1763-1833*. Knoxville: University of Tennessee Press.
- CRATON, MICHAEL, 1985. Emancipation from Below? The Role of West Indian Slaves in the Emancipation Movement, 1816-1834. In Jack Hayward (ed.), *Out of Slavery: Abolition and After*. London: Cass, pp. 110-31.
- DAVY, JOHN, 1854. *The West Indies, Before and Since Slave Emancipation: Comprising the Windward and Leeward Islands' Military Command; Founded on Notes and Observations Collected during a Three Years' Residence*. London: Cash.
- DEERR, NOEL, 1949. *The History of Sugar*. 2 vols. London: Cassell.
- DRESCHER, SEYMOUR, 1977. *Econocide: British Slavery in the Era of Abolition*. Pittsburgh: University of Pittsburgh Press.
- FERGUS, HOWARD A., 1994. *Montserrat: History of A Caribbean Colony*. London: Macmillan.
- FERNANDES, FLORESTAN, 1976. Slaveholding Society in Brazil. In Vera Rubin & Arthur Tuden (eds.), *Comparative Perspectives on Slavery in New World Plantation Societies*. New York: New York Academy of Sciences, pp. 311-42.
- FRUCHT, RICHARD, 1976. From Slavery to Unfreedom in the Plantation Society of St. Kitts, W.I. In Vera Rubin & Arthur Tuden (eds.), *Comparative Perspectives on Slavery in New World Plantation Societies*. New York: New York Academy of Sciences, pp. 379-88.
- GOVEIA, ELSA V., 1965. *Slave Society in the British Leewards at the End of the Eighteenth Century*. New Haven: Yale University Press.
- GREAT BRITAIN, COLONIAL OFFICE, 1826. *Commissioners' Report on Justice*. London: Colonial Office.
- GREEN, WILLIAM A., 1973. The Planter Class and the British West Indies before and after Emancipation. *Economic History Review* 26:448-63.

HALL, DOUGLAS, 1964. Absentee-Proprietorship in the British West Indies, to about 1850. *Jamaica Historical Review* 4:15-35.

—, 1972. Jamaica. In David W. Cohen & Jack P. Greene (eds.), *Neither Slave Nor Free: The Freedman of African Descent in the Slave Societies of the New World*. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, pp. 193-213.

HANDLER, JEROME, 1974. *The Unappropriated People: Freedmen in the Slave Society of Barbados*. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press.

HANDLER, JEROME & ARNOLD SIO, 1972. Barbados. In David W. Cohen and Jack P. Greene (eds.), *Neither Slave Nor Free: The Freedman of African Descent in the Slave Societies of the New World*. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, pp. 214-57.

HEUMAN, GAD J., 1981. *Race, Politics, and the Free Colored in Jamaica, 1792-1865*. Westport CN: Greenwood Press.

INCORPORATED SOCIETY, 1829. *Report for the Year 1829*. London: Incorporated Society for the Conversion and Religious Instruction and Education of the Negro Slaves in the British West India Islands.

KNIGHT, FRANKLIN W., 1976. The Social Structure of Cuban Slave Society in the Nineteenth Century. In Vera Rubin & Arthur Tuden (eds.), *Comparative Perspectives on Slavery in New World Plantation Societies*. New York: New York Academy of Sciences, p. 259-66.

LEVY, CLAUDE, 1980. *Emancipation, Sugar, and Federalism: Barbados and the West Indies, 1833-1876*. Gainesville: University Presses of Florida.

—, 1959. Barbados: The Last Years of Slavery. *Journal of Negro History* 44:308-45.

LEWIS GORDON K., 1983. *Main Currents in Caribbean Thought: The Historical Evolution of Caribbean Society in its Ideology Aspects, 1492-1900*. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press.

MARTIN, ROBERT MONTGOMERY, 1850. *The British Colonies: Their History, Extent, Condition, and Resources. Vol. IV: Africa and the West Indies*. London and New York: London Printing and Publishing Co.

MURRAY, D.J., 1965. *The West Indies and the Development of Colonial Government, 1801-1834*. Oxford: Clarendon.

OLWIG, KAREN FOG, 1993. *Global Culture, Island Identity: Continuity and Change in the Afro-Caribbean Community of Nevis*. Philadelphia: Harwood.

PARES, RICHARD, 1950. *A West India Fortune*. London: Longmans, Green & Co.

RAGATZ, LOWELL JOSEPH, 1928. *Fall of the Planter Class in the British West Indies, 1763-1838*. New York: Century.

—, 1931. Absentee Landlordism in the British Caribbean, 1750-1833. *Agricultural History* 5:7-24.

RICE, C. DUNCAN, 1975. *The Rise and Fall of Black Slavery*. Baton Rouge: Louisiana State University Press.

SHERIDAN, RICHARD B., 1961. The West India Sugar Crisis and British Slave Emancipation, 1830-1833. *Journal of Economic History* 21:539-51.

- , 1970. *The Development of the Plantations to 1750: An Era of West Indian Prosperity, 1750-1775*. [Barbados]: Caribbean Universities Press.
- , 1971. Planters and Merchants: The Oliver Family of Antigua and London, 1716-1784. *Business History* 13:104-23.
- , 1974. *Sugar and Slavery: An Economic History of the British West Indies, 1623-1775*. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press.
- , 1976. The British Sugar Planters in the Atlantic World, 1763-1775. In Samuel Proctor (ed.), *Eighteenth-Century Florida and the Caribbean*. Gainesville: University of Florida Press, pp. 1-14.
- SIO, ARNOLD A., 1976. Race, Colour, and Miscegenation: The Free Coloured of Jamaica and Barbados. *Caribbean Studies* 16:5-21.
- SOLOW, BARBARA L. & STANLEY L. ENGERMAN (eds.), 1987. *British Capitalism and Caribbean Slavery: The Legacy of Eric Williams*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- THOMAS, CLIVE Y., 1988. *The Poor and the Powerless: Economic Policy and Change in the Caribbean*. New York: Monthly Review Press.
- WARD, J.R., 1978. The Profitability of Sugar Planting in the British West Indies, 1650-1834. *Economic History Review* 31:197-213.
- , 1985. *Poverty and Progress in the Caribbean 1800-1960*. London: Macmillan.
- , 1988. *British West Indian Slavery, 1750-1834: The Process of Amelioration*. Oxford: Clarendon.
- WATSON, KARL, 1995. Politics in Pre-Emancipation Barbados: Class Contradictions among White Creoles. Unpublished paper, Conference on Creole Cultures in Latin America and the Caribbean, University of Delaware.
- WESLEY, CHARLES, 1934. The Emancipation of the Free Colored Population in the British Empire. *Journal of Negro History* 19:137-70.
- WILLIAMS, ERIC, 1944. *Capitalism and Slavery*. Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press.

RIVA BERLEANT-SCHILLER
Department of Anthropology
University of Connecticut
Torrington CT 06790, U.S.A.

VIRGINIA R. DOMÍNGUEZ

EROTIC(IZING) CUBANS

Sugar's Secrets: Race and the Erotics of Cuban Nationalism. VERA M. KUTZINSKI. Charlottesville: University Press of Virginia, 1993. xvii + 287 pp. (Cloth US\$ 40.00, Paper US\$ 17.95)

Life on the Hyphen: The Cuban-American Way. GUSTAVO PÉREZ FIRMAT. Austin: University of Texas Press, 1994. xii + 217 pp. (Cloth US\$ 30.00, Paper US\$ 12.95)

When a country is subjected to as much external political and ideological scrutiny as Cuba in the post-Batista years, scholarly explorations of something other than its foreign policy, its political economy, and its human rights abuses provide a breath of fresh air. But I am struck by the other things *Sugar's Secrets* and *Life on the Hyphen* have in common and how suspicious I am of their commonalities.

Both books are readable, focused, and substantive in detail and interpretation. Both authors obviously care about "Cuban-ness" and provide extensive documentation and arguments for a far more complex understanding of Cuban-ness than one usually reads about in the United States. Facile interpretations of race, place, and authenticity – not uncommon in the United States in the late twentieth century – will find little confirmation in either book. On the other hand, both books come across as obsessed by hybridity and sex with an intensity, an assertiveness, a timeliness, and an insistence that I find suspect, especially given the very circumscribed nature of the "data" they draw on and their at best partial acknowledgment of those limits. Are hybridity and sex so culturally privileged among Cuban writers, musicians, entertainers, and commercial artists

of the nineteenth and twentieth centuries? Do these obsessions, if realistically depicted, index a more widespread and formative privileging of hybridity or hyphen-ation and sex among Cubans, both men and women inside as well as outside the island itself both in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries? They certainly seem to be when 1990s U.S.-based literary scholars Vera Kutzinski and Gustavo Pérez Firmat write about them. But whose agenda is being captured here, and toward what end?

Consider two ways to describe these books. A more prosaic summary, drawing on the authors' expressed intentions and the type of material they engage with, would say that *Sugar's Secrets* focuses on "images of the *mulata* in nineteenth- and twentieth-century Cuban poetry, fiction, and visual arts" (as the back cover announces) or, in Kutzinski's words "how the new, 'half-breed' race ... has been discursively engendered in Cuba since the early 1800s" (p. 6) and that *Life on the Hyphen* explores "how tradition and translation have shaped Cuban-American culture, which is built on the tradition of translation, in both the topographical and linguistic senses of the word" (p. 3). A more troubling though arguable summary would say that, in these books, men eroticize women and turn them into sensual but problematic icons of Cuba's struggle with peoplehood, nationhood, sovereignty, and imperialism, and that in these books men are constantly showing it and women are apparently keeping quiet – or at least not saying or writing much, even in the late twentieth century, that is worth citing and discussing. What if both descriptions fit?

Sugar's Secrets, for example, consists of six meaty chapters highlighting race and sexuality in both pre- and post-independence Cuba, plus an introduction the author has appropriately entitled "Cuban Color." Chapter titles include "Imperfect Bodies," "Caramel Candy for Sale," "Plácido's Pastoral," "Filomena's Law," "Antidotes to Wall Street," and "Sublime Masculinity." All – with the exception of Chapter 2 ("Caramel Candy for Sale") in which cigarette lithographs (i.e. wrappers) are the main "texts" of the analysis – offer extensive detail and commentary on literary texts about blackness (*lo negro*), mulatto women (*mulatas*), the black experience, or Cubanness in relation to whiteness, mulatto-ness, or blackness.

Sugar's Secrets is organized chronologically. In Chapter 1, Kutzinski concentrates on Cirilo Villaverde's acclaimed early nineteenth-century novel, *Cecilia Valdés*, periodically described and debated as a foundational myth of Cuban literary culture. Kutzinski's point, however, is that it is much more – that at the very least it can certainly be "taken as representative of a racialized and sexualized cultural iconography that offers an alternate mythic foundation: the Cuban cult of the *mulata*" (p. 21). To

broaden her case, Kutzinski explores accompanying visual images in Chapter 2, roughly also from the mid-nineteenth century, consisting especially of numerous cigarette wrappers (officially, lithographs used in local, regional, and international marketing) that included representations of women and men with marked African facial features.

A detailed reading of one poet's poem, Plácido's "La flor de la caña" constitutes Chapter 3. For Kutzinski, it is the poet's nonwhiteness, and more precisely his own racial hybridity as *mulato*, that matters. Plácido was indeed unlike most known Cuban writers of the nineteenth and even early twentieth centuries, who were white and socially privileged, including those writing *poesía de lo negro* (poetry of blackness). Seeking to avoid romanticizing Plácido or denigrating his chosen intervention, Kutzinski argues that "La flor de la caña" is "an attempt at reconfiguring the discourse of sugar and its particular ideological construction of a Cuban national identity from the viewpoint of a nonwhite writer" (p. 11). It is clear from the author's careful attempt to find an argument that is neither blind praise nor smug dismissal that Kutzinski's audience is neither of Plácido's time nor of his place – that it is a readership set in the 1990s in a space, largely in the North Atlantic, occupied by writers and critics debating the merits and demerits of various African diaspora movements' stances toward hegemonic whiteness, structural assimilation, neocolonial formations, and cultural resistance.

The readings in Chapters 4, 5, and 6 remain consistent, continuing to provide substantive literary analysis as well as raising the question of readership. "Filomena's Law" is devoted to a more neglected late nineteenth-century novel by Martín Morúa Delgado entitled *Sofía*. Kutzinski's reading explores his attention to "the sociosexual construction of race" in nineteenth-century Cuba and to his critique of Villaverde's *Cecilia Valdés*. "Antidotes to Wall Street" focuses on the 1920s and 1930s and the rise of Afro-Cubanism in the midst of the first two or three decades of the post-Spanish and neocolonial (U.S.-tied) Cuban state. And "Sublime Masculinity" examines the poetic representation of *mulatas* by a host of twentieth-century male authors, especially Felipe Pichardo Moya, Emilio Ballagas, Ramón Guirao, Marcelino Arozarena, Luis Palés Matos, and Nicolás Guillén. In this last chapter, homosociality bordering on homoeroticism and what Kutzinski calls interracialism gets highlighted as reflecting the Cuban nationalist paradigm.

Gustavo Pérez Firmat does not share Vera Kutzinski's special reading of race nor her insistence on the role of race and miscegenation in the ideological and cultural shaping of a Cuban nationalist imaginary, but he does share a literary training and a desire to extend that literary gaze to

broader social and cultural issues. His is an account largely set in the United States of a Cuban Americanness that, like unhyphenated Americanness, must deal with race, class, and color differences but is not fundamentally constituted by it. *Life on the Hyphen* is his attempt to write about the Cuban-American experience without subjecting it to the discourses of cultural boundedness and comparative social mobility that have shaped so much of the long-lived American narrative of the United States as an immigrant country.

The book's actual content consists of an introduction and six substantial chapters on a number of popular entertainers and two established writers, the vast majority of whom live and have by now long lived in the United States. These individuals and their experiences provide Pérez Firmat with materials to reflect upon, people to identify with, and cultural products to grab on to. These chapters are physically set apart, and simultaneously linked, by seven amusing, intriguing, reflective, or clever one- or two-page entries which the author calls Mambos (variously entitled "Lost in Translation," "Spic'n Spanish," "Desi Does It," "The Barber of Little Havana," "Mirror, Mirror," "English Is Broken Here," and "Last Mambo in Miami"). Through their less standard prose and more poignant commentaries, Pérez Firmat toys with irony, humor, hubris, and frustration in a less restrained way than elsewhere in the text.

Much of the book, however, reveals Pérez Firmat's avowed obsession with Desi Arnaz, his Ricky Ricardo character, and the long-lived "I Love Lucy" television show of the 1950s that made him a household word throughout the United States. Pérez Firmat draws on the history of the TV show, selected episodes, Hollywood films in which Desi Arnaz had speaking parts, some unpublished letters made available posthumously by Arnaz's daughter, and Desi Arnaz's autobiographical book, simply entitled *A Book*. Pérez Firmat's particular attachment to the Ricky Ricardo character and simultaneously, I believe, to Desi Arnaz himself is clear and interesting. To the author's credit, this is amply acknowledged and reflected upon, especially in Chapter 1, appropriately entitled "I Love Ricky." Drawing on an awareness of his own obsessive attachment to the show, the character, and the actor, Pérez Firmat develops the notion of the "one and a half generation" and its experiences – a generation of which he himself is an integral part, a generation different from both a first generation and a second generation in an immigrant family, a generation of people who were too young when they left Cuba to be really Cuban in their adult American years but who were simultaneously too old upon departure from Cuba to become fully or really American either.

What this means to Pérez Firmat becomes more obvious in subsequent

chapters. Experimentation, cross-fertilization, ingenuity, and creativity loom large, while delineating what may be specifically Cuban or what might not look authentically Cuban doesn't seem to interest this author. Chapter 3, for example, offers a detailed history of the mambo, presumed by Americans to be a Cuban import, but shown effectively in this chapter to have been shaped and invented more in New York and Mexico City than in Cuba itself. Chapter 4, cleverly entitled "Salsa for All Seasons," characterizes the Miami music scene since the mass arrival of Cubans following the toppling of the Batista regime in 1959. Three particular sets of performers (Hansel and Raul, Willie Chirino, and Gloria Estefan and her Miami Sound Machine) are discussed here as case studies of generational, class, and even existential responses to being Cuban in the United States. Chapters 5 and 6 offer extended critiques of two writers, novelist Oscar Hijuelos and poet José Kozer, whose works embody very different, possibly polar opposite, ways of being Cuban in the United States. It is important to Pérez Firmat to show agency, variety, and creativity in Cuban-Americans' ways of being Cuban-American.

The contrast between Hijuelos and Kozer is useful here. Fighting against oversimplifications, Pérez Firmat seeks to show a particular type of difference. He describes Oscar Hijuelos, author of *Our House in the Last World* (1983) and *The Mambo Kings Play Songs of Love* (1989), as "a cross-over artist" like Gloria Estefan. He adds that "the voice that speaks in his novels ... is that of someone who retains ties to Cuban culture but who is no longer Cuban" (p. 136). More critically, Pérez Firmat writes that "born in New York in 1951 ... [he] speaks as someone whose grip on Ricky's 'things Cuban' is tenuous" (p. 136). Of Kozer, on the other hand, Pérez Firmat writes: "what is surprising, perhaps, is that a writer as capacious as Kozer [who only writes in Spanish despite making the United States home for over 30 years] has not made room in his poems for any habitation other than Cuba ... that Kozer's hermeticism is part and parcel of his persistent 'will to live in Spanish' in a world where such life is next to impossible" (p. 178), and that "Kozer's Esperanto Spanish [often not colloquially Cuban Spanish, with slang expressions from Castillian Spanish or Peruvian Spanish or Venezuelan Spanish] is both a symptom of uprootedness and a shield against it" (p. 160). Both Hijuelos and Kozer come across as flawed in the eyes of Pérez Firmat, albeit decidedly Cuban-American.

Unlike Kutzinski, Pérez Firmat does not set out to write a book about sex, the erotic, or sexuality in the Cuban national experience. Yet perhaps unconsciously he has written a book that, like hers, highlights the sexual and the seductive, especially the sexualized masculine world in which

women appear as little more than objects of desire and seduction.

In both books, Otherness is so seductive that few Cubans seemingly resist the lure of the foreign woman – the American blonde, the West African body, the Afro-European *mulata* whose very existence is a constant reminder of centuries of Cuban sensuality and the irresistibility of sex with foreign women. In them, only women come across as seductive and only heterosexual (though homosocial) men live in Cuba.

In these books, we have to draw inferences about Cuban women's sexual lives, because evidence is, or appears to be, so sorely lacking. Were women in Cuba – *blancas* or *mulatas* or *chinas* or *negras* – in the nineteenth and earlier twentieth centuries really into sex? Are women in Cuba – *blancas* or *mulatas* or *negras* – currently into sex? Are women from the Cuban diaspora into sex? Or is it perhaps that Cuban men and Cuban women share a singular sexual preference for women, especially when they are imagined as exotic?

These are not minor omissions, given the themes and expressed claims of both *Sugar's Secrets* and *Life on the Hyphen*. Both books are ambitious. For example, while Kutzinski avowedly focuses on "images of the mulata in nineteenth- and twentieth-century Cuban poetry, fiction, and visual arts" (back cover), she really intends much more. I take her at her word when she writes that she seeks and intends more in and through this book – as when she writes, for example, that one of the leading questions she began with was "exactly what role have race, gender, and sexuality historically played in the formulations of Cuba's national identity?" (p. 8), or when she writes on pages 9 and 10:

While the texts and visual images I discuss in the following chapters do not equally revolve around the figure of the mulata, they are all located, at times precariously, at intersections that mark historically specific instances in the formation and consolidation of Cuba's nationalist cultural ideology ... [and what interests me] are the ways in which that evolving ideology en-gendered and deracialized Cuba, thus further entrenching racially and sexually determined social hierarchies.

Sticking to published and largely known male writers, she ends up concluding that Cuban men (especially white men) are into a kind of "strategic self-effacement of masculinity ... [which by implication produces] the corollary erasure of the female subject from the critical discourses on Cuban and other Hispanic-American cultures" (p. 15). But whose erasure is this and what limitations are, therefore, built into her selection of "data" for an analysis she believes is of "the formation and consolidation of Cuba's nationalist cultural ideology"? Are women just icons and patsies,

totally objectified entities uninvolved in public discourse, public criticism, public institutions, and public debate – not to mention more private discursive spaces? I am sure Vera Kutzinski would say no, but her book relegates women to a status I am sure she would personally reject.

Gustavo Pérez Firmat's project suffers from a similar effect, though here, too, it is probably unintentional. Officially he describes *Life on the Hyphen* as examining "how tradition and translation have shaped Cuban-American culture" (p. 3). Unofficially I am struck by how a book that does not claim to be specifically about Cuban American men and their issues can be so insistently male in its reported experience, its chosen subjects, its masculinist and heterosexualist obsessions, and its scholarly citations, and not know (or at least not acknowledge) that at best it is a book about Cuban and Cuban-American men's issues with Cubanness and Americanness, especially in the arts and entertainment worlds.

After all, the book purports to "chronicle what it means to be Cuban in America" (a statement on the book's back cover). It makes a point of arguing that "there is nothing particularly zany or exotic about Cuban Americans ... [and that] the Cuban-American way is not inconsistent with the American way" (p. 20), and it does a very clear job of showing "Cuban-American culture as 'appositional' rather than 'oppositional'" (p. 6) to U.S. and Cuban cultures. Nothing in the book's setup warns us that the overwhelming majority of the author's sources, case studies, and references, are male, or that his implied referent is almost always a Cuban male, often with sex on his mind. Nothing explains or justifies Pérez Firmat's casual dismissal – literally in one paragraph on pages 19-20 – of the potential value and relevance of what he calls "earlier studies about Cuban Americans," a number of which have been authored by women and are neither as old nor as full of seemingly impenetrable statistics as he suggests. Nothing explains or justifies the near total silence on legendary singer Celia Cruz in a book extensively dealing with Cuban music in and out of Cuba since the 1940s. The inclusion of Gloria Estefan and her band, the Miami Sound Machine, on pages 126-33 (i.e. at the end of one of the book's six substantive chapters), does little to dispel the overwhelming and seemingly doxic maleness of Pérez Firmat's "Cuban American way."

I wonder then about the overall value of these books. As studies of Cuban males in certain circles (literary, artistic, musical, or mass-mediated), they are both rich and worthwhile, even when the overall picture of a seemingly hypersexualized homosocial masculine world is not pretty. As studies of self-other relations, or in Ricoeur's well-known phrase, of how

they obsess over "the self via the detour of the Other," they can also both lend themselves to lively and heated discussion.

As forays into interdisciplinary social or cultural analysis, they falter but to very different degrees. Kutzinski's is more interdisciplinary in its cited sources and its discussion of some of the social, historical, political, and economic conditions in which the writers operated, though not in its research design or sense of evidence. Pérez Firmat is so seemingly deliberate in his minimal use of social science and historiographic scholarship on over thirty-five years of massive Cuban life in the United States that one has to wonder why. Does he not realize how dramatically out of date and out of sync he is in his forays into discussions of "acculturation" and "stages of adaptation," citing three sources dating back to 1940, 1953, and 1957 and nothing else? Or how unacceptable it is to cite what he cites in support of his argument, as if it were contemporary anthropological thinking (footnote 6, chapter 1)?

As studies of Cuban nationalism, Cubanness, racializing practices, and border crossings, both books promise more than they deliver. Most worrisome, they overreach in ways that can be easily misread, and that can inadvertently reproduce sexualized, gendered, racial, and cultural images of Cuba and Cubans that serve and at best refract contemporary U.S. domestic agendas.

REFERENCES

- HIJUELOS, OSCAR, 1983. *Our House in the Last World: A Novel*. New York: Persea.
 —, 1989. *The Mambo Kings Play Songs of Love*. New York: Farrar, Straus, Giroux.

VIRGINIA R. DOMÍNGUEZ
 Center for International & Comparative Studies and
 Department of Anthropology
 University of Iowa
 Iowa City IA 52242-1322, U.S.A.

STEPHAN PALMIÉ

MAKING SENSE OF SANTERÍA: THREE BOOKS ON
AFRO-CUBAN RELIGION

Santería from Africa to the New World: The Dead Sell Memories. GEORGE BRANDON. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1993. x + 206 pp. (Cloth US\$ 31.50)

Working the Spirit: Ceremonies of the African Diaspora. JOSEPH M. MURPHY. Boston: Beacon, 1994. xiii + 263 pp. (Cloth US\$ 25.00)

Walking with the Night: The Afro-Cuban World of Santería. RAUL CANIZARES. Rochester VT: Destiny Books, 1993. xii + 148 pp. (Paper US\$ 12.95)

Since 1959, the steady exodus from revolutionary Cuba has led to the gradual emergence of an Afro-Cuban religious diaspora in the United States. While this phenomenon has attracted scholarly attention for some time, the literature has grown particularly rapidly in recent years. It is, perhaps, not entirely fortuitous that a spate of current academic publications on the subject coincided with a scramble by the popular media to exploit its exotic potential in the context of the 1993 U.S. Supreme Court case on animal sacrifice. Clearly, what has come to be called an Afro-Cuban "cultic renaissance" in exile holds promise both for sensationalist journalism and certain kinds of theoretical projects. Partly articulating with older, but politically reinvigorated debates about the relations between African and African-American cultures, partly addressing fundamental questions about conventional models of cultural boundedness and coherence, and, finally, calling into question both popular and academic notions of "modernity" (and its inevitable counterpart "tradition"), the

problems posed by the emergence of an Afro-Cuban religious diaspora in the United States present a timely challenge.

Although all three volumes under review here speak to these issues in one way or another, George Brandon's *Santería from Africa to the New World* is most explicit in foregrounding their significance for a theory of what he calls the "organization of cultural difference in multicultural, multiethnic, and multiracial societies" (p. 7). For Brandon, such a theory must be historical in scope, and it is to history that he turns in attempting to chart the complex processes of fusion and fragmentation that went into the making of Afro-Cuban religious culture. Brandon has synthesized a large number of not always easily accessible publications into a coherent, and at times fresh and illuminating account. Like some of his predecessors, Brandon links the emergence of Yoruba-influenced religious practices in Cuba to the construction of new social frameworks, such as the *cabildos de nación* (voluntary associations of Africans based on ideologies of ethnic commonality). Yet he does not accept standard views about the quasi-automatic "tenacity" of traditions so implanted. Instead Brandon plausibly hypothesizes about a process whereby the mechanisms carrying religious knowledge forward in time were repeatedly re-located to new organizational forms – for instance when the end of the slave trade and increasing legal restriction undermined the viability of the *cabildos*. Likewise, he succeeds in problematizing commonsense assumptions about the transplantation of Afro-Cuban religion to the United States, indicating how this transition – given fuller knowledge of the historical particulars – might be decomposed into a plurality of processes unfolding on both social and ideological planes, and involving change and differentiation within the symbolic realm as well (pp. 104-20).

Brandon's occasional inability to ground his interpretations in the kind of evidence a rigorous historicism would demand may be excusable, given his dependence on published accounts and the pioneering character of his own research into the most recent developments. More problematic, however, is the manner in which he presents his argument about a basic thread of cultural continuity running from pre-colonial Yorubaland to the rural baracoons and urban black barrios of nineteenth-century Cuba, and, finally, to Union City, East Harlem, the Bronx, and Miami. Brandon's criticism of the misplaced concreteness of an earlier anthropological discourse on "culture contact" and "syncretism" is well taken. Nevertheless, he seems reluctant to part with some of its basic premises and heuristic tools – such as the assumption of the existence of a unitary pre-colonial "Yoruba religion" (something on which we have practically no valid historical information, and which contemporary ethnographic evidence makes im-

probable), and its counterpart, as similarly monolithic ideal-typical Catholic "conquest culture" in colonial Cuba (which, upon closer inspection, turns about to be a similar mirage).

Ironically, it is precisely this typological device which allows him to use analogies deriving from sociolinguistics to periodize the processes nowadays associated with the term "creolization." The result is more typology – and of a questionable sort. Brandon's deductive elaboration of purely abstract categories such as "HFY" (mystical healing oriented spiritists involved in folk Catholicism who practice some aspects of Yoruba-derived religions) or "PCFY" (presumably practitioners of Palo Monte who are also folk Catholics, and have adopted some elements of Yoruba-derived traditions) hardly adds to an understanding of how variations in cultural form become salient in social practice. Moreover, once projected into the past, these constructs lead him to flatten historical processes into ever more complicated diagrammatic schemata referring to logically permutations in social perceptions of cultural form. The fact that Brandon (or anyone, for that matter) cannot marshal adequate data to support such exercises in deductive reasoning is only part of the problem. For his enterprise also rests on a good dose of "bad history." In dealing with what he calls "phase II, Pre-Santería and Early Santería," Brandon wraps up a highly implausible "period" lasting from 1492, when Columbus had barely set foot on Cuba, to 1870, when entirely unexplicated changes allegedly ushered in "phase III, Santería." As with Brandon's positing of a (seemingly trans-historical) African "Old Religion," one wonders how the carving out of an historical unit of analysis which spans several centuries – and obviously downplays the dramatic economic and social transformations Cuba underwent at the turn of the nineteenth century – could further his declared analytical goals. Just as one cannot help but feel that a good many of the outmoded anthropological conceptions the author rightly attacks are strawmen, so do such conceptions of history ultimately leave one puzzled.

This is all the more regrettable because the dissertation which Brandon reworked into this book was, at the time of its submission (1983), a valid and novel contribution to the anthropology of Afro-Cuban religion. It may, indeed, have been the first attempt to combine an historical account of the evolution of Afro-Cuban religion with an ethnography of its current practice in the urban United States. Yet in the published text Brandon chose to downplay his ethnographic contribution, while enlarging upon what – with few exceptions – amounts to a reinterpretation of the published historiographical literature. This was probably not wise, for unless the announced second volume – this time of ethnographic scope – includes a great deal of fresh research, it is likely that the publication of other

ethnographic oriented dissertations from the 1980s will discourage the publication of what was, in 1983, a useful corpus of primary data.

If, for Brandon – who at times literally collapses culture into ethnicity – difference is articulated at the shifting boundaries between (presumably socially localizable) “traditions,” the target of Joseph Murphy’s *Working the Spirit* is not the socially “other,” but *wholly* other. While conceding that “cultural heritage or social history” must play a part in discussions of African-American religious cultures, such concerns – Murphy argues – are contingent upon the metaphysical premises of inquiry: they may be bracketed once we look at religion not as a social fact, but as a transcendent one. This has a number of interesting consequences – among them the possibility of unabashedly raising the issue of “essence.” Despite the obvious dissimilarities between different African-American religions, Murphy feels confident that we can speak of a “diasporan spirituality” which is distinctive not only for historical reasons, but also because its essence lies in a particular attitude towards what Murphy calls “the spirit,” and glosses as “a real and irreducible force uplifting communities throughout the African diaspora” (p. 3).

By defining his agenda in such terms, Murphy places himself within a tradition of comparative religious research that posits the mutual translatability of religious idioms on the grounds of the assumption of a common object of reference. Hence his focus on “spirituality” as a mode of human-divine interrelation that may ramify into specificity, but cannot be reduced to it. For Murphy, empathy, grounded in a “sense” of the sacred as universal and *sui generis*, can transcend the accidents of history and cultural difference. Once paved in this manner, the way ahead is clear: African-American religions can be shown to constitute a “family of traditions” not just because a hemispheric perspective reveals commonalities in historical determination, but also because “gaps of theological explanation among the different diasporan traditions” (p. 8) can be overcome by recourse to the translational master key of Christianity. In stringing five African-American religious traditions – Vodun, Candomblé, Santería, Revival Zion, and North American Black Christianity – along this ecumenical thread, Murphy takes his departure from a basically Durkheimian vocabulary which he submits to a soteriological twist. In a rather remarkable passage he tells us that

diasporan liturgies are seen by their practitioners as both works for the spirit and of the spirit. The reciprocity between communities and spirit is expressed in physical work as the community works through words, music, and movement to make the spirit present. The spirit in turn works through the physical work of the congregation, filling human actions with

its power. Diasporan ceremonies are thus services *for* the spirit, actions of sacrifice and praise to please the spirit. And they are services *of* the spirit, actions undertaken by the spirit to inspire the congregation. Thus the reciprocity of Diasporan spirituality is affirmed: service to the spirit is service to the community; and service to the community is service to the spirit. Service is revealed to be the central value of communal life. Service shows the spirit, in ceremony, but also whenever one member serves another (p. 7).

If this is circular reasoning for those who prefer to see religion as a symbolic medium – albeit a uniquely powerful one – for making statements about something else (say, in the present instance, certain definitions of “community” with all their implications of hierarchy, inequality, exclusion, mystification of power-relations, and so forth), those inclined to follow Murphy’s path see the beauty of truth affirmed.

Murphy has little to say about – for example – the complex strategies of marginalizing women in contemporary Vodun, the manner in which Santeros have long linked ideologies of reciprocity to an idiom of pecuniary transactions, or the way in which – as Eugene Genovese suggested long ago, and Jean Comaroff has shown more recently in an African case – the appropriation of Christianity (even if in a “spirit of resistance”) reinscribed the categories of oppression in sacralized form not only upon the community, but also upon the individual bodies of the faithful. But he does have some to say – if obliquely – about how the truth of “Diasporan ceremonial spirituality” relates to the larger contexts of social action within which, and against which, it reveals itself to the “community” and (presumably) the religiously sensitive outside observer. This is where things, at times, go seriously wrong in what is otherwise a fairly balanced, occasionally insightful, and certainly – as the back-cover blurb tells us – “userfriendly” account. It is surely true that all diasporan religions define a sort of alternative public sphere – which is fundamentally structured by (though, indeed, not reducible to) the realities of social exclusion. Yet the conclusion that they must therefore provide a “haven in a heartless world” is not only counterfactual, but misleading insofar as it neglects that people phase in and out of differently structured “provinces of meaning” with much more ease than our suppositions about their “finitude” suggest.

To take just one example, it is simply wrong to suggest that Cubans – subjected as they are in the United States to forms of racial othering both more unspecific and more rigid than those salient to their own cultural context – would, upon entering the sacred social realm of the *ilé* or *casa de santo* (cult group), “leave behind these external, if not oppressive,

markers of identity and reaffirm one family, one house in the spirit" (p. 88). It does take some leaps of faith to count a good part of Miami's Cuban-American population among "some of the most oppressed people on earth" (p. 88) – which one is led to conclude from Murphy's failure to specify that he *may* be talking about the time of slavery. But apart from that, I would suggest that he ask his sources not only why, for example, *batá*-drummers tend to be black (even by Cuban standards), but also why they enjoy a reputation (much gossiped about among their phenotypically "more legitimate" religious "family members") as socially deviant, and good for little else than, yes, "working the spirit."

Despite all good intentions, if taken as contribution to the comparative ethnography of African-American religious (a purpose which Murphy's book will undoubtedly serve, given the paucity of adequate undergraduate reading), *Working the Spirit* is a troubling book. For its romanticization of an oppressed African-American religious "Other" more in tune with "God's very truth" than with the disenchanting majoritarian rationalist may well block the view toward more "realistic" assessments of its subject matter. Murphy frames his book within an evocation of "our black ancestors" and a praise of the American Black Church for having rediscovered a spirituality not only congruent with the perennial "mission of Protestant Christianity," but also "fully consistent with their biblical ancestors." As this suggests, a vision of the authentically divine may pave the way to truths transcending both mundane conceptions of history and politics. And this, ironically, is where Murphy's implicit adversity to "modernist" rationalism converges with certain postmodern sensibilities more inclined to authorize "occult documents" than "documents of the occult." A good deal more might be said about this peculiar elective affinity between those who eschew modernist paradigms of "sense-making," and those who abandon them. But perhaps the real value of Murphy's contribution lies precisely in this: having demonstrated the extent to which a theological interpretation of African-American religions can generate insights – while also showing where those of us who do not share this vision will have to continue to plod along.

Or fight back! For this is what Raul Canizares sets out to do in the third volume under review here. His is, in many ways, the "pagan" answer to Murphy's Christian pastoralism. Like many others "insiders," Canizares is fed up with the fact that academically or otherwise "empowered" outsiders enjoy almost unlimited liberty to inscribe what suits their fancy upon what he claims as his religion. "After a careful review of the literature and present scholarship on Santería," he tells us,

I've reached the conclusion that the perspective of the high-level initiate – the priests and priestesses, as well as the high priests of the religion – has not been adequately portrayed and is not accessible to the English-speaking community. As one born into the tradition, I possess unique tools to aid my scholarly research. The union of experience with academic discipline – of the -emic with the -etic – will serve us well in exploring hitherto uncharted aspects of the fascinating religion of Santería (p. 8).

The result is a book curiously hovering on the edge of historically distinct discursive formations, and bridging – not always successfully – three equally distinct genres: the academic monograph, the “eyewitness account,” and the *manual de santería* (the latter being one of what can be considered two distinct types of Afro-Cuban “insider” writing: the *libreta*, a handwritten or typed notebook containing ritual and theological information for the writer’s own religious use; and the *manual*, a published tract directed at the layperson and containing, characteristically, an exposition of the “true nature of *santería*,” schematic descriptions of the major deities and their attributes, a few myths, superficial accounts of divination procedures, and some “magical” recipes for home use). Canizares is not the first practitioner to attempt such a synthesis. Neither are the results of his labors as successful a mixture of “[s]cholarship and personal narrative” as William Heim claims in the book’s foreword (p. xii). More often than not, he offers a fairly unmediated juxtaposition, rather than a blend of textual strategies. And as we follow Heim’s suggestion and “accompany Raul Canizares on a brief walk with the night” (p. xii), we are repeatedly jolted from conventionally “academic” chapters into rambling personal anecdotes, *manual*-style lists of deities, or instructions for preparing herbal baths.

This, however, is not to deny the potential value of Canizares’s contribution for rethinking some of the methodological tenets of current Santería studies. What is striking about the position Canizares arrogates for himself is that it reverses the epistemological premises on which most “outsiders” predicate their inquiries. Like Murphy, whose measuring rod for comparing Atlantic spiritualities is not wholly accessible to those who lack a “sense of the religious,” Canizares operates from a position that defies traditional social science standards of rational explication. In contrast to Murphy, however, his is the perspective of an insider looking out. Hence it is only fitting that he would, for example, judge the adequacy of existing accounts not by the disciplinary yardsticks of methodological rigor and theoretical cogency, but by the standards of a system of esoteric knowledge which, by its very nature, cannot be revealed to (or acquired

by) those lacking the initiatory requisites. Like his predecessor Ernesto Pichardo (consistently misspelled as "Pritchardo" by Canizares), to whom some of the more interesting parts of this book are heavily indebted, Canizares thus points to a genuine problem in the sociology of Afro-Cuban religious knowledge relating to thorny questions concerning the distribution of "culture" within sociologically classifiable units.

In contrast to both Brandon and Murphy, Canizares does not worry excessively about how to represent the fundamental heterogeneity and polymorphous character of Afro-Cuban religious thought and practice. Rather than imposing ideal-typical "orientations" upon the evidence, or sweeping "variation" under a Durkheimian carpet, Canizares sees no need to contain the volatility and composite nature of Afro-Cuban religion by disciplinary measures. Instead, he focuses on questions of discursive authority, and thus on the effects of an unequal distribution of religious knowledge among "insiders" upon the research endeavors of "outsiders." Canizares distinguishes a variety of stages of involvement in Santería that correlate not only with differential rights of access to esoteric knowledge, but are thought to correspond with different modes of experiencing ritual life, and, ultimately, with changing perspectives on "the religion" itself. The fundamental division runs along an initiatory faultline sundering "interested observers," "clients," or those who have undergone minor rites establishing affiliation with a priest or cult group from initiates who ritually acquired the right of access to priestly knowledge. Even among the latter, however, the ability to utter "truths" about Santería is notionally contingent upon a dialectic between the gradual acquisition of esoteric knowledge and the growth of experience in enacting such knowledge as sacred competence. Indeed, the distinction between practical ritual knowledge (possessed to a greater or lesser degree by all initiates) and "deep" theological knowledge does not demarcate a boundary between "Santería proper" and corrupted variants. It is merely a criterion by means of which claims to positions of authority become negotiable among the priesthood.

For Canizares, this is where the problem starts. Suffering from a constitutional incapacity not only to gain access to esoteric matters, but to sever superficial information from deep knowledge, anthropologists and other observers have unwittingly reified impressions of Santería that do not accord with the views of what he calls "high-level initiates" (among whom, one imagines, he counts himself). Yet the real problem lies not just in a Simmelian correlation between esotericism and social closure, and Canizares by no means goes far enough in exploring the epistemological

implications his own religion has for the anthropological study of notionally inaccessible – i.e. unknowable – bodies of knowledge. The question appears not so much one of essential truth or falsehood, but of levels of generalization. The quest for a unitary “religion” tends to result in oversystematized images of sometimes poorly integrated bodies of belief and practices, and a thoroughly oversocialized conception of believers and practitioners as well. It is, thus, hardly surprising that most writers on Santería (including myself) have tended to base their constructions of Afro-Cuban religion not so much on what the proverbial run-of-the-mill practitioner does or says, but on the statements of more or less select groups of self-conscious “guardians of traditions” capable and willing to offer ready-made solutions to our quest for systematic unity. The issue here is not only biased reporting, but discursive politics. For it would be simply naive to presume that practitioners of Afro-Cuban religion have remained innocent of the ways in which public ascriptions of authenticated “otherness” can be activated as symbolic capital in a society as obsessed with the political significance of cultural difference as “multicultural” America.

This ties in with another issue which has yet to be adequately addressed in the literature on Afro-Cuban religion. It is not just that the majority of published texts present artificially homogenized accounts of “what *Santeros* believe or do.” Who these *Santeros* are is even less apparent. Focusing on what people do or think *as Santeros* (and *qua* being *Santeros*), we downplay the fact that most – if not all – of them do not spend much of their waking lives falling in trance, sacrificing animals, consulting divination, or engaging in other forms of intriguingly strange and utterly “different” cogitation and behavior. The point here is not that *Santeros* are “essentially no different from you or me,” or that – to refer back to an older and not unproblematic sociological vocabulary – their “role sets” or “status configurations” are not necessarily any less complex and differentially determined than those of their Episcopalian, Baptist, or Pentecostal next-door neighbors in Hialeah or Union City. It is that we simply *do not know* anything about what their lives are all about once they exit the kinds of social situations *we* define as ethnographically relevant, or change the topic from mythology to baseball. More than anything else, this reduction of their identity to that of performers of difference has hampered any serious attempt to understand how, when, and to what extent the beliefs and practices of Afro-Cuban religions contextually intersect with, inform, conflict with, or – who knows? – simply turn out to

be irrelevant to the individual or collective action and projects of their practitioners. This certainly says a good deal about the ethnography that went into the making of the recent literature on Santería. But it also says something about the challenge this subject still holds.

STEPHAN PALMIÉ
Amerika-Institut
University of Munich
Munich, Germany

ROSEMARIJN HOEFTE

A COMMERCIAL ELDORADO?

De eerste Adam & De rots der struikeling. BOELI VAN LEEUWEN. Amsterdam: Ooievaar, 1996. 237 pp. (Paper NLG 25.00)

Gedane zaken: De beste verhalen. HUGO POS. Amsterdam: Ooievaar, 1996. 230 pp. (Paper NLG 15.00)

Maar ik blijf. ASTRID H. ROEMER. Amsterdam: Ooievaar, 1996. 763 pp. (Paper NLG 25.00)

De allermooiste romans van de Antillen en Suriname. Amsterdam: De Bezige Bij, 1996. 605 pp. (Paper NLG 39.90)

Zingende eilanden. WIM RUTGERS (ed.). Amsterdam: De Bezige Bij, 1996. 317 pp. (Paper NLG 25.00)

De eeuwige belofte van Eldorado: Verhalen over Latijns-Amerika en het Caribisch gebied. Nieuwegein: Aspekt, 1996. 188 pp. (Paper NLG 34.50)

Echo van eldorado. ROSEMARIJN HOEFTE & GERT OOSTINDIE (comps). Leiden: KITLV Uitgeverij, 1996. 150 pp. (Paper NLG 15.00)

Achter het eeuwige El Dorado: Fictie en realiteit in Latijnsamerikaanse literatuur. GEERT A. BANCK *et al.* Amsterdam: Thela, 1996. 140 pp. (Paper NLG 19.90)

Eldorado: Werkelijkheid en droom. ROBERT LEMM. Amsterdam: Arbeiderspers, 1996. 160 pp. (Paper NLG 29.90)

Surinaamse recepten van A tot Z. MURIEL SAM-SIN-HEWITT. Schoorl: Conserve, 1996. 243 pp. (Paper NLG 29.95)

De Bonistraat. AMBER NAHAR. Amsterdam: Piramide, 1996. 71 pp. (Cloth NLG 19.90)

Beneden en boven de wind: Literatuur van de Nederlandse Antillen en Aruba. WIM RUTGERS. Amsterdam: De Bezige Bij, 1996. 468 pp. (Paper NLG 54.90)

Elisabeth Samson: Een vrije, zwarte vrouw in het 18e-eeuwse Suriname. CYNTHIA MC LEOD. Schoorl : Conserve, 1996. 177 pp. (Paper NLG 29.90)

De beroepsherinneraar en andere verhalen. ANIL RAMDAS. Amsterdam: De Bezige Bij, 1996. 280 pp. (Paper NLG 34.90)

Geef mij maar een Surinamer. RONALD SNIJDERS. Amsterdam: Prometheus, 1996. 88 pp. (Paper NLG 19.90)

De vrolijke dood van David Caprino. HENRY MENCKEBERG. Amsterdam: Meulenhoff. 291 pp. (Paper NLG 39.90)

Caribische winter. ANNA BRIDIÉ. Amsterdam: Contact, 1996. 222 pp. (Cloth NLG 39.90)

Ma Rochelle passée, Welkom El Dorado: Surinaamse historische roman. CYNTHIA MC LEOD. Schoorl: Conserve, 1996. 277 pp. (Paper NLG 39.95)

Gewaagd leven. ASTRID H. ROEMER. Amsterdam: Arbeiderspers, 1996. 239 pp. (Paper NLG 29.90)

Each year in March an organization with the rather awkward name Collectieve Propaganda voor het Nederlandse Boek (Collective Propaganda for Dutch Books, CPNB) organizes the Dutch national Book Week around a unifying idea. The theme for 1996 was "Eternal Eldorado: Literature from Latin America and the Caribbean." Even though many booksellers expressed their disappointment with this subject, arguing that the Latin American literary boom had long passed, publishers were not deterred. A great number of publications on Latin America and particularly the (Dutch) Caribbean appeared. Some of these books would have been

published anyway and now could take advantage of all the accompanying media publicity, others were produced expressly with the Eldorado theme in mind.

In the latter category several types of anthologies can be discerned. Ooievaar Publishers produced anthologies of the work of three of the most popular authors from the Dutch Caribbean: Boeli van Leeuwen, Hugo Pos, and Astrid H. Roemer. The title of the Van Leeuwen omnibus does not leave much mystery: it includes his novels *De eerste Adam* (originally published in 1966) and *De rots der struikeling* (1960). Hugo Pos's best stories in *Gedane zaken* were previously published in his collections *Het doosje van Toeti* (1985), *Oost en West en Nederland* (1986), *De ziekte van Anna Printemps* (1987), *Het mausoleum van innerlijke vrede* (1989), and *Van het een* (1992). Roemer's *Maar ik blijf* includes the novels *Nergens ergens* (1983), *Over de gekte van een vrouw* (1982), and *Een naam voor de liefde* (1987, for which the original title was *Levenslang gedicht*). De Bezige Bij published an omnibus featuring novels by its four most important Dutch Caribbean writers. From Curaçao, Frank Martinus Arion's *Dubbelspel* (1973), Cola Debrot's *Mijn zuster de negerin* (1935), and Tip Marugg's, *De morgen loeit weer aan* (1988), and from Suriname the first novel of a trilogy poetically titled *De honderd bochten van de koningsarend* (1989) by M.M. Schoenmakers, a Dutchman who has chosen the Suriname interior for his setting.

Other anthologies are not devoted to the work of particular writers but rather the geographical theme Eldorado. In *Zingende eilanden* editor Wim Rutgers attempts to give a literary overview of the entire Caribbean as well as the Caribbean diaspora. His collection includes stories by among others, Miguel Barnet, Alejo Carpentier, Patrick Chamoiseau, Maryse Condé, Cola Debrot, Cristina Garcia, Albert Helman, Oscar Hijuelos, Jamaica Kincaid, Boeli van Leeuwen, Earl Lovelace, Frank Martinus Arion, Tip Marugg, V.S. Naipaul, H. Orlando Patterson, Manuel Pereira, Caryl Phillips, Hugo Pos, Astrid H. Roemer, Jean Rhys, and Simone Schwarz-Bart. In *De eeuwige belofte van Eldorado* thirteen authors express the eternal attraction and promise of the region. Because the compilers neither introduce nor comment upon the stories and poems, the volume lacks coherence. *Echo van eldorado* contains thirty-four selections singing the praises of Suriname, the Netherlands Antilles, and Aruba. Included are travel accounts, poetry, and literary excerpts covering the period from 1608 to 1995. In the introduction the compilers place their selection in a historical context.

Then the two final volumes in the "book week specials" category. *Achter het eeuwige El Dorado* is the outcome of a manifestation organized

to discover "the reality behind Latin American fiction." Eleven scholars, ten social scientists and one literary critic, give their scholarly interpretation of a fictive account. Authors discussed range from Mario Vargas Llosa to Carlos Gardel. The most eldoradoesque volume no doubt is Robert Lemm's essay on the material and spiritual search for Eldorado or utopia. He first relates the futile attempts by Europeans to find El Dorado, the man of gold, and then shifts the discussion to the idea of America as a projection of a desirable society, an alternative to the imperfect Old World. The essay is well written but 160 pages are not enough to relate the adventures of European discoverers and German bankers and to comprehensively explain the utopian ideas of the Jesuits, Voltaire, Jean-Jacques Rousseau, Simón Bolívar, José Martí, Octavio Paz, and Gabriel García Márquez.

Publications which would have seen the light of day with or without the book week are a mixed bag and include a cookbook, a children's book, scholarly studies, collections of essays and short stories, and novels. The cookbook is by Muriel Sam-Sin-Hewitt and the title says it all: Suriname recipes from A to Z, thus from *aardappelburgers* (potato burgers) to *zuurkool met gehakt* (sauerkraut and minced meat). Fortunately the recipes in between are a bit more exotic.

Amber Nahar's *De Bonistraat* is one of the maybe two handfuls of juvenile books by Suriname authors on Suriname. Life in the multiethnic Bonistraat is disturbed when a new family moves in. The mother is of the meddlesome type and terrorizes the neighborhood with her shouted comments and advice. But all's well that ends well when the woman loses her voice.

Two more scholarly volumes are based on previous work. Wim Rutgers's *Beneden en boven de wind* is a revision of his dissertation "Schrijven is zilver, spreken is goud" (1994). In this historical overview of oral and written literature in the Netherlands Antilles and Aruba from the eighteenth century to the present, Rutgers emphasizes the importance of the language issue. He discusses individual writers but also the institutional roots of literature and culture – literary journals and societies, libraries, and book stores – on the islands. The style is less convoluted than in his dissertation and the volume includes new chapters on writers such as Pierre Lauffer, Elis Juliana, Luis Daal, and Denis Henriquez.

Cynthia McLeod's *Elisabeth Samson* is an exact reprint of the book she published with the Department of Cultural Anthropology of Utrecht University in 1993. McLeod uses archival records to reconstruct the life of Elisabeth Samson, the richest free black woman in eighteenth-century Suriname who dared to challenge the authorities by marrying a white man.

The author occasionally swerves from the historical track when she adds dialogue to the account; as a consequence the book sometimes veers uneasily between fact and fiction. McLeod, however, is now planning to write a "real" novel about Samson, which is to double as a scenario for a movie.

Also previously published are many of the essays in Anil Ramdas's *De beroepsherinneraar*. In the first part of the volume Ramdas recounts his childhood in the western district of Nickerie and the cultural shock caused by his migrations to Paramaribo and the Netherlands. The tone is sprightly and humorous and Ramdas gives a touching insight into Hindustani life in Suriname from the 1950s to independence. The great majority of the other essays, mostly four to five pages long, are outstanding as well but lack the coherence of the first section: the topics vary from travel accounts to his criticism of what Ramdas calls the multi-culti scene in the Netherlands: the multicultural events where migrants may display their talents.

Ronald Snijders is known first and foremost as a musician and composer. Yet he is also an astute observer of Suriname popular culture in the Netherlands. In 1994 he published *Surinaams van de straat*, a lexicon of everyday Sranantongo. *Geef mij maar een Surinamer* is a collection of short stories on Creole Surinamers in Suriname and the Netherlands, dealing with a variety of topics from the difference between white and black women to the popular Kwakoe festival in Amsterdam. Even though Snijders manages to convey some of the Afro-Suriname culture and atmosphere, the book suffers from the fact that the author apparently could not make up his mind between writing literature and explaining Creole culture. As a result the literary standard is questionable and the cultural explanations are schoolmasterly.

The literary harvest of the book week consists of four novels, including two debuts. The rookies are Anna Bridié and Henry Menckeberg. Menckeberg is a Surinamer who after his studies in the Netherlands now works in the Netherlands Antilles. The idea behind *De vrolijke dood van David Caprino* is straightforward: a Surinamer is a human being on Curaçao and an "allochtonous" (as the jargon goes) in the Netherlands. Living the good life on Curaçao, David Caprino unexpectedly gets the sack. He returns to the Netherlands, where he lived as a student, and finds that that country is no eldorado for a jobseeking Surinamer. The theme offers sufficient matter for a dramatic novel, but Menckeberg seldom manages to go beyond well-trodden paths. This is compounded by the frequent use of the figure of speech announcing a dramatic event. These announcements are none too subtle and ultimately the foreshadowed events are described in a disappointingly spiritless manner.

Columnist Anna Bridié's first novel gives a more interesting picture of middle-class and tourist Curaçao. The protagonist Emma (35) is a so-called Shell child: as daughter of a Dutch Shell employee she spent part of her youth on Curaçao. She goes back to the island when the Curaçaoan government asks her to set up a publishing house. Her return and particularly her encounter with her former neighbor brings back memories to Dutch-Curaçaoan life in the 1960s as well as frustrations about an uprooted childhood. This very readable novel has already gone into its second printing.

Cynthia McLeod's new historical novel *Ma Rochelle passée*, is set in nineteenth-century Suriname and tells the story of the Couderc family. It is an almost inimitable jumble of sexual and family relations, in which race and color are the dominating factors. McLeod is no great stylist, the dialogues are wooden, and her characters are one dimensional, but the historical basis of her work is sound. She certainly manages to get across her insights about Suriname's past.

By far the best novel of the crop is Roemer's *Gewaagd leven*. Teenager Onno Mus, the talented son of a corrupt father and a mother with a weak personality, gives an impressionistic retrospective on his life. Due to a car wreck he is now a "grown-up Creole" (the author gives this all-important term a negative connotation). Onno's long and agonizing road to adulthood symbolizes the equally traumatic experiences of the Republic of Suriname. The blurb on the backcover tells us that this is the first major Suriname novel that spares nobody. I am not sure about that, but I do think it is the best novel yet by Roemer. She succeeds where Menckeborg fails: her references to future developments arouse curiosity that is gratified at the end.

Was the 1996 book week a success? The CPNB says yes: sales were up 15 percent.¹ Were the retailers wrong when they predicted that the Eldorado theme was a non-starter? Maybe not. The answer to this paradox is to be found in an all important ingredient of the book week: the book week gift. Each year a well-known Dutch-language author gets the prestigious commission to write the gift. The booklet, usually about 100 pages, is offered free with a NLG 20 purchase. Given the Dutch reputation for frugality, it is no surprise that this bonus is in great demand. It is the gift rather than the theme of the week that attracts most buyers to the bookstores. The author for 1996 was the very popular Adriaan van Dis.² Of his gift book *Palmwijn* (about an island in Africa!) 643,000 copies were printed and almost sold out. Van Dis was a big hit. But were Caribbean and Latin American books a success as well? The answer is mixed: some book stores did not

sell more Latin American or Caribbean books than usual, while others announced that Suriname and Antillean books "were selling like hotcakes." The major bestsellers, however, were all by established Dutch authors such as Gerard Reve.

Thus the retailers were not unqualifiedly positive about the eldorado theme, but what about the publishers? As we have seen, some made the most of it, reprinting older literature, but I found it surprising that the two publishing houses with the most popular Latin American authors – Meulenhoff (García Márquez and Vargas Llosa) and Wereldbibliotheek (Isabel Allende) – added very little to the book week. They did not take advantage of the virtually unlimited access to the media during this time to present their stars. Where were García Márquez, Vargas Llosa, Allende, Condé, Walcott, and Naipaul? The publishers could have used them as crowd pullers to introduce a new generation of writers. The Latin American boom may be over, but the publishers do not seem to be very active in reversing the trend.

The opposite occurred in the case of Cynthia McLeod. The efforts of her publisher had the rather amazing result that she was the one author next to Van Dis who was interviewed in almost every newspaper, weekly, and talkshow. Her first novel *Hoe duur was de suiker* (1987) is the greatest bestseller in Suriname history with more than 12,000 copies sold and eight years later also became an unexpected success in the Netherlands, where it is in its tenth printing. It would be interesting to find out who form the majority of buyers of McLeod's books: the Dutch or Surinamers living in the Netherlands. In any case her novels seem a popular way to fill the frequently noted gap in the knowledge about Suriname's past. The translation of *Hoe duur was de suiker* has already appeared in German under the title *Surinam* and according to the publisher translations into English, French, Spanish, and Hebrew are being negotiated. There is also talk about movies and a T.V. miniseries. So a former schoolteacher from Suriname seems to have found eldorado.

NOTES

1. All information about book week sales are from *Boekblad* 13, March 29, 1996, p. 5.
2. In 1995 34.4 million books were sold in the Netherlands; bestselling author was John Grisham, followed by Adriaan van Dis, Annie M.G. Schmidt, and Isabel Allende (*NRC Handelsblad* June 22, 1996).

REFERENCES

DIS, ADRIAAN VAN, 1996. *Palmwijn*. Amsterdam: CPNB.

MC LEOD, CYNTHIA, 1987. *Hoe duur was de suiker*. Paramaribo: Vaco / Schoorl: Conserve.

—, 1996. *Surinam*. Munich: Langen-Müller.

ROSEMARIJN HOEFTE

Dept. of Caribbean Studies

KITLV/ Royal Institute of Linguistics and Anthropology

2300 RA Leiden, the Netherlands

BOOK REVIEWS

Crowns of Glory, Tears of Blood: The Demerara Slave Rebellion of 1823. EMILIA VIOTTI DA COSTA. New York: Oxford University Press, 1994. xix + 378 pp. (Cloth US\$ 35.00)

BRIDGET BRERETON
Department of History
The University of the West Indies
St. Augustine, Trinidad & Tobago

In August 1823, the east coast of the British mainland colony of Demerara (now part of Guyana) was convulsed by a major slave rebellion, involving between 9,000 and 12,000 slaves and about sixty plantations. It was one of the three "late" Anglo-Caribbean slave uprisings, and along with the rebellions in Barbados in 1816 and in Jamaica in 1831-32, it significantly affected the course of the abolition debate in Britain, accelerating the eventual passage of the Act of Emancipation in 1833. Emilia Viotti da Costa has given us an excellent full-length study of the Demerara uprising, which is likely to be recognized as the definitive work on the topic.

As she points out, the documentation on the events in Demerara in 1823 is abundant: missionary diaries and correspondence, the papers and publications of the London Missionary Society (LMS), records of the Colonial Office in London and the colonial government in Georgetown (including the rich papers of the Fiscals, who served in theory as Protectors of the Slaves in Demerara), letters and journals of those participating in the repression, voluminous trial records, Parliamentary inquiries and Blue Books, and colonial newspapers (of which Demerara, a colony with about 2,500 whites in 1823, had three). This abundance of source materials has made possible a richly detailed study, not only of the rebellion, but of the whole

world inhabited by slaves, planters, officials, and missionaries at the time. It has also led the author to a mild degree of verbal overkill, such as the lengthy description of John Smith's voyage out to Guyana, or the entire paragraph devoted to his problems with his horse and chaise; some judicious editing, this reviewer felt, would have produced a shorter book, and perhaps a better one. Yet the detailed narration and analysis, the thick description, add up to a powerful if lengthy reconstruction of a tragic story.

Viotti da Costa intends to tell that story from multiple points of view: those of the slaves (to the extent that the sources permit), the planters and their agents, and the missionaries, especially John Wray and John Smith, the two LMS ministers who worked in Demerara between 1808 and 1823. She refuses to see the slaves as "passive victims" of cruelty and oppression from their owners, as the missionaries often did, or as gullible children manipulated for sinister ends by anti-slavery preachers, as the planters claimed to. She weaves them into her analysis as fully conscious agents, developing an ideology of "rights" to be fiercely defended, and well aware of shifts in the balance of power in their favor during the years after 1808, including the arrival of the LMS men. Chapter 2 provides an excellent analysis of the situation of the Demerara slaves in the two decades before 1823. Since the colony definitively entered the British empire in 1803, massive capital investment, expansion of commodity production, and a post-1808 shift from cotton and coffee to sugar (still incomplete on the east coast in 1823), coinciding with the end of slave imports from Africa in 1806, had all led to a deterioration in the slaves' lives. The managers required longer hours and a faster pace of work, they gave less time for provision cultivation and fewer allowances of food, "privileges" were cut back, supervision was made more intense, and sales and family separations became more frequent. All this amounted to a serious encroachment of the slaves' "rights." Demerara slaves protested vigorously (at times with success) against these encroachments, to managers and owners, "attorneys" and the Fiscals; for, as Viotti da Costa puts it, "while masters dreamt of total power and blind obedience, slaves perceived slavery as a system of reciprocal obligations." And the "rights" were expanded whenever circumstances changed and the balance of power shifted: the arrival of the missionaries allowed them to publicly claim the "right" to have Sundays off and to attend chapel on Sundays and on weekday nights.

Despite the limitations of the sources, Viotti da Costa is able to unravel the ideologies of the Demerara slaves in the last decades of slavery. The documentation is far fuller, of course, on the ideologies of the LMS missionaries, and Chapters 3 and 4 explore the mental world of Wray and Smith, as well as that of their superiors in England. The tensions in the

missionary discourse in a slave society – equality before God and brotherhood of all believers *versus* submission to masters – are brilliantly dissected, as is the wide gap between the intent of the message preached by Wray and Smith and its reception by the slaves. These tensions, and that gap, made the path of the men of God precarious indeed. In the years of Smith's ministry in Demerara (1817-23), events in both the Caribbean and Britain polarized the slave societies. Threatened by anti-slavery and irritated by "interference" from London and from the missionaries, the whites saw the LMS men as their enemies; 1823 would provide an opportunity for vengeance.

The second half of the book – Chapters 5, 6, and 7 – narrate and analyze the events immediately before the actual uprising of August 1823, the course of the rebellion, the repression and the trials (including that of John Smith), and the repercussions of the whole episode in the Caribbean and Britain. Viotti da Costa provides an immensely detailed reconstruction of the events, again from "multiple points of view," giving full weight to the ideas, aims, and actions of the men who planned and led the uprising. The basic "cause" of the revolt was the inherent desire to be free, but rebellion "crystallised" along the east coast of Demerara in August 1823 for three main reasons. First, there was the steady deterioration of the slaves' working lives and the encroachments on their "rights" ever since 1803, but accelerating since 1816. Second was their appropriation of some of the missionary rhetoric for their own purposes, and their new sense that they had powerful allies (the King, Massa Wilberforce, and Smith and his colleagues). And third, rumors swept Demerara, in weeks before August 1823, that the King had sent "new laws" to the colony, laws which either granted complete freedom or, at the least, guaranteed three free days each week, and which were being withheld by the planters.

The evidence does not suggest that the leaders wanted to seize the colony, destroy the plantations, or eliminate the whites. Rather, they intended to force the governor to grant freedom or (at a minimum) three free days. White men were put in the stocks and sometimes whipped or beaten, but not killed (except in two or three cases when they fired on the rebels). The reprisals, inevitably, were brutal, and Viotti da Costa tells the grisly story well. Nearly 300 slaves were killed by the troops or "executed" after "trials" in the field or later in Georgetown, heads were impaled along the public roads, and Quamina's corpse was hung in chains outside his plantation, in savage "rituals of terror." Smith himself was tried for high treason and sentenced to death; he died in jail awaiting news of a pardon from the King. This, of course, became a *cause célèbre*, and it was Smith who became the great "martyr" of Demerara or (viewed from the opposite

side) the villain of the piece. Smith had won his "crown of glory," but let us give the last word to the slaves, who told the governor on the first day of the rising: "God had made them of the same flesh and blood as the whites; they were tired of being slaves; their good King had sent order that they should be free; and they would not work anymore."

13 Chapters of a History of Belize. ASSAD SHOMAN. Belize City: Angelus, 1994. xviii + 344 pp. (Paper US\$ 12.50)

GRANT D. JONES
Department of Anthropology & Sociology
Davidson College
Davidson NC 28036, U.S.A.

This book is, to the best of my knowledge, the first comprehensive, scholarly social and political history of Belize by a Belizean. Assad Shoman's political and educational role in modern Belizean history provides him a unique perspective as an "insider." Trained in law and international relations in the United Kingdom, between 1971 and 1984, he served as Head of the Belizean Independence Secretariat, Attorney General, Senator, and Representative, holding three cabinet ministries. Abandoning party politics in 1985, he has since been active in popular political and social education through his work with a Belize-based NGO, Society for the Promotion of Education and Research (SPEAR).

Shoman's previous writings include *Land in Belize, 1751-1981* (with O. Nigel Bolland), two school textbooks on Belizean history and social policy, and articles on foreign and domestic policy. With the exception of *Land in Belize*, however, his work is not well known outside the country. *13 Chapters of a History of Belize*, while addressed to a Belizean audience in particular, is compelling material for those concerned not only with Belize but also the comparative history of British colonialism and the political struggles for defining national identities in the post-independence era.

Chapter 1 synthesizes recent ethnohistorical research that challenges claims that Belize had little or no colonial history before the British came. Extending Belizean history back to the Spanish conquest and colonization of a pre-existing Maya population, Shoman concludes that, contrary to popular belief, the contemporary Mayas of Belize have a deep history in the country. In Chapter 2 he describes how a small number of logwood and mahogany cutters, squatters with origins in British piracy, managed

during the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries to establish a system of Town Meetings that legitimized monopoly land holdings "in which a dozen men controlled most of the land and the slaves" (p. 27). He introduces social themes to which he returns throughout the book, including the role of women and exploited minority populations (in this case the resident Mayas) as forces of both active and passive resistance. His account of the 1798 Spanish-British "Battle of St. George's Caye" contradicts still-held myths, rooted in the dominant colonial culture, that loyal, grateful slaves risked their lives for their British masters.

Chapter 3 emphasizes the cruelty of the slavery system of Belize, the extent of slave rebellions and escapes to neighboring countries and maroon communities, and the repressiveness of post-emancipation labor practices. By the time of the establishment of the Crown Colony in 1871 Belizean everyday political and economic life was dominated by a small minority elite of "free coloureds," later labeled "Creoles," whose power was defined by individual wealth (Chapter 4). Their monopolistic role was further strengthened through the support of colonial authorities in the face of the arrival of new, sometimes resistant, populations of Garifuna, Maya, and Spanish-speaking people that increased the colony's population tenfold by 1900 (Chapters 4-5).

Shoman then describes (Chapter 6-8) the process by which metropolitan political and economic (largely agricultural) interests (first British, then primarily U.S.) gained increasing control over Belize beginning in the nineteenth century. These colonial interests enabled both Creole cultural formation and Creole domination over other ethnic groups. Although a series of workers' riots and organized movements ultimately led to the formation of the first Belizean workers' union in 1939, the growth of the nationalist movement, described in Chapter 9, resulted in a de-emphasis on class struggle. The result was a new middle-class (i.e. Creole) agenda that emphasized self-government and fostered the rise of political parties but failed to challenge the economic and racial inequities of the status quo.

Chapter 10, a richly informative account of attempts to pluralize the now self-ruling political process during the 1960s, concludes that little was accomplished other than an increased political awareness through challenges to "the prevailing system." Furthermore, the issue of Guatemalan claims to Belize – which dominated, unproductively, much of the political rhetoric during this period – has continued to work against positive political development and social reform even since Belize's achievement of independence in 1981 (Chapter 11). The final two chapters assess the problems facing a country with an entrenched political culture eager to respond positively to global pressures for privatization and liberalized

foreign trade but slow to address deep and troubling social issues. Shoman raises the specter of a state that responds to poverty-driven urban crime by force, concluding with an impassioned call for an increasing activism by new "civil society" and "social" movements in "reopening the questions of power and of democracy in society" and defining "a radical change of consciousness" (p. 317). Of these forces he cites the feminist movement as being particularly "indispensable" in articulating such challenges.

Shoman follows his theoretical thread consistently, writes with powerful conviction, and makes historical details come alive. It therefore seems inevitable that this book will have a profound impact on a country as small as Belize. Although many of his historical interpretations will agitate and anger some national readers, his success in addressing issues in terms that are accessible and interesting to younger and politically disaffected readers will undoubtedly generate some of the intense intellectual political debate that he wishes for. At the same time, this is a book with genuinely scholarly merit, incorporating the greater body of recent research and writing, including unpublished dissertation research. It is one of those rare popular works that future historians will not be able to ignore – and that will be part of Belize's political discourse for some time to come.

REFERENCE

SHOMAN, ASSAD & O. NIGEL BOLLAND, 1977. *Land in Belize, 1765-1871*. Kingston: Institute of Social and Economic Research, University of the West Indies.

Tobago in Wartime 1793-1815. K.O. LAURENCE. Kingston: The Press, University of the West Indies, 1995. viii + 280 pp. (Paper J\$ 290, US\$ 13.00)

DONALD WOOD
Institute of Commonwealth Studies
University of London
London WC1B 5DS, United Kingdom

A scholarly study of a small West Indian colony during the Napoleonic wars is welcome on several counts. In the first place smaller territories have usually been neglected by Caribbean historians in favor of the larger ones. To have an analytical study of Tobago in its own right, and not merely

languishing in the shadow of Trinidad, helps to redress the balance. Moreover Keith Laurence entwines two important strands of the historian's art in this well-researched book. The more usual in West Indian historical writing these days is an internal analysis of a society at a time of deep change. The ending of the slave trade in 1807 was upset enough for all the British colonies, however sturdy they were. But Tobago was a young, even pioneering, plantation economy that was only just settling down after the Seven Years' War following a century or so of short-lived and often anarchical occupations by Kurlanders, Dutch, French, and British and, twice indeed, by pirates. But the rivalry had narrowed down before the French Revolution to the formidable colonial contest between Britain and France.

The French, who had acquired Tobago in 1783 by the Treaty of Versailles, lost it to the British in 1793. The usual tensions which fester in slave plantation societies were now heightened by the unpredictable complications of a long global war. The effects of this on Tobago form the second strand of the analysis. If the first strand bends inward to examine slave society and race relations, the consultation and government, the economy, and religion (or the lack of it), the second returns to the broad horizons of Admiral Mahan and to the eighteenth-century world of diplomacy, trade and war where the chart of the Caribbean Sea, delineating rich shores and islands, would be unrolled in European chancelleries whenever there was a whiff of crisis.

Although no Gibraltar or Cape of Good Hope, Tobago was an attractive pawn in the grand strategy of war, and more so than its size warranted. With its defensible and sheltered Man of War Bay (the name itself is telling), Tobago lies to the windward of Trinidad, Grenada, and St. Vincent, and holding it was strategically useful in the days of sail. But Tobago was at the same time a slave society and therefore doubly full of forebodings. At one moment the English colonists dreaded the effects on their plantations of the short-lived abolition of slavery in the early passions of the French Revolution; then again, as familiar trading patterns became disrupted, they fretted at the dearth of American provisions or at delays to the convoys bringing Irish beef and potatoes, and English manufactures, the early fruits of the Industrial Revolution; at other times panicky rumors spread of a French squadron in the offing to reinforce the usual swarm of privateers. And the whites knew that what happened on far battlefields, such as Austerlitz or Jena, might well have a bearing on their own future during the give and take of a peace conference.

It is clear from Laurence's account that the society of Tobago was balanced on a knife edge because of its small size as well as by the war.

In 1794 there were only about 400 whites of whom about 50 were French, and some 240 free coloreds of whom only about 70 were males; there were about 16,000 slaves. The garrison, often sickly, would barely suffice against either insurrection or invasion; it was hard to find suitable candidates for public office. It was a far cry from the feverish bustle of wartime Jamaica or the economic boom in the conquered Dutch colonies of Berbice and Demerara.

The Governor, Sir William Young, received no despatches from London between February 1808 and February 1813 apart from one disallowing two Acts in 1809; a precocious example of the later imperial doctrine of leaving things to the man on the spot. Nevertheless Young went on sending his own to London, however dispiriting it may have been. These despatches and the other papers of this able man are valuable primary sources for Tobago and they are well used in this readable book.

Tobago in Wartime happily complements Jean-Claude Nardin's study of an earlier phase in the history of Tobago.

REFERENCE

NARDIN, JEAN-CLAUDE, 1969. *La mise en valeur de l'isle de Tabago (1763-1783)*. Paris: Mouton.

Montserrat: History of a Caribbean Colony. HOWARD A. FERGUS. London: Macmillan Caribbean, 1994. x + 294 pp. (Paper £12.95)

TREVOR BURNARD
Department of History
University of Canterbury
Private Bag 4800, Christchurch, New Zealand

Montserrat has not, until this book, been honored by a general history. For this reason alone, Howard Fergus's concise, well-written, and informative study is very welcome. That it is lively in tone, judicious in its treatment of the major events in Montserrat's history, and the result of a considerable amount of archival research and personal knowledge by a Montserratian privy to insider information makes this work an important addition to the small literature on the small islands of the Lesser Antilles.

Howard Fergus is a native son of Montserrat and a man of some distinction in politics and education. His book is intended for the general

reader, especially Montserratians, and will serve well as a school text. But it also has much of interest for specialists in Caribbean history. In particular, Fergus helps to isolate not only the ways in which Montserrat's history fits into the normal pattern of West Indian development (European invasion and settlement, sugar and slavery, emancipation and economic diversification, the rise of working class movements, and some cultural and political nationalism), but also how Montserrat is different and how variety as much as similarity marks the history of Caribbean islands.

There are four ways in which Montserrat's history is different from the history of, say, Barbados or Antigua. The first relates to its small size and, more importantly, its peculiar geography. Although sugar was grown in Montserrat, the island was not ideal for that crop. Limited arable land, dangerous proximity to predations from the French, rapid soil exhaustion, and the relative attraction of other crops such as cotton, meant that sugar had a relatively brief ascendancy, declining in importance as early as the 1730s. Second, the presence of considerable numbers of Irish settlers until the end of slavery gave Montserrat an interesting ethnic complexity. In many ways, the Irish functioned much like free blacks or Jews elsewhere in the Caribbean – politically excluded, concentrated in activities outside sugar production, and forming a not always trustworthy middle group between English planters and African slaves. Fergus, undoubtedly correctly, dismisses the long-term influence of Irish settlers on Montserrat culture but, although the Irish failed to make an impact over the long run, their importance in the short term as a free but not dominant alternative to English models and English power makes Montserrat especially interesting for scholars interested in class, race, and ethnicity in plantation societies. As Fergus notes, the Irish, concentrated in the south of the island, were a colony within a colony with this area more similar to southern St. Domingue and the Jamaican interior than to Antigua or Barbados.

Another difference occurred after emancipation. In Fergus's best chapter, on establishing a free society, he describes why a free peasantry was slow to develop, blaming this mainly on *métairie*, a system of sharecropping, and on the backwardness of Montserrat in terms of technology and education. Interestingly, he gives much credit in this difficult period to the Montserrat Company, the largest employer in the island and a model example of benevolent capitalism. One of the strengths of this book is Fergus's willingness to be fair to people and institutions that he does not necessarily agree with. This evenhandedness is most apparent where Fergus dwells (perhaps excessively) on the recent history of Montserrat. His nuanced discussion of the virtues and vices of William Bramble, the charismatic unionist and political leader, is especially good. In this section, the

distinctive feature is Montserrat's continued commitment to colonialism. Montserrat remains colonial partly because of its size but mainly because of the constitutional safeguards and economic benefits that attachment to Britain brings. One criticism of this book might be the limited attention that is paid to Montserrat's relationship with Britain and the wider Caribbean. Another is the inadequate index and an occasional lapse into circumlocution near the end of the work. Yet these minor criticisms should not detract from what is a stimulating and thoughtful history of a small but not insignificant island.

The Spanish-American War: Conflict in the Caribbean and the Pacific, 1895-1902. JOSEPH SMITH. London: Longman, 1994. ix + 262 pp. (Paper n.p.)

JOHN L. OFFNER
History Department
Shippensburg University
Shippensburg PA 17257, U.S.A.

Joseph Smith provides a well-written synthesis of the current literature on the Spanish-American War. Smith utilizes many more U.S. sources than Spanish ones, which results in a denser American account of the war; he gives much less attention to Spanish developments, and there is only a sketch of Cuban and Filipino military campaigns. More attention is paid to Cuba than to the Philippines. Although the title specifies a period from 1895 to 1902, three fourths of the text is devoted to 1898 events. The monograph is primarily a military history of 1898; it contains a brief overview of the causes of the war and a summary look at the results of the war in Cuba and the Philippines. There is very little from 1895 to 1898 on the Spanish-Cuban War, and almost nothing on the American-Filipino War from 1899 to 1902.

The monograph, part of the *Modern Wars in Perspective* series edited by B.W. Collins and H.M. Scott, is a narrative description of the war and contains little analysis. Smith does speculate, however, that the U.S. concentration of troops and frontal attack on the Spanish defenses of Santiago de Cuba foreshadowed the massive First World War assaults on fixed positions with large losses of life. Countering this interpretation, Smith details the efforts of General William Shafter to negotiate the surrender of Santiago, the decision of General Nelson Miles to invade

southern Puerto Rico in order to avoid an assault on Puerto Rican fortifications, and the success of Admiral George Dewey in arranging a token bombardment and assault on Manila that led to a Spanish surrender of the city. These diplomatic and military maneuvers show that U.S. military commanders sought to avoid direct attacks on heavily defended positions that might have resulted in large losses of American lives. Thus, the argument that the Spanish-American War foreshadowed the catastrophic combat of World War I is not well sustained.

In handling the various controversial issues of the U.S. war effort, Smith tends to avoid issues; he is slow to condemn and often sympathetic to the Americans. He depicts President William McKinley as being in charge of policy and generally effective in his role. He understands the difficulties the U.S. War Department faced in mobilizing and prosecuting the war. National politics placed constraints on the McKinley administration, time was short, and military experience was lacking. Given these problems, the War Department rapidly trained and equipped a large army that effectively invaded distant lands. Smith views Secretary of War Russell Alger with more understanding than most Americans were willing to concede by the end of 1898. As for the failure of cooperation and coordination of the senior army and navy officers in Cuba, Smith takes no sides. He also avoids altogether the bitter Sampson-Schley controversy over the naval battle of Santiago de Cuba that tarnished the U.S. victory. Nothing is said about the deplorable marksmanship of the U.S. Navy during the Santiago battle, nor is there any criticism of Theodore Roosevelt and Shafter over the Round Robin letter that so disturbed McKinley as peace negotiations got underway with Spain. Smith is less sympathetic toward the Spanish conduct of the war; he questions the Spanish naval tactics at Manila and Santiago de Cuba and the army's failure in Cuba.

This volume contains an excellent annotated bibliography of the major works on the war. It does not, however, provide adequate maps. The five maps are insufficient to follow many of the events noted in the text. The Cuban map omits provincial boundaries and the reader may mistake provincial capitals for provinces of the same name. The battle maps for Santiago de Cuba and Manila provide no information on geographic features, roads, trails, fortifications, or troop placements and movements. For more comprehensive geographic information, the reader should consult David Trask's *The War with Spain in 1898*, which this volume does not supersede. Nevertheless, Smith offers a readable account that is consistent with the current scholarly literature on the Spanish-American War.

REFERENCE

TRASK, DAVID F., 1981. *The War with Spain in 1898*. New York: Macmillan.

Ancient Caribbean. JOHN M. WEEKS & PETER J. FERBEL. New York: Garland, 1994. lxxi + 325 pp. (Cloth US\$ 60.00)

LOUIS ALLAIRE
Department of Anthropology
University of Manitoba
Winnipeg, Manitoba Canada R3T 5V5

Caribbean prehistory, archaeology, and early ethnohistory are essentially the subject of this research tool/bibliography, recently published as part of a collection on ancient civilizations (for which the concept of "Ancient" is perhaps more appropriate) by Weeks and Ferbel. Such a book would be reason enough to celebrate with anticipation were it not its many incongruities which are surprising from a collection supposed to be in the hands of proper specialists. Neither of the two co-authors have to my knowledge any connection with Caribbean studies.

This drawback is painfully evident in the treatment of the subject which is limited to the West Indian islands, yet inconsistently includes the Dutch islands of Curaçao, Bonaire, and Aruba (which belong to another part of the continent) in association with the small Dutch island of Saba in the Lesser Antilles. The book is essentially an annotated bibliography with comments, organized under various divisions and headings. It begins with a summary of the "Ancient" period in the Caribbean past; the authors' discussion of prehistory and archaeology appears to be derived essentially from a recent book by Rouse (1992) on the Tainos, but with some painful misunderstandings. Certainly, there was never a connecting land bridge between the islands and the continent at any time during its human past, as the authors seem to believe, to explain its initial peopling; the description of settlement distribution in the Lesser Antilles as being found "on the banks of fertile river valleys" only reveals the authors' lack of familiarity with these insular landscapes.

Emphasis is on English-language references, but a considerable number of sources in Spanish, and some in French (as well as one untranslated Russian title, the first entry in the book!) are included. The book's many limitations are better summarized than listed in their entirety. There is a

constant failure to emphasize major significant sources. Naive nineteenth-century publications are often listed indiscriminately alongside sophisticated modern works. There is total inconsistency in providing comments and annotations. And what guided the authors in their selection of titles to be annotated (I would guess less than half the entries) remains a mystery. More damaging, their annotation efforts are often limited to a mere paraphrase of the titles; as one example among many, the annotation for a paper by Rouse entitled "The concept of series in Bahamian archaeology" reads: "a discussion of the series concept in Caribbean prehistory using examples from Bahamian archaeology" (entry 490, p. 100). Furthermore, a short one- or two-page paper published in a popular magazine is often presented as "major synthesis," whereas important recent works are left unheralded. Finally, there is the irritating practice of citing significant references in annotations of other titles, rather than as individual entries.

The organization by headings also suffers. Brief descriptions of stone tools figure under "Social evolution and development"; and an early paper of my own on the reptilian theme in Antillean art and mythology appears, to my surprise, under "Astronomy" (entry 461, p. 92), a subject about which I must profess a total ignorance.

There are certainly more missing references than can be readily accounted for. Among the most regrettable were some of the early chroniclers on the culture of the Caribs and Tainos (not separated in the text), as listed in the table of contents, and neither the major author on Carib culture, Father Breton nor F. Du Tertre appears, although Breton's works are scattered elsewhere in various annotations. There are also some titles that do not belong to the book's subject, such as an obscure paper on "Carib hatchets" from Morocco. Curiously, the entire massive contents of the sixteen volumes of proceedings from the international congresses of Caribbean archaeology published since 1961 are presented by individual volumes (pp. 64-77), under the heading "New Directions." These often contain a wealth of papers of unique importance in view of the scarcity of publication outlets on Caribbean archaeology and ethnohistory, yet these papers are neither grouped elsewhere by headings nor annotated, which would have been helpful for research. One indeed wonders how this book was written: the shuffling of a few cards, or the pushing of a few buttons and keys?

Despite all the rather awkward aspects of this research tool, one major redeeming factor is found, almost by surprise, in the detailed chapter on Cuba (pp. 109-37). Here is an unexpected abundance of rare references which is, however, only half a blessing, considering that most of them are today practically impossible to find. Likewise, substantial sections on the

Dominican Republic and Puerto Rico will be useful. Once again, one is confronted with a work intended for a broad readership for which it is fundamentally misleading. I know from experience that the work has already been cited as the last authoritative statement on the subject. But only the discriminating specialist will be able to take full advantage of the book's more useful contributions. Yet, when it was time for me to seek bibliographical details for the reference listed below, I was not able to find it readily in the book and had to go to the original publication.

REFERENCE

ROUSE, IRVING, 1992. *The Tainos: Rise and Decline of the People who Greeted Columbus*. New Haven: Yale University Press.

The United States and the Caribbean. ANTHONY P. MAINGOT. London: Macmillan Caribbean, 1994. xi + 260 pp. (Paper £13.96)

The Caribbean in the Global Political Economy. HILBOURNE A. WATSON (ed.). Boulder CO: Lynne Rienner, 1994. ix + 261 pp. (Paper US\$ 40.00)

AARON SEGAL
Department of Political Science
University of Texas
El Paso TX 79968, U.S.A.

These two recent books analyzing U.S.-Caribbean relations, and Caribbean options in the context of a changing world economy are less than satisfactory. Each relies overly on rhetoric and not enough on empirical studies.

Anthony Maingot is an accomplished and prolific watcher of the Caribbean. This time he loosely and incoherently stitches together two books in one. He adds to the confusion by defining the Caribbean as "the islands and the bordering mainland" while in the text skipping around between countries and leaving others out almost entirely.

The opening six chapters of U.S.-Caribbean history are neither chronological, nor coherent, nor comprehensive. Instead they begin in 1823, thus leaving out the important interactions during and after the American Revolution. The text almost totally ignores trade, economic aid, and politi-

cal and cultural relations in favor of focusing on U.S. covert and overt interventions in British Guiana, Guatemala, Cuba, and Costa Rica. The result is neither history nor analysis, but rather an offering of the author's personal views on a limited number of events. There is no use of publicly available U.S. diplomatic archives or of the recent talks between Russian and American participants concerning the Cuban missile crisis.

The five chapters on current problems are more interesting if also plagued by an arbitrary, poorly linked character. The best is a chapter on international narcotics trafficking in the Caribbean and its spreading of corruption. Alas, Maingot has nothing to say about what should be done, nor does he have any policy recommendations in a hasty chapter about the ills of offshore banking and financial services.

A chapter on migration and development sticks to the West Indies and its brain drain, leaving readers to guess what is happening elsewhere in the region. Here again, we read pastiche rather than a coherent essay. The chapter on Haiti has been overtaken by recent events, and fails to place Haiti in any Caribbean context in spite of the extensive involvement of some of the country's neighbors in its prolonged tragedy.

Maingot's conclusion discusses something called "sovereign consent" and proposes that the electorate in open elections, as in Puerto Rico, and not the political elites, should make the decisions on independence, autonomy, and colonial rule.

A major flaw of this book is its failure to discuss or explain U.S. policy-making processes toward the Caribbean and the involved players. There is no explanation of why and how U.S. policy has evolved, changed, and been implemented.

This quickie book also suffers from poor editing. The text is laden with names of hundreds of people who are never identified, not even in the footnotes. Page 246, for example, quotes Kenneth N. Waltz and Gunnar Myrdal without telling us who they are.

Editor Hilbourne Watson and twelve contributors purport to examine the current state of Caribbean economies and their future options in the light of a world economy hell-bent on a technological revolution. This is an attractive idea which does not work.

The key introduction describes a non-existent world economy totally dominated by breakthrough technological innovation. The reality is that in the mid-1990s high technology is responsible for only 25 percent of world trade, tourism and services account for 20 percent, and labor-intensive, manufactured goods remain a major export sector, as in China. Trevor Harker's sober chapter on the dismal West Indian economic performance during the 1990s helps make up for a poor introduction.

The chapters by Winston Griffith and Dennis Pantin on appropriate economic theory and techno-industrial policy are flops. Advocating that the West Indies upgrade its technologies to compete in global markets begs the question. Which technologies and with which human resources and infrastructures, and with what incentives? Amazingly, nowhere in this book is there an analysis of the current science and technology resources in the region, or a consideration of the role of the University of the West Indies, the most important research institution. Instead there is redundant rhetoric about the lack of technological entrepreneurs and the risk-aversion behavior of local "merchant capitalists."

Editor Watson provides a chapter on the Jamaican garment industry which calls for "technological restructuring" without ever spelling out what this would entail. Alex Dupuy contributes a chapter from his book to argue for a basic needs strategy as opposed to an export-oriented one in Haiti. He does not relate his proposed strategy to the theme of the book.

Two Cuban Central Bank economists manage, in their chapter, to blame everyone except the Cuban government for Cuba's current economic crisis. Their essay is blatant propaganda intended to convince readers that if only U.S. economic sanctions were lifted, Cuba would be prosperous. Watson looks at the semi-conductor industry in Barbados as another example of the need for national technological restructuring without an indication of how this can be done or what it would involve. Much of his work and that of other contributors ignores the studies of "learning by doing" via shop-floor, incremental technological progress rather than via breakthroughs.

An informed chapter by Cecilia Green sketches the historical status of West Indian working women to the present. When she pleads for placing gender relations "at the center of any program of social transformation," this reader had no idea what she meant. Rhetoric is no substitute for ideas.

Chapters by Linden Lewis and Lawrence Nurse discuss the effects of privatization on Caribbean economies and trade unions. The failure to generate or use empirical data from the region makes their proposals vacuous. Why have so many public enterprises in the West Indies operated with long-term losses and what should be done about this in economies in recession? All the pontificating about the dangers of privatization fails to address ugly, long-standing realities.

Three Puerto Rican economists contribute a helpful, empirically based chapter on how Puerto Rico has used tax shelters to extend economic and technological ties to the other islands. They have doubts as to whether this can continue but at least they explain what has happened and why, and who has benefited.

The conclusion by editor Watson is redundant. It is another plea for a technological restructuring of Caribbean economies to enable them to compete in a global economy. Again there is no explanation of how this is to be done or what economic sectors should be targeted – only a laundry list of false and real obstacles.

A changing world economy absorbing technological changes, most incremental, does require the Caribbean to respond. However, this book does not consider the response of tourism, the leading industry in the region, or the promising export of services. It is focused, to the extent that it is focused, on the assembly plant export of components. The need to build with limited resources an indigenous technological capability for exports scarcely rates a mention and there is no discussion of how it can be achieved.

These books are especially disappointing because they are by proven, competent academics deeply concerned with the future of the Caribbean. Perhaps the exigencies of commercial publishing have led them to write too fast in a rhetorical mode without doing the needed empirical homework.

The Myth of the Male Breadwinner: Women and Industrialization in the Caribbean. HELEN I. SAFA. Boulder CO: Westview, 1995. xvi + 208 pp. (Cloth US\$ 55.00, Paper US\$ 18.95)

BILL MAURER
Department of Anthropology
University of California
Irvine CA 92697, U.S.A.

What are the implications of women's entry into the industrial workforce for their empowerment at the level of the household, workplace, and political arena? Helen Safa's book compares the experiences of women in Puerto Rico, the Dominican Republic, and Cuba to provide an insightful commentary on the gendered dimensions of the international division of labor. She documents changes in women's status as Puerto Rico and the Dominican Republic moved from import-substitution to export-led industrialization, and as Cuba adopted "material incentives" and market reforms. The book is based on survey data supplemented by interviews with women garment and textile workers. In all three countries, Safa finds that the primary locus of women's subordination has shifted from the "private

patriarchy” of husbands and fathers, to the “public patriarchy” of the workplace and political arena where the “myth of the male breadwinner” continues to dictate factory and state policy. The experience of wage work has given women new authority in their homes. While this new-found voice has not translated itself into successful political action, it has provided women with a sense of self-worth in increasingly trying economic times. As one woman remarked, “a person who works has rights” (pp. 84-85).

The book is divided into six chapters. The first outlines state policies and industrialization patterns. The second addresses changing forms of patriarchy in the Caribbean, from the *casa/calle* distinction that relegated women to the domestic sphere, to occupational segregation in the workplace and unresponsive unions and political parties. The third, fourth, and fifth chapters deal with Puerto Rico, the Dominican Republic, and Cuba, respectively. The sixth summarizes the book’s findings and relates them to other research on women and industrialization.

Among the more important variables for understanding women’s empowerment and subordination within and across the three cases are international trade relationships, state policies, women’s marital status, women’s age cohort, and men’s economic marginalization. State policy in all three countries helped determine the levels and character of women’s labor force participation. The failure of Puerto Rico’s Operation Bootstrap after fuel price increases in the 1970s led the state to retool industry toward export and service provision. The end of U.S. sugar import quotas in the 1980s led to the Dominican currency devaluation, which in turn encouraged export manufacturing by reducing the cost of labor. In Cuba, state efforts to mitigate women’s “double day” and guarantee shared responsibility for housework failed along with the sugar crop in the 1970s. “Material incentives” replaced “moral” ones, and, together with market reforms and the collapse of the Soviet Union, further hindered women’s full participation in the public arena.

Where women’s earnings essentially replace those previously garnered by men, as in Puerto Rico and the Dominican Republic, conjugal instability often results and women find themselves bearing the burden of providing for their household. Where women and men together provide for the household, women find themselves in a better position in relation to men (p. 183). Yet across the board, women still subscribe to an ideology that places their contributions as mothers and housewives above their contributions as breadwinners and workers. In Puerto Rico, Safa finds younger women more concerned with their own personal advancement than worker solidarity while older women who tend to be heads of households

resist remarriage but are also cynical and isolated (pp. 81-82). In the Dominican Republic, women maintained that unions were men's business, and married women who contributed to the household economy and gained authority because of it still viewed men as the household heads (p. 114). Meanwhile, "the erosion of the man's role as economic provider has led some men to tighten their control over women" (p. 118) and some women to subscribe to a patriarchal view of women's place even as they themselves do not rest easily within it. In Cuba, the Revolution led to greater sexual freedom and a greater awareness of women's issues. But sexual freedom meant more children at an earlier age, while housing shortages produced three-generation households. Three-generation households tend to increase the authority of elders and, with it, a more traditional sexual division of household labor (pp. 135, 143). With more women in each household, men feel little pressure to share in domestic tasks, despite a Family Code requiring their contribution to household labor (p. 136). Although women in Cuba enjoy a greater public presence than women in Puerto Rico or the Dominican Republic through the Communist Party, unions, and mass organizations, they nevertheless tend to place their domestic responsibilities above their paid labor.

The argument that wage work increases women's liberation and sense of individual rights is a familiar one. It has been criticized by feminists who argued that women lost the power they had had in kin-based societies when they were drawn into an industrial work force which may have paid them wages, but at a level insufficient to maintain a household without a husband. Safa makes a significant contribution to this debate in three ways. First, by illuminating women's experience of industrialization in the periphery, she rectifies its European and American focus. Second, by emphasizing the international economic system in which women find jobs and make life decisions, she shows that the debate cannot simply be addressed from a local or a national perspective. Third, and most important, by focusing on changing models of industrialization, she highlights international patterns of inequality and the state policies and practices responsible for them. The theoretical debate between those who see wage work as emancipatory and those who see it as robbing women of their traditional authority is shifted to new terrain and considerably enriched. Safa, documenting the effects of the new global feminization of labor, shows that the impact of paid labor is contradictory for women, increasing their economic autonomy while leaving intact the myth of the male breadwinner and women's responsibilities in the home.

The Trouble in Suriname, 1975-1993. EDWARD M. DEW. Westport CT: Praeger, 1994. xv + 243 pp. (Cloth US\$ 55.00)

PETER MEEL

Nederlandse Organisatie voor Wetenschappelijk Onderzoek

Postbus 93120

2509 AC The Hague, the Netherlands

The Trouble in Suriname is the long awaited sequel to *The Difficult Flowering of Surinam*, Edward Dew's well-known and much consulted study, published in 1978. The latter work provides a sound description of Suriname's political developments in the decades preceding independence. Drawing upon pioneering achievements by Arend Lijphart, Dew uses the concept of consociationalism (i.e. government by a multiparty, multiethnic "elite cartel") to explain cross-ethnic resource and power sharing in Suriname politics. He aptly demonstrates that the initial success of consociationalism, guaranteeing reasonable stability in the 1958-67 period, was superseded by ethnic polarization in the years following 1967. The disruption of parliamentary democracy came to a head around 1975, when the country obtained sovereignty. Yet, in the concluding chapter of that book, Dew displayed confidence in Suriname politicians returning to consociationalism.

In this more recent study Dew chronicles the events covering the bridal days of sovereignty, the military-led administration between 1980 and 1987, and the subsequent process of redemocratization. The similarities with his earlier volume are striking. There is the same well-informed guide, skillfully disclosing the complex functioning of race, class, and ideology in a small-scale society. Newspaper clippings and interviews constitute his main sources. The title of the book refers to his principal interest: "inescapable ethnicity" as the major force in politics. According to Dew, the irony of Suriname's recent history lies in the fact that the military takeover of 1980 was meant to transcend ethnic politics, but produced excesses and failures ultimately leading to the restoration of consociationalism. In his opinion the formation of the (New) Front for Democracy and Development and its victory in the 1987 and 1991 elections are convincing proof of this.

Since it offers a lucid and rather detailed account of Suriname's post-independence history, *The Trouble in Suriname* will definitely attract an audience interested in the republic's present-day complications. Those readers will particularly benefit from the book's qualities as a reference work. However, it does not analyze or evaluate the intricate decolonization process Suriname has been experiencing since 1975. Indeed, ref-

erences to this process are few. This is partly due to Dew's working method. He tends to stick to his sources, reconstructing Suriname's domestic affairs minutely. Only occasionally does he manage to rise above his material and dissociate himself from the sequence of daily events. Moreover, the concept of consociationalism may be useful to describe some aspects of the twenty years under discussion, but proves inadequate to answer the major questions involved.

For instance, in what way must the military interregnum be perceived with respect to Suriname's decolonization process? Did the military contribute to this process, developing institutions at the local level, raising consciousness about the poor and dispossessed, boosting patriotism and nationalism, and pointing out the dangers of ethnic politics? If so, should Bouterse's NDP be viewed as the legitimate successor to Bruma's PNR? Or did the military hamper the decolonization of society, considering its impressive record of corruption and human rights violations? If so, in what way did these actions affect the country and its people and what are their long term consequences?

Another question: how are the traditional political parties to be judged with respect to Suriname's decolonization process? Did they remain passive between 1980 and 1985 (apart from entering into secret negotiations with each other and the military), or were they developing scenarios intended to avoid the failures of the past and to move towards genuine political reform? Are their activities since 1985 a simple continuation of pre-"revolutionary" strategies, or do they, mainly as a consequence of friction between civilians and the military, represent an altered view on statecraft and politics?

And what about the manoeuvres of the former mother country? To what extent did the Dutch-Suriname relations frustrate or ease the process of decolonization? Was The Hague correct in suspending the development cooperation in 1982 or did this merely damage a country already under severe pressure? What does the Frame Treaty concerning Friendship and Closer Cooperation, which the Netherlands and Suriname concluded in 1992, imply? A return to semi-colonial standards or a decisive step in the direction of a constructive partnership? In the book these questions are neither posed nor investigated systematically.

Dew should be credited for his acknowledgment that *The Trouble in Suriname* primarily scratches the surface and provides scholars challenges for deeper and more meaningful analyses. Accordingly, his work can be appreciated as a starting point and stimulus for further investigation, not only on ethnicity or consociationalism, but on decolonization in the widest sense of the term.

REFERENCE

DEW, EDWARD M., 1978. *The Difficult Flowering of Surinam: Ethnicity and Politics in a Plural Society*. The Hague: Nijhoff.

The Last Cacique: Leadership and Politics in a Puerto Rican City. JORGE HEINE. Pittsburgh PA: University of Pittsburgh Press, 1993. ix + 310 pp. (Cloth US\$ 49.95)

HENRY WELLS
Department of Political Science
University of Pennsylvania
Philadelphia PA 19104, U.S.A.

In *The Last Cacique*, Jorge Heine provides an insightful appraisal of the career of Benjamín Cole (1919-93), who was for twenty-four years the mayor of Mayagüez, the principal city of the western third of Puerto Rico. During the last sixteen years of Mayor Cole's tenure, he was also one of the major figures of the Popular Democratic Party islandwide.

The first chapter of Heine's book reads like the work of a talented young scholar who has not yet recovered from having written a doctoral dissertation. By Chapter 4, however, Heine is well launched upon an absorbing account of Benjamín Cole's rise from poverty and obscurity to political domination and wealth. Heine aptly describes Cole's life as "one of the most fascinating political success stories in modern Puerto Rico" (p. 3).

Early on he suggests that Cole's formidable self-sufficiency and independence may have derived in part from his view of himself as an "outsider": although Cole's mother was Puerto Rican, his father was born in the United States. It was as a sergeant in the U.S. Army, Heine tells us, that Frank Cole participated in the 1898 invasion of western Puerto Rico. He remained there as a telegrapher when the war was over and in due course married a young woman from Ponce. They established a home in Mayagüez, where Benjamín and his two brothers were born. Much older than his wife, Frank died soon after the arrival of their third child. His widow then married the owner of a small farm in Quemado, a hilly rural *barrio* of Mayagüez, which became the boyhood home of her young sons.

By 1932, when Benjamín was thirteen, times had become so hard that he had to drop out of school and try to earn money in the city. Soon reali-

zing that he needed more education, he persuaded the nun in charge of one of the best schools in Mayagüez to permit him to attend it without charge in return for working part-time for the school. A few years later he graduated with a diploma in commerce, which qualified him for a white-collar job.

According to Heine, Cole was eighteen years old and working in a Mayagüez bank when he fell under the spell of Luis Muñoz Marín, who was then in the process of organizing the Popular Democratic Party throughout the island. Eager to be of use, Cole helped found the "PDP Youth" in Mayagüez – and remained a loyal Popular Democrat for the rest of his life. In 1947 he received a patronage appointment to the post of city auditor, which he gave up after five years in order to enroll in the University of Puerto Rico in Río Piedras. By that time he was thirty-three, married, and the father of four children. Heine reports that in 1957 Cole graduated *magna cum laude*, but does not explain how he managed to complete the course with honors and at the same time provide for his family.

In the fall of his final year (1956), the PDP organization in Mayagüez nominated him as the party's candidate for election to Puerto Rico's House of Representatives in San Juan. He won the November election by a wide margin and took his seat in January 1957. From that moment on, Benjamín Cole held public office continuously until a few days before his death in January 1993 – a total of thirty-six years.

Heine reports that once in office Representative Cole "immediately developed an ambitious agenda of large and small projects for Mayagüez," such as new schools, roads, sewers, health care facilities, and port improvements. Moreover, he was tenacious in badgering government agencies to supply badly needed services to the rural barrios. Thanks to Cole's efforts, Heine tells us, "the island's first Work-Study Center was built in barrio Quemado" (p. 60). During his two terms in the House, water mains were extended for the first time to many rural barrios, new schools were built, public housing developments erected, and industrial parks established. Heine cites as "particularly remarkable" Cole's "readiness to question established procedures, to stand up to the House leadership, to step on toes, and generally to refuse to bow to the hallowed mores of the legislature" (p. 62-63).

In June 1964 Cole resigned his House seat in order to accept a better-paying and more prestigious position – that of postmaster of Mayagüez, a presidential appointment. Heine says that Cole took on his new duties "with the same zest and energy that he had shown in the House" (p. 65), but increasingly he hungered after the far greater prestige and power

attached to the office of mayor. Fulfilling that ambition required him to challenge and drive from office the very mayor who had appointed him city auditor. It also required Cole to risk violating the Hatch Act by openly engaging in political party activities while holding the federal office of postmaster, and to engage in legally doubtful tactics to win the August 1968 primary for the Popular Democratic nomination as candidate for mayor and then the election itself the following November. In the process, he had gained total control of the Popular Democratic Party in Mayagüez: he had become its *cacique*.

Once installed as mayor, Cole floated a \$3 million municipal bond issue which financed a host of construction projects: many more water mains were installed, sanitation facilities upgraded (including the purchase of a fleet of new garbage trucks), and rural roads extended and improved. In 1978, after recovering from a series of heart attacks that had sharply curtailed his activities, Cole plunged into a new round of public works projects, financed largely by federal grants, which "dramatically altered the face of the city" (p. 104). They included spacious and innovative parks, indoor and outdoor recreation facilities, a much-needed transportation terminal, and various handsome public buildings.

During the planning, construction, and administration of all this, Cole was increasingly aided by his second wife, Nereida Cole de Falto, who married Cole while she was still in high school. Heine describes her as "a feisty, combative woman some twenty years younger than her husband ... [who was] even more passionate about politics" (p. 124). She was in effect Cole's deputy.

Heine concludes his analysis of Cole with the observation that he was capable of imaginative long-range planning and of "seeing the inter-connection of the various components" of a project, but not interested in seeing projects through to their conclusion. Besides, his personal hang-ups were often counterproductive. Basically tight-fisted, even stingy, he insisted on paying minimum salaries to all city employees, no matter how able they were or how much their services were needed. He also insisted on making far too many decisions himself – even to the point of reading all the incoming mail. The result was what Heine calls "centralized procrastination."

Cuba at a Crossroads: Politics and Economics after the Fourth Party Congress. JORGE F. PÉREZ-LÓPEZ (ed.). Gainesville: University Press of Florida, 1994. xviii + 282 pp. (Cloth US\$ 39.95)

SUSAN ECKSTEIN
Department of Sociology
Boston University
Boston MA 02215, U.S.A.

Cuba at a Crossroads contains eleven articles that, with one exception, focus on trends in Cuba in the early 1990s. Written by scholars who are veterans of Cuban studies, most make the best of the all-too-sparse publicly available information.

The book includes two articles on domestic politics, one by Jorge Domínguez and the other by Juan M. del Aguila, and one on Cuba's international relations by Damián Fernández. There are also four essays on the domestic or inwardly-oriented aspects of the economy – by the late Sergio Roca (on import-substitution agriculture), Julie Feinsilver (on biotechnology), and Andrew Zimbalist (on managerial and other administrative reforms), and two on more externally oriented aspects of the economy – one on foreign investment by Pérez-López and one by María Dolores Espino, on foreign tourism. Finally, two articles focus on lessons from Eastern Europe, one by the volume's editor, and another on possible future Cuban economic scenarios by Archibald Ritter.

The book's title suggests that the Cuban Fourth Party Congress, held in 1991, was a turning point in contemporary Cuban development. Yet the Congress accounts for little of what has transpired in the 1990s. This demonstrates the relative autonomy of economics from politics, a theme not specifically addressed in the book.

Domínguez documents, in the classic Sovietology "who rules" tradition, the dramatic "changing of the guard" that has occurred in recent years. He provides interesting documentation of the ways that mass organizations (which in principle address concerns of the populace on a territorial and functional group basis), as well as women and blacks, are currently significantly underrepresented. The main change has been a generational shake-up: the average high-ranking functionary is now in his early forties. Domínguez infers from these changes that Castro considers youth, but not women and blacks, to be politically problematic; in essence, that leadership is selected first and foremost to coopt constituencies posing problems to the regime's legitimacy, not to represent institutional constituencies or to draw on the skills of the "best and the brightest."

Meanwhile, Domínguez infers that economics has diminished in importance because only two members of the Political Bureau at the time he wrote were officially in charge of economic policy making, and one of them, Carlos Lage, was trained as a doctor, not an economist. Thus, group underrepresentation is seen as a sign of social, economic, and political weakness, while overrepresentation is attributed to crisis-management. Domínguez, in essence, does not use a single basis of inference from his elite data.

Had Domínguez focused on what elites do with the positions they hold, rather than on their social background, his conclusions would have been different. Lage, for example, is the very influential chief architect of the economic transformation that the country is currently undergoing. Given that Cubans had been trained by the Soviets it may be a sign of strength, not weakness, that someone not steeped in Eastern bloc economies was selected to oversee the island's reintegration into the capitalist world economy. No one would question Che Guevara's revolutionary credentials merely because he too was trained as a doctor!

Domínguez also infers from his well-documented circulation of elites that power has become more personally concentrated in Castro. Yet other inferences are equally plausible. Perhaps power has become sufficiently institutionalized so that rule is embedded in formal office rather than "who rules" or, more likely, the changeover reflects a desperate effort to reestablish regime authority at a time of crisis. When the Soviet bloc caved in, Cuba could convey some sense of change too.

Domínguez does recognize that formal state-society relations have weakened and that society has become more disaffected. He notes that workers work less; membership in cooperatives has dropped (in the cooperatives formed of "privatized" state farms, discussed in detail by Roca); islanders have become more disenchanted with political institutions and more willing to express their dissatisfaction; and illegal activity and regime opposition have picked up.

The essays on the economy highlight cautious, incremental reforms, not a regime resistant to change owing to ideology, Party, or Castro orthodoxy. Roca discusses the failed efforts of the official import-substitution Food Program, begun before the collapse of Soviet aid and trade, but subsequently massively expanded. While the official program has died a quiet death since the book went to press, the government has selectively introduced market features that Roca considers the only viable alternative. And the need for capital and hard currency has led the government to court foreign investment and promote tourism on a large scale, as Pérez-López and Espino document very well. These changes are explained not

so much by the different ideological and other biases of the new elites described by Domínguez, but by new economic exigencies and – as none of the volume authors adequately analyze – pressures from society.

Cubans have not pressed for an explicit restoration of capitalism but the unintended consequences of individual and family accommodations to the crisis have been to push the regime in a reformist direction. In the early 1990s there was a proliferation of illegal and gray market activity, which included an illegal dollarization of the economy, a black market in retail trade, increased labor absenteeism (and resistance to partake in much needed farm work), and increased crime and prostitution. In response to these “everyday forms of resistance” (to borrow James Scott’s terminology), the government decriminalized dealing in dollars, sanctioned private markets to reign in the black market, legalized a range of private service activity, and introduced various material incentives to woo labor to agriculture.

The ongoing reform process helps explain why the Cuban regime, against all odds, survived the domino collapse of Soviet bloc Communism. Through everyday initiatives more than formal institutional channels islanders have been shaping the course of Cuban development. This collection of essays documents well many of the changes that occurred during the first years of adjustment to the “new world order,” even if they exaggerate the role of formal elites and formal institutions in engineering the process. The fact that the book is already somewhat dated, given the speed of changes in Cuba, makes the changes no less important to document.

Sexual Politics in Cuba: Machismo, Homosexuality, and AIDS. MARVIN LEINER. Boulder CO: Westview, 1994. xv + 184 pp. (Cloth US\$ 47.50, Paper US\$ 20.95)

DAVID A.B. MURRAY
Department of Anthropology
University of Adelaide
Australia

If we were to investigate post-Revolutionary Cuba’s treatment of homosexuals from the accounts of exiled gay Cubans such as Reinaldo Arenas’s memoir *Before Night Falls* (1993) or the film *Improper Conduct* (1984), we would come away with the view that this is one of the most

homophobic, intolerant societies in the modern world. According to these analyses, the socialist revolution in Cuba created a dictatorship which has only increased the persecution and incarceration of homosexuals.

Marvin Leiner has spent over twenty-five years studying educational and social change in Cuba. *Sexual Politics in Cuba* is an attempt to write an historical, balanced analysis of gender and sexuality in Cuban society. Leiner is clearly sympathetic toward the political, social, and economic goals of the Revolution, but he argues that the one-party system is today a "political strait-jacket" that prevents creative solutions to economic and social problems. This extends to the treatment of homosexuals and people with HIV/AIDS, the latter being described as "prisoners in a golden cage" due to their mandatory quarantine in state sanatoriums (p. 8).

In addition to seeing an overly restrictive political regime, Leiner argues that the power of the machismo ethic, a set of values defining manliness, must be recognized in shaping attitudes towards gender, sex, disease and – most important for Leiner – education. Despite the significant social and economic changes brought about through education, there have been few attempts to confront the principles of machismo and its inherent gendered and sexual inequalities. Machismo creates unequal relations between men and women and between men; it promotes prejudice against homosexuals; and it perpetuates ignorance about AIDS.

The opening chapters of *Sexual Politics in Cuba* provide a brief historical context to the Cuban Revolution, the origins of machismo, and attitudes toward homosexuality in Cuba. Leiner chronicles the dangerous combination of revolutionary politics and machismo's deeply engrained homophobia which resulted in the development of Military Units to Aid Production (UMAP) camps in 1965. Homosexuals were interned in these "rehabilitation" camps in order to develop behavior that would be in accordance with the public definition of good citizenship (pp. 28-29).¹ Leiner also outlines educational and medical approaches toward homosexuality, which, in the 1960s and 1970s emphasized homosexuality as a learned behavior which could therefore be corrected. This resulted in "color brigades" which divided school children into categories based on behavior. The yellow brigade was for boys with effeminate tendencies (pp. 33-34).

Chapters 3 and 4 focus on the development of sex education programs and attempts to change attitudes toward women and sexual relations between men and women, both of which are influenced by machismo. This section of the book fits poorly with the overall themes outlined in the introduction. The discussion of attempts to create equal rights for women does relate to the power of machismo, but it shifts the focus from a

sexuality-based definition of "sex" to a gendered one, and it sidetracks readers from the primary analysis revealing the interconnections between machismo, homosexuality, disease, and politics.

Chapter 5 is the most riveting and insightful section of the book. Leiner provides a sensitive yet critical evaluation of the Cuban government's policies toward AIDS. While recognizing the fact that Cuba has one of the lowest AIDS infection rates in the world (p. 127) and that all those who are infected receive excellent medical care, Leiner describes the mandatory quarantine program of all HIV positive people as one that is built out of ignorance, mistrust, and a basic denial of human rights. His portrayal of life in the AIDS sanatoriums describes how patients must earn the right to temporary leaves by proving they are "responsible." The terms and definitions of responsible behavior are, of course, open to subjective interpretations. This reveals the fundamental hypocrisy of the quarantine program – its assumption that people with the AIDS virus are morally irresponsible and must be quarantined for the protection of the public. Furthermore, the quarantine policy has contributed to ignorance about AIDS; many Cubans believe there are no risks since all HIV/AIDS carriers are behind sanatorium walls.

In his conclusion, Leiner advocates the development of culturally appropriate sexual and AIDS education programs, and cites the need to grant the freedom to assemble and form political and social organizations (p. 149). As appropriate as these recommendations may be, *Sexual Politics in Cuba* falls short in its prescriptive utility. The problem lies in the choice of informants: Most of Leiner's informants are educational, medical, and/or political leaders. From their testimonies, we are led to view the Cuban population as naive or ignorant when it comes to sexual behaviors (p. 73). This results in an unbalanced portrait of Cuban society. There is a need for greater ethnographic detail in order to learn how sex and gender are understood. We are told, at various points, that race continues to be a recognized social category (p. 3), that "Cubans are people with powerful religious and spiritistic superstitions" (p. 5) and that there are "working class communities" in Havana (p. 88). One wonders if these social categories affect values and beliefs about gendered and sexual identity, but we are not provided with any further analysis of them.

Marvin Leiner has provided a clear and sensitive analysis of the relations between politics and sexuality and their damaging effects on homosexuals and women in Cuba. By the end of *Sexual Politics in Cuba* we have a clear picture of *official* policies and attitudes toward homosexuals, women, and AIDS. But the development of educational programs to change popular or unofficial attitudes requires in-depth ethnographic

research that goes beyond an exclusive focus on national/political definitions to reveal other socio-cultural features than may affect the construction of masculinities, femininities, and homosexualities in Cuba.

NOTE

1. Leiner maintains that the UMAP camps were only in operation for two years, from 1965-67, but Reinaldo Arenas was not released from prison until 1976 (Arenas 1993:224). Arenas is not clear about whether this sentence was part of the UMAP campaign, for other "crimes against the state," or a combination. The point here is that incarceration of homosexuals continued well past the demise of the camps.

REFERENCE

ARENAS, REINALDO, 1993. *Before Night Falls*. Harmondsworth: Penguin.

Sharks and Sardines: Blacks in Business in Trinidad and Tobago. SELWYN RYAN & LOU ANNE BARCLAY. St. Augustine, Trinidad: Institute of Social and Economic Studies, University of the West Indies, 1992. xiv + 217 pp. (Paper n.p.)

KEVIN A. YELVINGTON
Department of Anthropology
University of South Florida
Tampa FL 33620-8100, U.S.A.

The way skin color articulates with money has been a major preoccupation of Trinidadians. In the commodification of ethnicity, black skin and money, it is held, just do not mix. Consider V.S. Naipaul's career. "In Trinidad," he writes in *The Middle Passage*,

a Negro who opens a bakery runs a considerable risk, and he is begging for trouble if he opens a laundry. Whatever goes on in the back rooms, Trinidadians like to feel that their clothes are washed and their bread handled by white or Chinese hands. Equally, for all the complaints about white and whitish staff in the banks, there is a strong feeling among Negroes that black people, even when they can be trusted, don't know how to handle money (1981:79-80).

In the novel *The Mimic Men*, the young Ralph Singh enters his school friend Browne's inner world. On the walls of Browne's family's home are

framed pictures of Joe Louis, Jesse Owens, Haile Selassie, and Jesus. This is the same Browne who, years later, while campaigning for the employment of blacks in the firm of Cable and Wireless, supported their exclusion from the banks: "If I thought black people were handling my few cents I wouldn't sleep too well," he used to say (Naipaul 1969:186).

Given this cultural preoccupation, in the book under review Ryan and Barclay begin to examine the fate of black entrepreneurs in Trinidad and Tobago under the evocative title *Sharks and Sardines*. The book is divided into six chapters, four by Ryan and two by Barclay, and a presumably jointly-authored Introduction and a Summary and Conclusion. The data are derived from a survey of 74 black owners of micro-enterprises conducted in 1991, as well as from a number of qualitative interviews with black and white businesspeople. Chapter 2 is devoted to a useful profile of black entrepreneurs, their micro-enterprises, and the problems they perceive as leading to their relative marginalization. Chapter 4 is a very interesting focus on black women entrepreneurs. Chapter 5 looks at black entrepreneurs in Africa, in the United Kingdom, and elsewhere in the Caribbean. There is also an attempt in this book to place the presentation of the data in local historical context, with a discussion of slavery emancipation, of post-Black Power Movement challenges to the black-dominated state apparatus, and the more recent difficulties faced by small entrepreneurs with the IMF-determined trade liberalization, deregulation, and erosion of protected markets.

The research is part of a contemporary discourse in Trinidad that is fixated on the ethnic identity of just who gets what, when. Blacks contend that French Creole whites continue to pull the strings behind the economy while Syrian-Lebanese, Chinese, and East Indian entrepreneurs make dramatic gains, all at black expense. East Indians charge that black domination of the state and white domination of the economy continues to oppress them, but that the gains East Indians have made in entrepreneurship are due to "cultural" and, paradoxically, "natural" (read "racial") proclivities to work hard and sacrifice (something, by implication, that is deemed to be lacking in blacks). Members of white elite families "cry poor," claiming that they are no longer in charge of the economy, if they ever were, and arguing that they are the most discriminated against group in the society. This discourse turns on contested interpretations of Trinidadian history. Thus, Ryan and Barclay ask: "Why did the descendants of the slaves not succeed in becoming businessmen as did the Chinese or Indians, who were brought or who came to serve as their replacements on the plantations?" (p. 6).

The strength of the book is that we get to understand the fascinating

contours of this discourse, from the point of view of black entrepreneurs. There are throughout the book extensive quotes from black entrepreneurs that speak to a number of issues. We hear what they see as the obstacles to their success, including continued white and "high brown" control over the banks and, therefore, denial of access to the capital necessary for business expansion. We hear of the finance sector's mistrust of black entrepreneurs. They point to the lack of support networks in the form of black business associations, the lack of family involvement (seen to be the cornerstone of Chinese, East Indian, and Syrian-Lebanese success), the supposed disrespectful and lackadaisical black employee and even the notion that blacks don't want to buy from blacks. The latter is a familiar refrain, heard also in the United States. In an article on the problems faced by black entrepreneurs in the United States in my local newspaper, one American black man is quoted as saying "There's a jealousy and envy among us because one of us has broken ranks" (Neusner 1995:9). Yet in the article's very next paragraph a Jamaican immigrant woman, the owner of two restaurants, says that while American blacks have not had the same opportunity as Jamaicans, they have not had the same successful attitude either. Rife ironies notwithstanding, what her statement demonstrates is that there is nothing inherent in "blackness" that prevents entrepreneurship, that there exist "blacknesses," and that "opportunity" and "success" are intimately tied together.

If these qualitative data are the book's strength (and as an anthropologist, I'm not going to quibble with qualitative data), they can also be pointed to as the book's weakness because Ryan and Barclay rely too much on them to make their own points. I wish, in other words, that we could hear more of Ryan's and Barclay's voices, their own interpretations as distinct from the emic views of the black entrepreneurs. While there is no question that some of the obstacles pointed out by the respondents are true, and there can be no denying that racist/classist structures are reproduced and have devastating effects, we are not exactly sure what these effects are. This amounts to asking the "angry white male" in the United States if affirmative action is to blame for his lot, hearing him say "yes," and taking that as a causal explanation. This is frustrating because the reader is distracted from a fine historical and structural account of the period 1970-92 in Chapter 3 that discusses the vicissitudes of the banks and financial institutions, the role of interlocking directorates, and the influence of the state on blacks in business. There is a sense that lots of hard, academically entrepreneurial work is lost in the din of ethnic economic politics.

The danger is that the authors repeat (and in this context, extend and

legitimate) pseudo-explanations that may simply be wrong. For instance, they state on page 143 that "the Afro-Trinidadian enjoys a relatively marginal economic standing vis-a-vis the other ethnic groups in the country" and then refer readers to Table 8. But while Table 8 (p. 144), based on unpublished 1980 census data, indeed shows that whites, Syrian-Lebanese, and Chinese have higher monthly incomes than do blacks, it also shows that East Indians "dominate" blacks in that more East Indians than blacks make under TT\$900 a month. In every higher income category the percentage of blacks is greater than that of East Indians. Each group comprises slightly more than 40 percent of the total population. The approach also leads to tautologies: "The Afro-Trinidadian community is too riven by individualism, competition and status differences (between the upper and middle class versus the lower class) to form a united front and cooperate in business" (p. 148). That is, because blacks are individualized they are individualized. And it results in the same old scapegoats being put on trial again and again. Once more the black family is to blame, this time for not having a male head who is concerned with inculcating business sense in his children and forming the family unit into a family business, the way East Indians, Syrian-Lebanese, and Chinese are said to do. Yet it is argued that "the future of Trinidad blacks in business may very well rest on ... women's shoulders" (p. 150). And it is revealed (p. 149) that four of the women entrepreneurs under study divorced their unsupportive spouses rather than abandon their businesses. It is unlikely that these entrepreneurs would thrive under what is arguably a less democratic family form. The black family in the Caribbean may indeed have rather weak affinal ties, but its consanguineal ties are strong – strong enough for what the authors call the "cultural resources" of the other groups to flow along. That is, if there were the resources in the first place. Presumably, the successful West Indian immigrant entrepreneurs in the United States such as the woman referred to above and those Afro-Caribbean entrepreneurs in New York who have earned the ostensibly complimentary nickname "Black Jews" are equally "hampered" by their own (black) family forms. Furthermore, the full scope of black entrepreneurship is not taken fully into account. Conspicuously absent, for example, are black Carnival masquers, successful cultural *and* economic entrepreneurs.

The shame is that we can develop no theory of how ethnicity intersects with class and how these phenomena mutually create and condition each other. And, in another sense, one wants to know why we are only talking about black versus white/Chinese/Syrian-Lebanese/East Indian inequality and not inequality in general and how the dispossessed of all groups have suffered under dependent capitalism. As Naipaul (1981:80) writes,

In money matters generally there is almost a superstition among both Indians and Negroes about the unreliability of their own race; there is scarcely a Trinidadian who has not at one time felt or said, "I don't have any luck with my race." It is an aspect of the multi-racial society to which sociologists pay little attention.

REFERENCES

- NAIPAUL, V.S., 1969. *The Mimic Men*. Harmondsworth: Penguin. [Orig. 1967.]
 —, 1981. *The Middle Passage*. New York: Vintage Books. [Orig. 1962.]
 NEUSNER, NOAM M.M., 1995. Blacks Don't Buy from Blacks. *Tampa Tribune* Business & Finance section. September 24: 1, 9.

Blacks in the Dutch World: The Evolution of Racial Imagery in a Modern Society. ALLISON BLAKELY. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1993. xix + 327 pp. (Cloth US \$ 35.00)

CATHERINE LEVESQUE
 Department of Art and Art History
 The College of William and Mary
 Williamsburg VA 23187, U.S.A.

The pivotal – if ambivalent – relationship of the Dutch homeland with its farflung trade empire has, since the seventeenth century, largely shaped the connection between Dutch history and black history. *Blacks in the Dutch World* does justice to these complex colonial and racial inter-relationships and their cultural legacy. Within his general analysis of the black presence in the wider Dutch world, Allison Blakely focuses on the diverse and ambiguous images of blacks in Dutch folklore, art, literature, and religion. The general black presence emphasized in Chapters 1, 6, and 7 provides an explanatory framework for the intermediary chapters which examine racial imagery within various facets of Dutch culture from the seventeenth century to the present day.

Blakely communicates the overriding commercial imperatives of the Dutch role throughout the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries in the slave trade and in the formation of a trading empire. As he makes clear, these ventures, shaped by expediency and exploitation, are only selectively reflected in Dutch art. The crudest racial stereotypes are commercial and mostly from the nineteenth century. The relationship between color bias and imagery is, however, harder to categorize in the two earlier centuries

covered by this study even though, ironically, these were the years when the Dutch were most active in the slave trade (1654-1780s).

Of the four areas examined in this book (folklore, art, literature, and religion), the complex problems presented by works that communicate racial imagery are most evident in the section on the visual arts. Chapter 3, "Art as History," provides the first compendium of works that portray blacks in Dutch (and to a lesser extent Flemish) art, and will surely serve (until the publication of Volume 3 of the series *The Image of the Black in Western Art*) as the most comprehensive record of images of blacks in European art during the seventeenth and early eighteenth centuries. Within the chapter most depictions of blacks from the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries appear in the section, "World of Experience." Here Blakely traces the shift of the predominant fifteenth- and sixteenth-century portrayal of blacks within a limited repertoire of religious and allegorical subjects to the replacement of this context by an equally limited assortment of social roles, especially as servants and military men. As he notes in a later chapter, even the striking individualistic portraits by Albert Eeckhout were intended to function as part of the documentation of Dutch possessions in Brazil, rather than as portraits of individuals. One painting, *Admiral de Ruyter in the Castle of Elmina*, by Emanuel de Witte (private collection, London), even more than those produced in Blakely's book, provides a dramatic illustration of his view that the debasement of "exotic" black figures was used to "emphasize the grandeur of the Dutch commercial or military achievements" (p. 277). In this exceptional work an African kneels before the Dutch admiral in order to display a landscape painting depicting the fortress of Elmina – one of the principal centers of the West African slave trade.

While the characterization of blacks in Dutch paintings and decorative arts in the seventeenth and early eighteenth centuries is not, for the most part, overtly negative, the limited range of roles in which blacks are depicted reflects the cultural assumptions of an established social order as well as the limits of prevailing artistic conventions and patronage. The visual arts exemplify a point Blakely makes in a later chapter: "to the extent that blacks were visible in Dutch society, it appears that it was not as they really were but as the popular opinion of them wished them to be" (p. 277). The limitations inherent in this projected image of blacks in paintings and prints up to the late nineteenth century becomes manifest when compared to the memorable accounts – most especially in Chapter 6, "The Black Presence in the Dutch World" – of the diverse individuals whose lives straddled metropole and colony.

Blakely is too modest when toward the end of his important study he

states that "on the question of exactly how racial imagery is communicated, the evidence examined here provides only inconclusive guidance" (p. 290). In many areas he makes a strong case that opens potentially fruitful areas of inquiry. For example, his book provides evidence that a fuller examination of popular prints would further document the evolution of racial stereotypes. Although he confirms the view that blacks appear only sporadically in Dutch popular prints before the nineteenth century, scholars interested in the formation of ethnic and racial stereotypes particular to Dutch culture might well consider earlier traditions of satirical prints and propaganda. While beyond the scope of Blakely's book, a study of the extensive printed propaganda produced by the Dutch throughout the sixteenth, seventeenth, and eighteenth centuries might well reveal more of the historical legacy of national/ethnic stereotypes salient to the communication of racial imagery – for example, the use of "Moor" as a term of opprobrium directed at the Spanish enemy during the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries.

In *Blacks in the Dutch World* Blakely provides scholars with a valuable record – in word and image – of the complex interaction between Dutch history and black history even as it examines, sensitively and persuasively, some of the intricate combinations of factors which are involved in color bias and its cultural expression.

"To Hell With Paradise": A History of the Jamaican Tourist Industry.
FRANK FONDA TAYLOR. Pittsburgh: University of Pittsburgh Press, 1993. ix + 239 pp. (Cloth US\$ 39.95)

DENNIS J. GAYLE

Office of International Education, Programs and Activities
Florida International University
Miami FL 33199, U.S.A.

Frank Taylor deftly uncovers a pattern of continuity within change, in ten chapters dealing with the evolution of Jamaica's tourist industry, from the early nineteenth-century attempts to promote the island as a health spa, to the post-1986 period when annual visitor arrivals exceeded one million. The first section of the book explores the interplay between Jamaican society and American tourists, as well as the role of tourism in Jamaican economic growth and development.

The title *To Hell with Paradise* derives from an evocative phrase used by James Mitchell of St. Vincent, who insisted that the myth of Caribbean

paradise marketed by regional tourist boards was counterproductive. This vividly encapsulates a leitmotif of the work: that the average Jamaican was excluded from the benefits of tourism, which generated a litany of environmental and socioeconomic ills, including the revitalization of racial prejudice and discrimination. For instance, a 1903 travelogue commented that one of the most entertaining recreations in Jamaica was to "observe the brutish blacks in their habitat during feeding time, and to view their mating habits" (Pullen-Burry 1903:27).

In their study of the lessons of history, Will and Ariel Durant (1968:12) comment that the past may be seen as the present unrolled for understanding. In such a search for understanding, Taylor assesses the development of tourism in Jamaica through 1914. He documents how the control of malaria and yellow fever were prerequisites for tourism development in Jamaica, an industry sired by American banana traders, who made the island a major base of operations; black islanders developed a manifest xenophobia, consequent upon exposure to the "blind, wicked unreasonable race prejudice" of many white visitors (p. 147), while local and foreign white retailers and hoteliers profited most from the industry.

In three chapters dealing with Jamaican tourism development after World War I, Taylor foreshadows the recurrent debate regarding the optimal role of the private sector in tourism promotion, and documents the antiquity of visitor harassment in the island, citing 1936 court records. He shows that Jamaica began to emerge as a leading destination for the average middle-income vacationer with the advent of Pan American World Airways' Clipper service in December 1930, and that by 1965 long-stay visitors (three nights and more) accounted for the bulk of arrivals. One result was the creation of a year-round industry, divided into winter and summer seasons, differentiated between wealthy and budget-conscious vacationers. However by 1966, "the biggest problem wasn't 'selling' Jamaica to the tourists, but 'selling' tourists to the Jamaicans" (p. 169).

In direct response, the post-1972 Manley government adopted three principles for a new tourism: service should be distinguished from servility; advertising should be consistent with the dignity of the Jamaican people; and tourism should be devoid of racial discrimination and social snobbery. Taylor argues that this approach encouraged the dramatic growth of domestic tourism, while being essentially irrelevant to external demand. Even though tourism has contributed more foreign exchange to the Jamaican economy than any other domestic sector since 1985, the author concludes that a host of old problems continue to haunt the industry at almost every turn. These include exploitation and underpayment of hotel employees, drug trafficking, prostitution, price inflation, housing

shortages, overcrowded streets, and environmental degradation.

Historians always tend to oversimplify, selecting a manageable minority of facts out of a multitude of events. Frank Taylor assuredly avoids gross oversimplification. However, his summation does insufficient justice to the extent to which Jamaican entrepreneurs and executives involved in tourism development have often risen to the challenge of crisis, as exemplified by the 1988 "Image of Jamaica" campaign, and the increasing acceptance among Jamaicans of an industry that now includes significant numbers of black visitors and managers. Yet this history of Jamaican tourism remains a compelling work, which will attract the attention of historians, political economists, sociologists, anthropologists, and others with an interest in the Caribbean tourist industry.

REFERENCES

DURANT, WILL & ARIEL DURANT, 1968. *The Lessons of History*. New York: Simon and Schuster.

PULLEN-BURRY, BESSIE, 1903. *Jamaica as it is, 1903*. London: Unwin.

Jahmaica: Rastafari and Jamaican Society, 1930-1990. FRANK JAN VAN DIJK. Utrecht: ISOR, 1993. 483 pp. (Paper NLG 60.00)

JOHN P. HOMIAK
National Museum of Natural History
Smithsonian Institution
Washington DC 20560, U.S.A.

This is the first study that attempts to trace a detailed history of the Rastafari movement in its passage from marginalized "cult" in the early 1930s to a contemporary global network of cultural resistance. It is also the first to rely primarily on archival data culled from colonial reports, newspaper accounts, and ephemeral print sources. This information is supplemented by interviews with Jamaicans (both Rastas and non-Rastas) and by Frank Jan van Dijk's earlier fieldwork among members of the Twelve Tribes of Israel, the movement's most middle-class organization. As a subtext to the task of historical analysis, the author advances a comparative view of the Rastafari in terms of theory on millenarian movements. The results are mixed. On the one hand, Van Dijk has compiled an impressive body of

reportage on the movement not previously available under a single cover. This makes his book an important bibliographic reference on Rastafari. On the other hand, this work suffers from a lack of first-hand ethnographic experience, the application of out-dated theory on religious movements, and an uncritical approach to much of the archival data presented.

For starters, it is necessary to ask how one can write a history of the movement without fully accommodating the voices and perspectives of the Rastafari themselves. Admittedly, Van Dijk seeks to understand how the movement has developed in interaction with the wider society. The Rastafari, however, are one-half of this interaction and cannot be dismissed as such. Van Dijk's decision to eschew the oral testimony of adherents based on presumed problems with the "objectivity" of their accounts is largely without merit. In almost every instance, first-hand testimony would have greatly enhanced the interpretation of the existing archival evidence. Van Dijk's treatment of the repatriation initiatives of the late 1950s and early 1960s is especially pertinent in this regard. Here he produces some interesting published statements by Rasta leaders at the time. Most of these are well known, alive, and accessible; it is unfortunate that Van Dijk did not avail himself of their perspectives. These published materials could easily have been used to revisit the events of this period and by being used as a basis for a contemporary dialogue with these individuals.

Other problems arise from a failure to contextualize reportage such as newspaper accounts. Here Van Dijk generally overlooks the fact that much of the reportage on the movement in the Jamaican press constituted a form of repressive intervention in itself. The issue of how this reportage served to enunciate colonial principles of discipline and order and to direct the course of early movement development is never broached. Nor does Van Dijk take into account that many of the statements by Rastafari leaders that find their way into print tend to represent examples of public ideology – ideology which is mobilized for strategic purposes. Based on such statements he too often assumes consensus about the meaning of notable events or junctures – such as the 1961 University Report or the subsequent government-sponsored mission to Africa – at critical points of the movement's development. This approach suppresses the dynamic, contending, and many-layered quality of Rastafari discourse. It also assumes that the meaning of these and similar events is presently fixed and settled in the minds of contemporary Rastafari. I know this not to be the case from my own experience in Jamaica over the past decade and a half. Events enshrined in the oral history of the movement continue to be debated with considerable heat in different quarters of the movement.

Van Dijk also fails to explore the relationship between published state-

ments by the Rastafari and the issues of authority and power which derive from the involvement of these speakers in unequal relations of power. This is a significant lapse in critical perspective. Like many researchers, he appears to accept uncritically the Rastas' own ideology of egalitarian relations. From its formative period, however, the movement has been a speech community with somewhat contradictory norms about who speaks to and for whom with what authority. The author himself presents, but fails to follow up, evidence about an emergent Rasta intelligentsia that should alert readers to this issue. Speaking of educated Jamaicans who entered the movement during the 1980s, he notes that "these Rasta intellectuals had the language, knowledge, and prestige necessary to be able to express 'Rastology' in a way that the Jamaican elite could relate to. The media sought them and they sought the media" (p. 290). The impact of this development needs to be understood more fully in terms of both the Jamaican movement and Rastafari abroad. Similarly, any historical treatment of Rastafari needs to address the role of grass roots intellectuals in the 1960s (Sam Brown, Mortimo Planno, and others) and their control over discourse within the movement. How and why, one might ask, were these voices heard during the 1960s repatriation initiatives? Van Dijk's lack of actual contact with these voices prevents him from developing this kind of analysis.

Van Dijk's attempt to hammer out a view of the movement in theoretical terms also merits a sharp critique. Shortcomings here derive from a use of dated theory which tends to see movements like Rastafari as a proto-political phenomenon. In this regard, he takes a rather mechanical view of developments, seeing in Rasta a transition from "millenarian hopes to political action" (pp. 352-59). There is, by contrast, no effort to deal with the expressive cultural content of the movement and the counter-hegemonic forms of symbolic signification which the Rastafari term "livity." This shortcoming is most obvious in relation to the theme of repatriation, the central vision of the Rasta faithful. Whatever else the Rastafari may signal by their insistence upon a return to the ancestral continent, it is necessary to realize that repatriation is a redemptive idiom which is continually revitalized as part of an ongoing postcolonial struggle. In an approach that is historical it is curious that Van Dijk fails to register the connection between the emergence of the livity complex and the last major repatriation initiatives of the late 1950s and early 1960s. For most Rastafari, the practice of livity and its meanings continue to be inseparable from their vision of collective redemption in an African Zion. This is another point on which archival data are no substitute for fieldwork.

Across broad swaths of this work Van Dijk slots movement responses

into polar type responses: "political" or "religious," symbolic or instrumental, active or passive. This kind of dualist thinking is inadequate to handle the complex interaction between agency, meaning, and history that has taken place in the development of Rasta culture. It leads inevitably to oversimplifications or misrepresentations. One example is the relationship he perceives between the movement's weak acephalous social organization and the failure of its repatriation initiatives. Van Dijk believes that the interaction of these factors has caused Rastas to choose between isolation from or engagement with the wider society – with many traditional elders opting for "isolation." In the case of the latter, he asserts that the choice between isolation from or engagement with the wider society was "a dilemma that in many ways paralyzed the movement and no doubt contributed to its apparent decline and loss of adherents during the second half of the 1980s" (pp. 309, 314-15).

Neither the terms of analysis nor the conclusions drawn can be sustained. It is certainly true that during the 1980s many Rasta elders removed themselves from the urban areas of Kingston where, throughout the two prior decades, the movement had experienced its greatest growth. A far different conclusion is reached when one ceases to equate movement to rural sites with "isolation" and understands the organizational dynamics of the movement and social context in which this demographic shift occurred. The developments that Van Dijk takes to be markers of isolation have, to the contrary, actually had a far-ranging impact upon the globalization of traditional Rastafari culture. Here it is necessary to understand that the reasons for the demographic shift noted above have little to do with the "withdrawal" of Rastas from interaction with society. An oscillation between rural and urban structures has long been a feature of the movement's organization. The transition in question was caused by urban political violence during the 1970s and 1980s in areas traditionally settled by Rastas. It was also nudged along by the dynamics of the domestic groups in which many middle-aged Rastafari found themselves during this same period.

These are among the reasons why, by the 1970s, Nyahbingi ritual (grounation) began to shift permanently from urban ghetto yards to rural sites – often sites of family land. Many of these elders had come of age as heads of household and access to land was a significant criterion in the ritual networks that they controlled. Of particular note is the fact that as this pattern became established during the 1980s, so did the internationalization of the traditional core of the movement. Individuals who have become Rastafari abroad now regularly make pilgrimages to Jamaica to attend these island-wide binghi celebrations. The result is that the elders

who sponsor these events – rather than being in rural “isolation” – have now come into more frequent contact with other Jamaican Rastafari in addition to being participants in a wider international network of adherents. What appears as a retreatist strategy has actually become an important element in the globalization of the more traditional Rastafari culture. Recognizing such developments is possible only by long-term observation of (and involvement with) the movement.

Finally, the issue of globalization – something which I dare say all contemporary work on the movement must address – is not theorized within this study. Although Van Dijk includes a chapter on developments outside Jamaica, these are largely disconnected “sightings” of a Rasta presence elsewhere in the Caribbean, Europe, North America, New Zealand, and Africa. What needs to be examined are the ways in which developments abroad feed back into the Jamaican movement. In this regard, there is little doubt that the processes of globalization have had a profound impact upon international networking, the meaning of eldership and authority, the role of an emergent intelligentsia, and issues of gender. Again, however, without long-term fieldwork and engagement within the movement there is no way to trace these developments.

With all of these shortcomings noted, Van Dijk is still to be commended for the painstaking work which went into the compilation of materials in this volume. This in itself is an impressive feat. He has certainly succeeded in at least one of his stated efforts: “to provide other researchers with a detailed historical framework” on which to do further research (p. 2). As an historical account, however, the final word belongs to the Rastafari. They have a saying about themselves and their history which they delight in repeating to researchers: “The half has yet to be told.”

Sir Hans Sloane: Collector, Scientist, Antiquary, Founding Father of the British Museum. ARTHUR MACGREGOR (ed.). London: British Museum Press, 1994. (Cloth £50)

PETER MASON
Lauriergracht 116
1016 RR Amsterdam, the Netherlands

The Irish physician Hans Sloane (1660–1753) is well known in the museum world as the collector whose will served as the catalyst for the foundation of the British Museum by the British Museum Act of 1753. To

readers of this journal he is equally well known as the author of the first monograph on the natural history of an island in the New World: *A Voyage to the Islands Madera, Barbados, Nieves, S. Christophers and Jamaica, with the natural history of the herbs and trees, four-footed beasts, fishes, birds, insects, reptiles &c. of the last of those islands; to which is prefix'd an Introduction wherein is an account of the inhabitants, air, waters, diseases, trade &c of that place, with some relations concerning the neighbouring continent and islands of America*. This work was based on the fifteen months that Sloane spent in Jamaica from December 1687 to March 1689 as personal physician to the Second Duke of Albemarle, who held the position of governor of Jamaica for this brief period until his death in October 1688. The first volume of Sloane's monograph was not published until 1707, and it took another eighteen years before the second and final volume was issued.

With the aid of these two volumes and of G.R. de Beer's biography, *Sir Hans Sloane and the British Museum*, published two hundred years after Sloane's death, it was possible to form a fairly good general impression of the man and his writings. What makes the collection of articles under review so important is that it presents the results of the first systematic study of the surviving items from Sloane's collection, now scattered among various institutions in London, and of the thirty-one extant catalogues of that collection. As they amply demonstrate, there are still plenty of exciting new finds to be made in this material.

After one introductory essay on Sloane's life, character, and career and another on the establishment of the British Museum, each of the remaining sixteen essays focuses on a specific facet of Sloane's collection. To save repeating the same epithet each time, suffice it to say that each of the eighteen articles contained in the volume cannot be rated less than excellent. In what follows, I have selected those articles with a particular reference to Latin America and the Caribbean, but the reader is warmly recommended to dip into the others as well.

We learn from the article on books and manuscripts by M.A.E. Nickson which books on Jamaica Sloane had acquired before his departure. At one time Sloane seems to have intended to put together a comprehensive history of travel accounts with a special emphasis on the Americas. At this time botany was one of his main interests, and as J.F.M. Cannon points out in his essay on the botanical collections, "exposure to the immense riches of a tropical flora at an early stage in his career had a powerful effect in stimulating the development of his later work and interests" (p. 139). Eight of the volumes in which the Sloane herbarium was mounted contain specimens from Jamaica and the other islands that Sloane visited, and were

to form the basis of his *Natural History*. As a physician, Sloane was particularly interested in the medicinal properties of plants. In fact, he went on to make a considerable amount of money from the promotion of milk chocolate as an aid to digestion and in cases of consumption. In the nineteenth century, it was Sloane's recipe which was used in the production of Cadbury's milk chocolate.

A similar dietary concern often governs his interest in fauna as well as flora. Many of the fishes dealt with in the *Natural History* were locally common species which were caught for food. Though drawing on local informants for some of his information, Sloane placed great emphasis on personal observation. He even attempted to bring back a yellow snake, a crocodile, and a lizard alive, but the snake was shot on board, the lizard fell overboard and drowned, and the crocodile died in its tub.

Both the consumption of fish and the various techniques with which they were caught (spearing, or poisoning the water so that the stunned fish could easily be taken) introduce a human dimension, and the social historian or historical anthropologist of the Americas can find many intriguing details tucked away among the items of the collection and the catalogues. On the side of physical anthropology, M. Day's essay on "Humana" notes Sloane's interest in specimens obtained from negroes, a number of them relating to skin pigmentation. As for the ethnographic collections, J.C.H. King suggests that Sloane may have collected certain Jamaican items himself, such as a "*strum strum* or musicall instrumt. made of an oblong-hollowed piece of wood with a crosse hole in the side, strings of a scandent herbs caulis," and two similar musical instruments. Some of the sherds listed in the catalogue may be pieces of Jamaican pottery too (p. 241 n. 68). Other West Indian items which came into Sloane's possession via intermediaries throw a more sinister light on life on Jamaica: "A manati *strap* for whipping the Negro Slaves," "A *noose* made of cane splitt for catching game or hanging runaway negros," or "A coat of the runaway rebellious negros who lived in the woods of that Island made of the Mahot bark" (p. 243 n. 99). The extant items from Sloane's Latin American and West Indian collections include a Mesoamerican painted gourd, a Central American axe, a Mesoamerican pot, and a penis sheath, as well as a Mesoamerican (Toltec?) stone head and three Peruvian pottery vessels.

Finally, mention must be made of the *Americana* in Sloane's collection of prints and drawings, dealt with in the article by J. Rowlands. Sloane's interest in travel is evident from the collection of drawings of the first English colony in North America on Roanoke Island. These are copies of the originals by John White, depicting not only Virginian birds, beasts,

and reptiles but also ethnographic scenes covering Brazilian and Inuit subjects as well as Carolina Algonquians. As Sloane's copies range over a number of subjects that are not represented in White's original drawings, they are an invaluable additional source of information. As for South America, the earliest representations of native South American Indians (Tupinamba?) in Sloane's collection are two drawings of a dark-skinned male figure wearing a feathered skirt, cape, and head-dress by Hans Burgkmair, dating from the second decade of the sixteenth century. From the seventeenth century, Sloane also possessed thirty-two drawings of Dutch Brazil by Frans Post, probably done after the artist's return to the Netherlands in 1644. Another set of drawings relating to Dutch activities in South America are the vellum sheets on which Maria Sibylla Merian combined illustrations of the plant and insect life of Suriname.

The superlative scholarship of these articles is matched by the high quality of the 115 black and white figures and 40 color plates. It is to be hoped that the price of the lavishly produced publication will not deter institutional libraries (or even well-paid academics) from acquiring this essential work.

The Life and Times of Henry Clarke of Jamaica, 1828-1907. JAMES WALVIN. London: Frank Cass, 1994. xvi + 155 pp. (Paper US\$ 19.50)

PHILIP MORGAN
Department of History
Florida State University
Tallahassee FL 32306-2029, U.S.A.

James Walvin has long been connected to the Clarke dynasty. His first book, co-authored with Michael Craton, was a study of Worthy Park, a 300-year-old sugar estate in Lluidas Vale owned by the Clarke family. The patriarch of the twentieth-century owners of Worthy Park was Henry Clarke, an English schoolteacher and cleric, later a politician and businessman, who migrated to Jamaica in 1847 and lived in the western corner of the island for the next sixty years until his death in 1907. As founder of the Clarke clan, Henry appeared briefly in the history of Worthy Park, but now Walvin devotes a short book wholly to him. Henry is most notable for having kept a detailed diary which he began at age fifteen and continued even on his deathbed; he spent the last years of his life abridging his voluminous diary and then condensing the abridged version. Obviously,

Clarke self-consciously strove to create a significant historical document. As Walvin points out, Clarke's story promises to illuminate a shadowy period in Jamaican history – the second half of the nineteenth century. But the nature of Clarke's diary determined that his "account is more the journal of a soul than it is a view of his time and place" (p. xii). Essentially, this book is a story of Clarke's inner life, not the "life and times" promised in the title.

Clarke tests the patience of his biographer. He was for the most part an unattractive man: a cantankerous, single-minded, stubborn, often gloomy eccentric. He sported an unkempt, rather wild beard, as the one photograph of him included in the book reveals. He was a latter-day Moses, an isolated voice crying in the wilderness, constantly penning Jeremiads, persistently firing off letters against the authorities, and fighting over his salary and other slights. He was an impractical visionary, unsuccessfully experimenting with a ship that could skim over water, an aerial propeller, a tricycle, a walking machine, and a new braking system for trains. His behavior is often difficult to fathom. After his first three years in Jamaica, for example, he suddenly declared his love to the niece of one of his former employers in Lincolnshire, a person with whom he had corresponded just once since leaving England. Even though she was astounded by his letter, she married him, and surprisingly their marriage worked. They remained together for over fifty years and had eleven children. At her death he described her as "my only centre of attraction to this world" (p. 122). Clarke spoke quite frankly of his "delight in her body," telling his wife even in the last year of her life that the touch of her breasts and the sight of the rising sun were "two delights as fresh to me every morning as I had never enjoyed them before" (p. 124). But Henry was a trying husband and a domineering father, who became estranged from his eldest son and namesake.

Yet Walvin occasionally wonders whether Clarke was as severe and unbending as his records suggest. Apparently, Henry was a good preacher and conscientious minister: his services were exceptionally well attended. Visitors often liked him; even a governor found him congenial and agreeable. In the 1890s he won political office by large electoral margins, so he had local support. He was a reformer: a tireless advocate of the merits of paper money over specie, a defender of Indian indentured workers, a sympathizer with the Morant Bay rebels, and a campaigner against illegitimacy. And in the end he was successful. In 1871 he pioneered a Building Society, which would soon flourish and serve as his most lasting memorial. Under Henry's stewardship, the Society took in almost £11.5 million and

had minimal losses. It helped his fourth son, Fred Clarke, purchase Worthy Park.

Henry Clarke's story, then, has some interest for the history of Jamaica. Unfortunately, the reader gets no real sense of local society. One occasionally hears of Clarke being entertained by others, stopping and dining with a string of friends en route to Lucea, hosting visiting lecturers, seeing a traveling circus, riding into the hills, and attending tennis parties, but these events are cursorily described. Blacks were his most regular worshippers, but they remain anonymous. Clarke once denounced an obeah-man, but tantalizingly no more is said. It is hard to know whether this abstraction of Clarke from his local context is a failing of his diary or of his biographer. At one point, Walvin claims that local society had little impact on Clarke's life, but the reader inevitably wonders whether his isolation was so complete. Some selections from the diary would have helped readers take the measure of the man.

On the whole Walvin's interpretation of Clarke is an engaging story, well told, but it also verges on the tedious and repetitive, reflecting its subject's persistent preoccupations over a long life. The reader is likely to feel that Clarke's warning, penned in 1850, that "Blessed be the man who spares these books, / And cursed be he who in them looks," has secured the ultimate victim in his own biographer.

Maroon Heritage: Archaeological, Ethnographic and Historical Perspectives. E. KOFI AGORSAH (ed.). Kingston: Canoe Press, 1994. xx + 210 pp. (Paper J\$ 400, US\$ 15.00)

WERNER ZIPS
Department of Ethnology
University of Vienna
1010 Vienna, Austria

As a collection of conference papers (presented at the University of West Indies, Mona, October 18-19, 1991), *Maroon Heritage* is intended to reinforce a dialogue that is at once intercultural and interdisciplinary. Two Jamaican Maroon Chiefs, Colonel Harris from Moore Town and former Colonel Wright from Accompong, participated with contributions on various aspects of the history and culture of their respective communities. This dialogue between scholars and their subjects of study fulfilled a declared aim of the symposium, underlined by its organizer and the editor

of the volume, E. Kofi Agorsah: "I pay special tribute to our Maroon Chiefs whose contributions make this volume the only one of its kind in Maroon heritage studies, for here we are with the researched and the researcher engaged in a dialogue with a common goal" (p. xviii).

For those who could not attend the conference, however, much of the dialogue seems to have been lost on the way from the spoken to the written (published) word. With such an intention as that paraphrased above, one could expect at least a summary of key and/or critical issues in the discussions during the conference; that is missing in this volume. Furthermore, most of the individual contributions to the volume fall short of including such scientific exchange in their conclusions. It therefore rests largely on readers to use their imagination to reconstruct possible discourses or dialogues. Not an easy task, since the participants of the conference come from such different walks of life and academic disciplines – from archaeology, ethnomusicology, ethnography, literature, literary criticism, language studies, journalism, and history to the roles of the Maroon chief and Jamaican police officer involved in archaeological enterprises. As a result, the modes of expression, styles of writing, and theoretical and methodological approaches applied in the volume are extremely varied. So are the topics, which deal with most of the Maroon societies in the Americas even though the Jamaican Maroons provide the main focus.

However, the somewhat fragmentary approach does have an advantage insofar as it allows an idea of the numerous different perspectives taken in Maroon studies. Considering the abundance of historiographical work based on written documents and consequently, as Barry Higman points out (p. vii), relying on the views taken by the oppressor rather than the oppressed, a further swing to additional and alternative methods is quite welcome.

The editor provides an introduction to the historical background of the Maroon heritage. His general treatise on the "New World" and African foundations of Maroon societies establishes a starting point for the search for cultural continuities. Agorsah describes the prehistoric period in the Caribbean as well as in Africa to set the frame for his archaeological findings in two early Maroon settlements in Jamaica (Nanny Town and Old Accompong Town). His main goal is to trace social contact and cultural continuities between the first Maroons and the indigenous "Amerindian" population on the one hand and the West African systems on the other.

In an essay entitled "The True Traditions of my Ancestors," Colonel C.L.G. Harris of Moore Town presents parts of his historical and cultural knowledge. In the best tradition of a Maroon historian, Colonel Harris allows glimpses into his repertoire without selling out his total symbolic

capital. Comparable to processes of oral tradition analyzed by Richard Price in his book on First-Time knowledge among the Saramaka Maroons (1983), the author transmits valuable bits and pieces on such issues as Maroon lands, social organization, law, family names and naming, military affairs, religion, language, economics, medicine, and technology. He makes sure to hint at further aspects of the expositions still kept in his mental possession. His colleague Martin Luther Wright, former Colonel of the Accompong Maroons, gives an overview of central aspects of the history and cultural practice of his community.

Kenneth Bilby grounds the oral historical traditions of the eastern Maroons within the context of Jamaican culture. He discusses the historical consciousness of Maroons, and their language, music, and dance as a distinct variant of Jamaican culture. With the extraordinary insight he has repeatedly proven in his numerous publications on Maroon cultures in Jamaica and Suriname, Bilby arrives at a conclusion that highlights the cultural links between Maroons and (other) Jamaicans: "Maroons today do remain culturally distinct, though in a way that is thoroughly Jamaican" (p. 83). Another contribution deals with the general issue of Jamaican Maroon history. Carey Robinson's "Maroons and Rebels (A Dilemma)" offers little new information and the author abstains from giving any evidence for his remarks. Similarly Albert Edwards looks into the strategies of Maroon warfare; his presentation is likewise not based on sufficient source material. In contrast Joe Pereira sketches the Maroon heritage in Mexico in a well-documented paper. Equally well documented is the short characterization and comparison of different Maroon musical features in Jamaica and Suriname written by Marjorie Whyllie and Maureen Warner-Lewis.

Two articles focus on Nanny, the Maroon leader who was declared a Jamaican National Hero in 1977, but from different angles. Carolyn Cooper deals with the symbolic meaning of Nanny for what she terms "resistance science" in Caribbean literature, particularly in Vic Reid's novel, *Nanny Town*. A provocative hypothesis in connection with Nanny is presented by Kamau Brathwaite, one of the founders of the Caribbean Artists Movement. Brathwaite strongly argues that Nanny of the Maroons in fact held the socio-political position of a Queen Mother comparable to an Ohemmaa in Asante. Referring to the problem of archival certification, Brathwaite bases his claim on an Afrocentric notion of cultural continuity. However his inference makes by far the most sense of all the available sources on Nanny. A structural comparison with historical (and recent) political systems in what is today Ghana strongly supports his arguments or at least promises to reveal further support.

Overall, the book attains its goal of promoting the interdisciplinary out-

look on Maroon cultures. It certainly enriches the knowledge of scholars and researchers interested in this particular subject. And, most important, it poses valuable questions encouraging further research at the interface of archaeology, history, and cultural and political anthropology.

REFERENCE

PRICE, RICHARD, 1983. *First-Time: The Historical Vision of an Afro-American People*. Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins University Press.

Schwarze Rebellen: Afrikanisch-karibischer Freiheitskampf in Jamaica.
WERNER ZIPS. Vienna: Promedia, 1993. 301 pp. (Paper n.p.)

MICHAEL HOENISCH
John F. Kennedy Institute for North American Studies
Freie Universität Berlin
D-14195 Berlin, Germany

Werner Zips's study of the history and present situation of the Maroons in Jamaica deals with a subject of great interest for research about blacks in the "New World." Although comparatively small in numbers, African-Americans who escaped from slavery and developed autonomous societies beyond the fringes of the colonial system demonstrated the vulnerability of colonial rule and the vitality of black resistance. Marronage has also confronted scholars with important research problems (see also Bastide 1967, Price 1983), and Zips deals with some of them openly and directly.

The cultural gap between the author's Viennese academic milieu and the Maroon settlements in Jamaica he writes about is huge to begin with, and is further fortified by the Maroon tradition of secrecy and elaborate defenses against outsiders. From the very beginning, survival of the runaways depended on their ability to protect their cultural borders and maintain their separate existence by guerrilla tactics on various levels; modern cultural contacts, including those of white intellectuals, easily fit into the pattern of outside threats which characterizes Maroon history. Zips makes great efforts to bridge this cultural gap by saturating himself with the literature on the subject. He devoted a full two years to his research in Jamaica; he established contacts with the oral traditions of the Maroons (the bibliography includes lists of interviews, talks, and reasonings) and he

developed a research perspective that installs the Maroons themselves as "a kind of imaginary control" (p. 10) in his work. There is close identification of researcher and research "objects" – Zips hopes to maintain their status as subjects; his "communicative" approach (pp. 157, 245) is based on an explicit research bias in favor of the Maroons' perception of themselves as successful survivors of a long struggle for autonomy.

On this basis the book fulfills the author's promise to write a "history of resistance" instead of a "history of domination" (p. 10). The emancipatory bias places Zips in a position to handle colonial sources with scepticism and to criticize different interpretations of recent scholarship (e.g., Mavis Campbell) with confidence. The context of marronage is carefully established: the plantation system as an economic and ideological machine fuelled by the abuse of black working power and the forms of black resistance against the terror of exploitation. The concept of resistance stresses the importance of new forms of syncretic ethnic identities after the destruction of traditional tribal structures; the function of Africa and African-oriented religious practices like obeah or myal; and the everyday practice of resistance in the form of withdrawal of working power, invisible sabotage or various kinds of parody. Within this context marronage is described as the ultimate form of resistance: the conscious and practical organization of counter-societies which developed separate black identities internally and a flexible guerrilla strategy externally. The Windward and Leeward Maroon societies which developed soon after the British conquest of Jamaica, and survive in changed form until today, assume, in this perspective, both a practical and a symbolic significance: they posed a potential threat to the slaveholding society of Jamaica, and they demonstrated the ability of blacks to establish free societies against huge obstacles.

A substantial section of the book deals with the 85 years of guerrilla warfare waged by the Maroons until they signed peace treaties with the British governor at the end of the 1730s. It is one of the attractions of the book that no attempt is made to reconstruct the military history of this war. Zips is much more interested in the structure of an unequal confrontation which made highly specialized skills necessary to compensate for smaller numbers and inferior weapons. He stresses the competence of Jamaican Maroons as active subjects who drew on resources of will power, knowledge of terrain and enemy, cunning, and solidarity. One of the difficulties of this perspective, which Zips acknowledges, is the reliance on considerations of plausibility because of the scarcity of facts. The interpretation of the peace treaties, crucial for the understanding of the role of Maroons since then, poses one of his greatest challenges. Because these treaties

required the Maroons to do military service for the colonial administration and to return runaway slaves, while granting internal self-government, they have frequently been understood as a decisive defeat: dividing the blacks on the island and domesticating the formally "free" Maroons. Zips acknowledges this interpretation but rejects it in favor of the view the Maroons themselves had: that the treaties were the sacred foundation of an autonomous society of free Blacks in the "New World" and the beginning of a new form of resistance. Zips's attention to the self-perception of the Maroons prevents him from considering the possibility that both interpretations might have some validity.

The central, and longest, part of the book deals with the recent history and present internal organization of the surviving Maroon villages in Jamaica. Here the closeness of the author to the Maroon perspective produces rich results: observations on economic structures, kinship systems, migration and spiritual practices, Kromanti dances, and ancestor worship provide important insights into Maroon life. At the same time, this impressive section raises certain questions: What exactly was the role of the scholarly observer within the Maroon village? Does his work serve to safeguard the essential protective secrecy of the Maroons in sacrificing at least some of his findings, or does it "betray" their inner life in order to publicize their example of resistance through his research? Do these villages indeed emerge as "vital societies" (p. 128) even today, or does the evidence point in the direction of a certain stagnation? Ultimately, Zips seems to favor a view of the Jamaican Maroons that stresses their function as a potent symbol of the possibility of self-determination in spite of opposing power hierarchies.

It is to be hoped that this stimulating and well-researched study of Maroons in Jamaica will be translated into English and there find the resonance it deserves within the discourse of post-colonial studies.

REFERENCES

- BASTIDE, ROGER, 1967. *Les Amériques noires*. Paris: Payot.
- PRICE, RICHARD, 1983. *First-Time: The Historical Vision of an Afro-American People*. Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins University Press.

The Uses of Haiti. PAUL FARMER. Monroe ME: Common Courage Press, 1994. 432 pp. (Paper US\$ 14.95)

ELIZABETH MCALISTER
American Studies
Yale University
New Haven CT 06520, U.S.A.

The song "Are My Hands Clean?" (Reagon 1985) traces the transnational production of a woman's blouse from the cotton fields of El Salvador to the discount rack at Sears, and reminds us that we in the Americas are all implicated in webs of relationship spun by capital and politics. Scholars are well aware of this these days, and frequently theorize vectors of social power – class, national identity, gender, race, and ethnicity – in historical process. It is rarer and more controversial for scholars to theorize the agency of some contemporary actors – drug traffickers, the CIA, the news media and the U.S. Agency for International Development – or to lay blame for injustices on specific people and organizations. This is precisely what Paul Farmer does in *The Uses of Haiti*.

Farmer is remarkably accomplished. Trained as an anthropologist, and currently assistant professor at the Harvard Medical School and a fellow at Boston Brigham and Women's Hospital, he used the funds from his 1993 MacArthur award to enhance the medical clinics he established in rural Haiti, where he spends months each year. He therefore has access to information from both ends of the spectrum he is trying to bridge: the lives of the rural poor and the workings of U.S. institutions.

The book is written for a general readership, although much of the material was first presented at scholarly conferences. Its positions and arguments reflect a politically left orientation that seeks to question the motives and methods of U.S. government policies and institutions toward Latin America in general, and Haiti in particular. The book begins with a 44-page forward by Noam Chomsky, a distinguished scholar critical of U.S. foreign policy. The text itself makes frequent references to Chomsky's hemisphere analyses.

Farmer takes up the call raised by liberation theology to produce "serious, scientific knowledge of the nature of exploitation that the popular masses are suffering" (Gutiérrez 1983:97, cited in Farmer, p. 48). One of his book's merits is its clearly written prose, which spins "an interpretive history of Haiti that attempts to capture some of the 'affective tone' of Haitian readings of their trajectory as a people ... this version is that of the self-described losers" (p. 49).

Haitians' popular readings of their own history often involve conspiracy theories about "the American Plan" in which the U.S. right seeks to crush the Haitian poor. Farmer listens to these claims and presents evidence of many causal links between U.S. institutions and Haitian poverty, some unintended, others blatantly criminal. One strength of the book is Farmer's choice to illustrate these processes with several case studies after the coup against Aristide: a young man assassinated in a private hospital, a woman with AIDS, and a woman interned at the U.S. Guantanamo refugee camp. He links the violence each of these people suffers to processes set in motion by U.S. agencies and interests, charting a "political economy of brutality" that disproportionately affects the poor. My own research among the Haitian popular classes during the coup period confirms the validity of Farmer's analysis (McAlister 1995).

As the title indicates, the book argues that the United States has put Haiti to various uses – some economic, some political, and others that could only be described as emotional or symbolic. Much of the book is a rigorous refutation of an article by the former director of USAID in Haiti, Lawrence Harrison, asserting that Haiti's "African" culture was the source of its ills (Harrison 1993). Arguing against this position, Farmer explores the structural relationship between Haiti and the United States, from the Independence War of Haiti through the recent coup against Aristide.

The section on the history of foreign intervention in Haiti is lucidly written and pays attention to the racialized nature of social relations within Haiti and internationally, highlighting the injustices of international dealings. One weakness of the book is the slight attention given to Haitian agency in the history of Haiti's internationalization. While the book aims to examine U.S. workings in Haiti, the ironic effect of this focus is to obscure the participation of the Haitian ruling classes themselves and to paint a distorted picture of that nation in which nearly all its problems are caused by North America and very few by Haitian actors or Haitian mentalities.

Some of the critiques Farmer launches at the media border on personal attacks against individual journalists. Some citations are not listed in the bibliography, and there is an excessive reliance on Chomsky. But this is not an academic work in the strict sense. Rather, it is a passionate call to understand the processes through which the poor are victims of human rights abuses and the ways in which U.S. interests manipulate both Haitian life and its international image. It is provocative reading for any Caribbeanist.

REFERENCES

- GUTIÉRREZ, GUSTAVO, 1983. *The Power of the Poor in History*. Maryknoll NY: Orbis.
- HARRISON, LAWRENCE, 1993. "Voodoo Politics." *The Atlantic Monthly* 27(6):101-8.
- MCALISTER, ELIZABETH, 1995. "Here Are the People": Rara and Popular Culture in Haiti and New York City. Ph.D. dissertation, Yale University, New Haven.
- REAGON, BERNICE JOHNSON, 1985. "Are My Hands Clean." Included in the album *Sweet Honey in the Rock Live at Carnegie Hall*. Flying Fish Records, 1988.

The Haiti Files: Decoding the Crisis. JAMES RIDGEWAY (ed.). Washington DC: Essential Books, 1994. 243 pp. (Paper US\$ 10.00)

ROBERT LAWLESS
Department of Anthropology
Wichita State University
Wichita KS 67260-0052, U.S.A.

James Ridgeway, political columnist for the *Village Voice*, has assembled a set of articles by journalists and scholars to counter the misleading information published in the mainstream North American Press. Similarly in 1992 Schenkman Books published a book of mine titled *Haiti's Bad Press* (reviewed in this journal [1995]), though it was not cited in Ridgeway's book. By saying that Haiti has a bad press, I meant both that Haiti is presented in a bad light and that the performance of the media in North America is inferior and sometimes simply incompetent. My book traced the historical development of the prejudices and the resulting discriminatory works of journalists, historians, travelers, authors of adventure stories, and others writings on Haiti. Little has changed in almost two centuries; Haiti remains the primary whipping boy of the white-dominated world, blamed for everything from AIDS to zombies. The theme of Ridgeway's book is that in the 1990s Haiti is blamed for choosing its own leaders.

Nothing in this book will be news to Haitian scholars; they will already have read most of the material in the original and at least heard about the rest of it. The observation that the United States subverts democratic movements in the Caribbean and Latin America is, of course, not new to anyone familiar with U.S. foreign policy and the history of the Western hemisphere. The book does have an obvious function of educating those who are unaware of the deleterious role of the United States in the rest of

the hemisphere – particularly in Haiti. Towards this end Ridgeway has organized the book into four parts.

Part One contains an essay on the historical background of Haiti written by Noam Chomsky from secondary sources, a selection from Bernard Diederich and Al Burt's book *Papa Doc*, and also a selection from Rod Prince's *Haiti*, a book that also focuses on the Duvaliers.

Part Two, "The Players," contains twelve selections including contributions by Amy Wilentz, a journalist deeply involved in Haitian affairs; Michel Laguerre, a Haitian-American scholar; and Walter E. Fauntroy, a congressman concerned about Haiti. This part gives some information on some of the members of the Haitian power elite though almost no information on the military leaders.

Part Three, "The Crisis," portrays the close ties between U.S. government agencies and the three-year illegal Haitian military regime. One piece that I had not seen previously, reprinted from the London *Independent* (November 1993), traces much of the anti-Aristide propaganda circulated by U.S. intelligence sources to Lynn Garrison, a Canadian adventurer closely allied with the Haitian military. This part also contains information on the disastrous pig eradication program in Haiti carried out largely by the United States in 1982 and 1983, the sweatshops of the off-shore assembly industries, the drug trafficking of the Haitian military, and the refugee question. Contributors to this part include the anthropologist/physician Paul Farmer, the National Labor Committee, the Haitian Information Bureau, Senator John Kerry, Human Rights Watch, and several progressive journalists.

Part Four is a useful chronology of events in Haiti from October 15, 1990 to May 11, 1994.

Essentially journalistic, this book concentrates on the political issues in Haiti and on Haitian-American relations. Personally, I find the challenges facing Haiti to be ecological, structural, and cultural, and not particularly answerable to the traditional solutions offered by governments. The volume would have been strengthened by some selections on agricultural concerns such as soil conservation and peasant access to the national political voice.

This book ends with the military's May 1994 illegal installation of the de facto supreme court head Emile Jonassaint as "provisional president." As the Preface states, "At this writing, the immediate future of Haiti – and the intentions of U.S. policy – remain unclear" (p. vi). As we know, the U.S. military in September 1994 "liberated" Haiti from being occupied by its own army and in October helped reinstall Jean-Bertrand Aristide as Haiti's rightful president. This reinstallation took three years but followed

by only seven weeks the compliance by Aristide's ministers with the "development" programs of the International Monetary Fund and World Bank. Focusing on the traditional, neoliberal strategies of import substitution, privatization, and an export-based economy, these programs neutralize Aristide's agenda of social justice. The intentions of U.S. policy, then, have become clear: The United States will continue the traditional concerns for political stability and social order in Haiti – and socioeconomic security for Americans. Haiti will quickly become once again an off-shore assembly enclave where U.S. factories can find a docile labor force.

Edouard Glissant. J. MICHAEL DASH. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1995. xii + 202 pp. (Cloth approximately US\$ 50.00)

BERNADETTE CAILLER
Department of Romance Languages and Literatures
University of Florida
Gainesville FL 36211-2005, U.S.A.

Michael Dash's study constitutes a useful introduction to a very complex oeuvre comprising poems, essays, drama, and fiction. It is not, however, a provocative piece of criticism; nowhere does the critic call into question any of Edouard Glissant's intentions or assertions. To paraphrase a remark from Valéry's *Cahiers, II* (1974:1191), Dash does not look into the problems which the writer may have encountered consciously or unconsciously, nor does he try to explain whether such problems appear to have been resolved. Rather, he presents in clear, simple terms what he himself has retained from his reading, mostly along thematic lines.

On the last page of his book, Dash sums up pertinently Glissant's cultural enterprise and its importance for post-negritude and post-colonial studies by stressing the Martiniquan writer's "opposition to *bétonisation*," his appeal to transcend "narrow *indépendantisme*," as well as his "defence of Creole culture." And in the final paragraph, the critic reminds his reader that, owing to Glissant's imaginative power and the complexity of the issues at stake, his oeuvre will always be a "work in progress."

Indeed, Dash's survey enhances Glissant's intensely "poetic" creativity, pointing out several times that precarious, albeit traditional, oppositions between, for instance, theory and practice, prose and poetry, heroic and unheroic, periphery and center, rootedness and *errance*, are constantly questioned in his writings. Because of what Dash himself names "the

innate restlessness and circularity" of Glissant's oeuvre (p. 182), the structure of Dash's study appears somewhat too simple, grouping various works as they were chronologically published under the same heading. Even as Dash praises Glissant's audacious experimentation on the generic, formal, and stylistic levels, in his book, in-depth analyses and critiques of individual texts are not numerous (his analysis of *Monsieur Toussaint* being in this regard, quite notable), nor does he give the reader an opportunity to actually sense the architectural prowess achieved in Glissant's writings. In the chapter devoted to the latter's early poetry and early essays, Dash makes a good case regarding the influence of Saint-John Perse on Glissant's own poetic endeavors. In the section on "Novels of Time and Space," Dash emphasizes the philosophical aspect of Glissant's work appropriately although, in this reader's opinion, he does not give enough credit to its profoundly political dimension. However, one would have to agree with Dash that such a dimension, in Glissant, is not linked to a particular ideology or any political party. Regarding the connection of Glissant's writings to History, Dash does not explore a question which, nowadays, would seem hardly avoidable – that is, the powerful, and creative, presence of fiction in any reconstruction of History (including, of course, personal history). In relation to this question, the critic does not examine whether contemporary views on Historiography might be relevant to Glissantian studies. Finally, when quoting Glissant and his declared affinity with the "Science of Chaos" (p. 177), the critic accepts such a connection at face value. In fact, any rapprochement between Glissant's poetics of interrelating and contemporary physics and mathematics would, no doubt, require much questioning and a great deal of scientific research.

REFERENCE

VALÉRY, PAUL, 1974. *Cahiers, II, 1894-1914*. Paris: Gallimard.

Jean Rhys's Historical Imagination: Reading and Writing the Creole.
VERONICA MARIE GREGG. Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press,
1995. xi + 228 pp. (Cloth US\$ 39.95, Paper US\$ 17.95)

PETER HULME
Department of Literature
University of Essex
Colchester CO4 3SQ, United Kingdom

Jean Rhys continues to attract considerable attention as a Caribbean writer (see Hulme 1994), and Veronica Marie Gregg's full-length study of Rhys's historical imagination is a valuable addition to the secondary literature – even if it opens up more pathways than it can eventually follow.

Gregg defines the central problematic of her book as an investigation of "[t]he extent and manner in which Jean Rhys's own artistic imagination and writing, from the perspective of a West Indian Creole, participate in the contending representations of the West Indies" (p. 25). This approach yields some interesting readings, although it tends to conflate Rhys's own views, candidly expressed, though not always consistent, and the fictional dramatizations of that creole perspective.

The structure of the book is an important aspect of its argument about Rhys's "historical imagination." A brief introduction raises the question of Rhys's nationality and sense of belonging, emphasizing – properly enough – that her hesitations in this regard "strategically redefine her relationship to writing and history" (p. 4). As the word "strategically" suggests, Gregg sees Rhys as actively engaging with historical issues in her writings: one of the strengths of the book is indeed its concern with Rhys as a much more self-conscious writer than she is sometimes given credit for. The long first chapter, "History, Reading, Writing, and the Creole Woman," provides a context for Rhys in writing about the West Indies in general and Dominica in particular, and looks at some of her own writings about herself, especially in the unfinished memoir, *Smile Please*. Chapter 2 focuses on the second half of the nineteenth century as imaginatively recreated in *Wide Sargasso Sea* and *Voyage in the Dark*, as well as two key stories, "Again the Antilles" and "Fishy Waters" (although, weirdly, none of the stories discussed appears in the book's index). Chapter 3 – the shortest and least satisfactory – deals with "The Enigma of the Creole in Europe," offering brief readings of *After Leaving Mr. Mackenzie* and *Good Morning, Midnight*. The last chapter deals with the period from the 1940s to the 1970s, with special attention to issues of "race." A short conclusion ends with a long quotation from the late story, "I Used to Live

Here Once," in which the narrator returns to the house she used to live in, only to realize that she has died, when the children on the lawn fail to see her but register her presence in a sudden chilling of the air.

For a book with just 200 pages of text, a great deal is attempted, most of it worth attempting. In addition to the analyses of Rhys's work, the book includes some sustained attention to the concept of the "creole perspective"; some analysis of nineteenth-century writing about the West Indies (Carlyle, Trollope, Froude); some useful brief history of West Indian literary criticism; and some references to the importance of French ethnographic writing in the Caribbean (Du Tertre, Labat, Rochefort).

The book is at its best when the author gives herself time to build her analyses. *Wide Sargasso Sea* is made to yield more of its complexities, as a novel "whose structure and emplotment are based on precise and strategic interventions in these historical records and narratives" (p. 23) – although, disappointingly, the historical records and narratives appear only through their historical interpreters such as Borome and Chace. The novel's deliberate anachronisms are recognized and discussed, and the relationship between Antoinette and Tia, at the heart of Kamau Brathwaite's acerbic comments on the novel, is the subject of some detailed attention. Gregg's concerns lead her inevitably to the character of the mulatto, Daniel Cosway, who claims to be Antoinette's half-brother; although she doesn't make the point that the Cosways insist that Daniel should be, after his mother, Daniel *Boyd* – a name that resonates through Rhys's work after Anna Morgan's repeated invocation (in *Voyage in the Dark*) of the name Maillotte Boyd, the girl on the slave list. Even more oddly, while relating the character of Papa Dom in "Again the Antilles" to the key figures of Dominica's so-called Mulatto Ascendancy (Charles Falconer, William Davies, and A.R.C. Lockhart), she never makes the connection between A.R.C. and the white Lockharts, although again this goes to the heart of her theme. J.J. Thomas is mentioned for his response to Froude, but his work on the creole language is ignored, despite its obvious relevance to Gregg's central concerns. Intertextuality is an announced topic, but Rhys's literary relationships are not pursued very assiduously: Gregg spends some time on "The Day They Burned the Books," an important story for questions of national belonging, and yet fails to mention, let alone follow through, the relevance of the Maupassant novel, *Fort comme la mort* which the narrator saves from the flames – on this, see the excellent discussion in Helen Carr's shorter, but much sharper book (1996).

The final impression is that Rhys's "historical imagination" runs rather deeper than this book can plumb.

REFERENCES

- CARR, HELEN, 1996. *Jean Rhys*. London: Northcote House (in association with the British Council).
- HULME, PETER, 1994. The Place of *Wide Sargasso Sea*. *Wasafiri* 20:5-11.

Focus and Grammatical Relations in Creole Languages. FRANCIS BYRNE & DONALD WINFORD (eds.). Amsterdam/Philadelphia: John Benjamins, 1993. xvi + 329 pp. (Cloth US\$ 59.00)

SILVIA KOUWENBERG
Department of Language and Linguistics
University of the West Indies
Mona, Kingston, Jamaica

There are several areas of creole syntax that have figured prominently in the debate on the genesis of creole languages. Among those "claimed" by substratists – who regard properties of (Caribbean) creole languages as continuities of West-African languages – is verb focus, better known perhaps as predicate cleft. Unfortunately, verb focus is among the least well-understood areas of creole syntax. A major contribution of this twelfth volume of the Creole Language Library is the elucidation of the formal properties of verb focus in several contributions. Its impact is already evident in the latest textbook on creole studies (Arends *et al.* 1995). However, as with some other volumes in this series, a major weakness is its lack of internal cohesion. The introduction by Byrne, Caskey, and Winford proclaims the topic of this volume to be "the types of constructions and devices which creole languages utilize to achieve constituent emphasis" (p. ix). This effectively makes it a volume on emphatic devices rather than on focus proper, but even so, several contributions fall outside its scope and the editors struggle to draw them all under a single label. There are eleven articles that bear some – sometimes tenuous – relation to verb focus or constituent focus. In addition, there is a final section comprised of the articles for which the title of this volume has been augmented with "... and grammatical relations": John Lumsden on the argument structure and case-assigning properties of Haitian *rete* 'remain' and *manke* 'lack', and Pieter Muysken on reflexive expressions in Papiamentu. Although these are fine contributions, the book appears distinctly unbalanced by their inclusion.

This review will briefly consider verb focus. The impression created in earlier literature is of a unified phenomenon, with the properties illustrated by the Berbice Dutch Creole (BD) utterance in (1): a verb (here: *mu* 'go') appears twice, in a position preceding its clause, and in its normal position in the clause. Its first occurrence is marked for focus, here by the "highlighter" *da* and the focus marker *so*, and lacks verbal properties; thus, it lacks the tense and aspect markers which accompany its clause-internal occurrence. The utterance receives an emphatic interpretation; emphasis is on the actual realization of the event described by *mu*.

- (1) BD *Da mu so o wa mu-te*
 be go FOCUS 3Sg PAST go-PERFECTIVE
 "He had really gone" (Kouwenberg 1994:438).

But (2), which similarly contains a verb in initial position, lacks an emphatic interpretation. Claire Lefebvre and Elisabeth Ritter ("Two Types of Predicate Doubling Adverbs in Haitian Creole," pp. 65-91) refer to such Haitian (HA) constructions as "predicate doubling," to be distinguished from verb focus or predicate cleft on the basis of its formal properties. Like (2), (3) has a temporal adverbial interpretation. As it does not involve focus or any other emphatic device, predicate doubling really falls outside the scope of this book. Nonetheless, this article well deserves its inclusion based on its usefulness in delimiting predicate cleft from other constructions that involve the appearance of a verb copy.

- (2) BD *Di drai wat ju drai-te, o ku-te ju.*
 the turn what you turn-ASPECT, 3Sg catch-ASPECT you
 "As soon as you turn around, it catches you" (Kouwenberg
 1994:437).
- (3) HA *Fini ou fini travay la, ou ava al wè Mari.*
 finish you finish work Det, you FUT go see Mary
 "As soon as you have finished this work, you will go see
 Mary" (p. 67).

Victor Manfredi's contribution ("Verb Focus in the Typology of Kwa/Kru and Haitian," pp. 3-51) is by far the longest and, shall we say, the weightiest. Despite the strong theoretical bias which might deter some from consulting it, its main point is well worth taking: there is a range of verb focus constructions which may be established cross-linguistically and which can be accounted for in a parametric framework that makes some simple choices available, such as what types of verbal elements may be nominalized (V⁰

or VP), and what element licenses appearance in a fronted position (or not, in which case we get in-situ focus). The resulting typology provides a basis for establishing cross-creole typological unity or lack thereof, and for establishing creole-African typological unity or lack thereof.

Contributions such as those discussed here provide the groundwork that allows substratists (and non-substratists) to seriously establish claims in that ongoing debate on the genesis of creole languages. They can no longer be forgiven for assuming the uniformity of a phenomenon such as verb focus and even less for asserting rather than establishing the superiority of their position.

Finally, the well-established carelessness of production of this series is evident in the listing of Oyèláràn and Muysken's contributions in the Contents.

REFERENCES

ARENDS, JACQUES, PIETER MUYSKEN & NORVAL SMITH (eds.), 1995. *Pidgins and Creoles: An Introduction*. Amsterdam/Philadelphia: John Benjamins.

KOUWENBERG, SILVIA, 1994. *A Grammar of Berbice Dutch Creole*. Berlin/New York: Mouton de Gruyter.

Sentential Complementation in Sranan: On the Formation of an English-based Creole Language. INGO PLAG. Tübingen: Max Niemeyer, 1993. ix + 174 pp. (Paper DM 88.00)

JOHN H. MCWHORTER
University of California at Berkeley
2337 Dwinelle Hall, Linguistics
Berkeley CA 94720-2572, U.S.A.

The central thesis of this book takes issue with Derek Bickerton's controversial claim (1981) that the transition from pidgin to creole in plantation societies was an abrupt one, with African adults' limited linguistic capacities in the colonizers' language forcing slave children to create a language anew via an innate "bioprogram." Plag makes a case that the complementizer category in Sranan Creole English took several generations to develop, and that this indicates that Bickerton's scenario is mistaken.

Plag finds much of his argument upon historical documents of Sranan, in line with a growing body of diachronic work on creoles. The first problem here is that documentation does not begin until almost sixty years into the colonization of Suriname, and we lack anything approaching a comprehensive, nuanced treatment until *one hundred and thirty* years after colonization. The second problem is that what evidence the sources do offer does not support Plag's conclusions terribly well.

For example, Plag concludes that the verb *taki* "to talk, say" did not evolve into a complementizer (*mi si taki a tru* "I see that it is true") until well into the 1800s. However, this requires his explaining away, unconvincingly, a rather clear counterexample from 1783 (and its occurrence then implies that it had developed even earlier) (p. 65). The relatively small number of tokens of *any* construction in the 1783 source, despite it being the lengthiest Sranan text until that time, hardly justify Plag's assumption that the construction was absent or marginal simply because it is only indicated once. A similar problem arises with his demonstration that the complementizer reflex of *fu* "for" (*Mi wani fu go* "I want to go") was a gradual development. Here, it is even earlier (1740) that we find tokens in which *fu* appears much further evolved along the complementizer pathway than Plag would prefer (p. 131), and his justification for dismissing them is based upon decidedly forced readings of the sentences. Ultimately, the documents appear to give little reason to doubt that *taki* and *fu* were being used as complementizers early in the 1700s if not before (although it is possible that their occurrence had yet to become obligatory at this time).

A further problem is that English and African languages have constructions which these complementizers could easily have been modelled upon quite early in Sranan's development, obviating the need for their independent evolution later. For example, Plag treats complementizer *fu* as an innovation in comparison to standard English, but in fact, many regional English dialects which the colonists actually spoke used *for* as a complementizer (some in conjunction with *to*, some alone), as in the Cornwall *The wheelwright's here for mend the cart* (Hancock 1994:104). Along the same lines, two of the best represented African languages in colonial Suriname, Akan and Gbe, have *say*-complementizers which occur in a similar range of constructions as *taki*. Discussing this, Plag surmises that substrate influence may have acted in tandem with independent innovation (p. 155). However, with the documentary data offering such unlikely support for innovation, it is unclear why we should prefer this conspiracy analysis. It seems more economical to simply propose that *taki*, in all of its functions, was modelled directly upon substrate equivalents.

Most serious, however, is a general theoretical issue. Namely, it is unclear that the development of *say*-complementizers is even a syndrome of creolization as defined by Bickerton. As Plag is aware, all processes associated with creolization occur in regular languages as well. What Bickerton has called attention to is the fact that certain developments, out of the myriad possible, regularly cluster in plantation creoles, and thus appear to comprise the minimal requirements of a full language. Bickerton considers *say*-complementizers to fall outside of this class. Plag counters that *taki* and *fu* are indeed examples of creolization because they allow semantic distinctions that expand the resources of the language. This, however, is an excessively expansive definition, since it can be said of any new construction in any language. More to the point, nowhere in his argument does Plag note that Haitian Creole and the other French-based Caribbean creoles show no sign of developing *say*-complementizers after centuries of use.

In the case of *fu*, the author considers the documents to reveal the very emergence of the syntactic position COMP (p. 151), which is a more likely candidate as a *sine qua non* of full language. Again, however, the documents readily allow that *fu* was used as a complementizer long before Sranan had been transcribed, especially given the ready source in regional English constructions. Thus in the strict sense, the evidence allows that COMP indeed arose in Sranan as far back as the 1600s, as Bickerton would assume.

On the positive side, the book includes a useful demographic and socio-historical survey of colonial Suriname, with a particularly timely comparison of some recent demographic revisions with those most consulted previously. Plag has also elicited some interesting data from informants, and provides a convincing GB (Government and Binding) based argument for the existence of nonfinite clauses in Sranan, *contra* various writers who have suggested that creoles lack the nonfinite category.

Indeed, Plag's presentation is by and large a considered synthesis of syntactic, sociohistorical, and philological investigation. In the final analysis, however, while the gradual creolization hypothesis itself has much merit, it is unlikely that the early Sranan documentation of *taki* and *fu* supports it.

REFERENCES

BICKERTON, DEREK, 1981. *Roots of Language*. Ann Arbor: Karoma.

HANCOCK, IAN, 1994. Componentiality and the Creole Matrix: The Southwest English Contribution. In Michael Montgomery (ed.), *The Crucible of Carolina: Essays in the Development of Gullah Language and Culture*. Athens: University of Georgia Press, pp. 95-114.

Politics, Race, and Youth in Guyana. MADAN M. GOPAL. San Francisco: Mellen Research University Press, 1992. xvi + 289 pp. (Cloth US\$ 79.95, Paper US\$ 49.95)

PERCY C. HINTZEN
Department of African American Studies
University of California at Berkeley
Berkeley CA 94720-2572, U.S.A.

Madan Gopal attempts a reflection upon ethnicity and politics as viewed through the eyes of East Indian adolescents in the Republic of Guyana. He does so through an in-depth exploration of the "subjective consciousness" of twenty East Indian youths (fourteen boys and six girls) between the ages of sixteen and eighteen. He conducts seventy-seven interviews in the "local mode of popular discourse" known as "gyaffing."

The problem, as he presents it, is one of racist politics and class domination under conditions of political polarization between the two major ethnic groups in the country: Afro-Guyanese and East Indians (Indo-Guyanese). In 1982, when interviews were conducted, these two groupings comprised 31 percent and 51 percent of the population respectively. At the time, the country was in the throes of prolonged economic and political crisis.

Employing a relatively uncomplicated version of the emic approach, Gopal attempts to discern the key concepts employed by the adolescents, and their meanings, from discourses about politics and ethnicity. He uses these concepts to map out the informants' outlook or "political consciousness." There is unanimity among the adolescents that the "government" is the cause of "concrete hardship" and "fear." These are experienced as "pressure" acting on "the people" (defined as blacks and Indians). Such pressure is seen to have caused a "collective but uneasy inaction" charac-

terized by "a desire to go forward" to "betterment" which is obstructed by "fear."

Gopal's organization and presentation of data from his interviews are quite convincing. So is his argument, derived from these data, that among his informants there seems to be a desire for the "coming together" of the ethnic groups. He terms this desire "interethnic bias." The common experience of suffering by the two ethnic groups is important in this regard. It has led to a common desire for "transcendence" of the socio-economic crisis and the realization that such transcendence can be achieved best through interethnic alliance. Gopal considers this to be indicative of the precedence of "class consciousness" over "ethnic consciousness." He sees the "government" as the perceived "ruling class" in the "consciousness" of his adolescent respondents.

The reader might very well be predisposed to accept Gopal's analyses and conclusions if they did not extend beyond what is presented above. This in spite of the fact that the respondents came entirely from families living within a 14-mile radius of the capital city, were self-selected, were all opposed to the government, and had parents who were all urban and rural laborers. Considerable problems emerge, however, in Gopal's attempts to present a universal theoretical model of change in "race/class relationships" and to employ the history of race relations in Guyana as its supporting basis. His conclusions about adolescent political consciousness appear to be merely an empirical demonstration of the validity of his model.

Gopal proceeds in his analysis by detailing the history of race relations between Afro-Guyanese and Indo-Guyanese. In the process, he makes the quite valid, though hackneyed, point that such relations were conditioned by strategies of the colonial and post-colonial political elites to "divide and rule." But his documentation of the periods of inter-ethnic cooperation and conflict is speculative, impressionistic, superficial, and flawed. Through his theoretical model Gopal attempts to explain "movement" towards "greater congruence" or "greater incongruence" between class and ethnic interests. He sees this movement to be controlled by "blockage" manifest in "threat." The attempt is infused with tautologies, non sequiturs, contradictions, and faulty logic.

Flaws in Gopal's analysis become evident in his attempts to relate his theoretical model to the conclusions drawn from his interviews. For example, he terms "inter-ethnic bias" the desire expressed by his respondents for inter-group harmony. In his theoretical model, he uses the term "congruence" to indicate a condition where the boundaries of class and ethnicity are coincident. Gopal considers "inter-ethnic bias" to be an indi-

cator of "congruence" despite its logical invalidity on two grounds: a confusion of intra-group with inter-group phenomena and a confusion of levels of analysis. Both confusions are pervasive throughout the book.

The analysis is complicated by contradictory arguments. For example, ethnic relations are said to be responsive to economic conditions at one point, to political ones at another. Moreover, Gopal is predisposed to grand leaps of inferential logic. From the "key concepts" employed by his respondents, he infers psychological states (such as "temporary affective turmoil" and "oppositional consciousness"). From the concepts he also proceeds to make inductive claims about the organization of the socio-political structure.

Despite his own cautions against generalization, Gopal sees in his key concepts indices of a universal trend in Guyana toward "inter-ethnic consciousness." This, he argues, is reflected in a universal tendency among the "people" to support multi-racial solutions to politics and, specifically, in their calls for a "national front" government including all the racial groups. The reality is quite different. Elections held in 1992, ten years after his research was conducted, showed Guyanese voting patterns to be as racially polarized as they ever were. This calls into question the predictive validity of his analysis.

Gopal's case is not helped by his tendency toward grand unsubstantiated assertions, his veiled and obtuse writing style, and arguments replete with social science truisms and axioms. The book is poorly edited with scores of typographical errors. The presentation of data is quite inconsistent. Gopal is best when he sticks to his data and to their specific implications.

Pan i rèspèt: Criminaliteit van geïmmigreerde Curaçaose jongeren.
HANS VAN HULST & JEANETTE BOS. Utrecht: OKU. 1994. 226 pp. (Paper
NLG 40.00)

W.C.J. KOOT
Department of Organizational Anthropology
Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam
1081 HV Amsterdam, the Netherlands

A few years ago, the chief commissioner of the Amsterdam police, Eric Nordholt, who is noted for his controversial pronouncements in the media, brought the increase in crime among Antillean youngsters in the Nether-

lands to the attention of the press. According to Nordholt, the problem involved youngsters who had already been underprivileged in the Antilles and who had come to the Netherlands on the local labor and housing markets, often with the financial support of the Antillean government. In Holland they were once more faced with unemployment and dead-ends. Nordholt also predicted a further increase in the number of criminal Antillean youngsters, if the problems of unemployment and poverty in the Antilles were not tackled. The Antillean Minister of Justice at the time vigorously objected, saying that Nordholt's utterances amounted to negative image-building and labeling. She also said that Nordholt would never be able to substantiate his suggestion that the Antillean government supported the departure of the Antillean youngsters. Nordholt was accused of lying and cheating. The incident dealt a terrible blow to Dutch-Antillean relationships. On closer examination the chief commissioner turned out not to have any evidence that the Antillean government was providing support. He also failed to produce the factual information that could have backed up his assumptions about the young peoples' background and his statements about the increase in crime. The study by Van Hulst and Bos is an attempt to correct this deficiency. They were assigned by the Ministry of Justice to make an inventory of the extent and nature of the criminality, and of the background of the youngsters involved. They applied a secondary analysis to data from the identification systems (HKS) of three police precincts and information from files of the Child Welfare Councils, complemented by interviews with public prosecutors and social workers. They also devised a theoretical framework in order to answer the question of which crime-curbing and crime-advancing forces are at work in what they call the relationship domain, the social domain, and the ideological domain in which the youngsters grow up. Data on this last domain were primarily obtained from the literature on the Antilles. The most important results are the following:

First, more than 80 percent of the Antillean youngsters come from Curaçao. In terms of percentages, the Curaçao youngsters have the highest crime rate (one in eight or nine) of all distinguished ethnic groups in the Netherlands. A proportionately large number of Curaçao girls are booked by the police. Youngsters from Curaçao are suspected of serious crimes relatively often. According to the researchers, they come from the lower-class black community of Curaçao and in recent years are faced with a growing lack of perspective due to the absence of a proper education, housing, and employment. The youngsters in this group, Van Hulst and Bos say, are not reared in a supportive climate. Moreover, fatalism coupled with feelings of inferiority are prevalent in this group and they are focused

on the direct gratification of needs without any future planning. The logical consequence is escapism: drugs and/or migration, the next step being criminal behavior – in short, all the characteristics of a culture of poverty.

Van Hulst and Bos should be highly praised for their thorough investigation of police files and those of the Child Welfare Councils. Their research has produced highly valuable and concrete data on the extent and nature of crime among youngsters from Curaçao. Besides, they have made an attempt to look at this behavior from several points of view (interpersonal, social, and ideological domains) in order to find plausible explanations. Nevertheless, I find the explanatory aspect of their study unconvincing.

They do give a number of economic and cultural explanations, but these are not really based on empirical research among the youngsters themselves. Besides, they offer few insights on the question of how Antillean youngsters who are having problems actually end up in the criminal circuit, choose to stay there, and make a career of crime. What does the daily life of a criminal Antillean youngster look like? The study is methodologically weak, particularly with respect to the way its facts are compiled and how it is designed. The inclusion of a control group of non-booked Antillean youngsters (and perhaps one of Dutch youngsters) in the research would have helped. The authors observe this omission themselves, but that does not solve the problem. A comparative study would also have permitted an analysis of the significance of the ongoing fragmentation processes. The societies of both Curaçao and the Netherlands show postmodernist tendencies such as recalcitrance and cultural fragmentation. These may be stronger on Curaçao, but if so, how can it be explained? Furthermore, the authors should have executed their interviews, observations, and life histories with more assiduity. As it is, readers are left with serious doubts about the factors that result in the comparatively high crime rate among Antillean youngsters. Moreover, for administrators and social workers it is not really helpful to think up ways to end the process of marginalization and criminalization. Obviously, improving the social opportunities of the youngsters involved is a prerequisite to preventing them from going astray in the future. But will this be enough?

Een zweem van weemoed: Verhalen uit de Antilliaanse slaventijd. CORNELIS CH. GOSLINGA. Curaçao: Caribbean Publishing, 1993. 175 pp. (Paper n.p.)

Plantage Savonet: Verleden en toekomst. INGVAR KRISTENSEN. Curaçao: STINAPA, 1993. 73 pp. (Paper n.p.)

HAN JORDAAN
Medical Department, Section Medical History
Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam
1081 BT Amsterdam, the Netherlands

Most academic historians will consider authors of historical fiction and those who write popular historical works with distrust, if not with contempt. So, should a historian by chance have any literary ambitions, it is unlikely that he will become a historical novelist. Cornelis Goslinga is an exception in this respect. In his latest collection of short stories the former history teacher and university professor mixes fact and fiction in an attempt to capture "the unique character of the Curaçao people" in the days of slavery.

Historical events, such as the slave revolt of 1795, form the stage on which Goslinga's imaginary characters act and interact with historical figures. Thus, the reader is introduced to a pathological woman slayer, to the Swiss-born Governor Faesch with his German accent, to a slick Latin marriage swindler who sells his victims to Louisiana brothels, and to a "papist" priest who is more interested in worldly affairs than in saving souls. Some of the stories are rather anecdotal, others tend to be pure melodrama. The title story about the runaway slavegirl Tamar and her mentally handicapped child (the result of an affair with her master's son, who happened to be her half-brother) is real "sob-stuff."

Of course the book cannot be meant as a serious attempt to picture the colonial past of Curaçao and it consequently should not be judged as such. But it can't be considered to be a work of literature either. For Goslinga's language is often cliché-ridden, while the stories lack the necessary imaginative power and originality and, what is more, hardly anything is left to the imagination of the reader. Sometimes an overkill of horrifying details makes a story lose much of its potential power. Goslinga apparently is too much of a historian to leave things unexplained.

Apart from being a romantic and a brave man – he ventures out on what most of his colleagues would consider dangerous grounds and thus makes himself an easy target for ridicule – Goslinga also appears to be a talented

artist. For the author's illustrations to his stories show that he is perfectly capable of capturing a scene or a character with just a few strokes. Why doesn't Goslinga try to use his pen like he wields his pencil and brush?

In a sympathetic booklet Ingvar Kristensen introduces Savonet plantation, which forms part of Christoffel National Park on Curaçao. Disguised as an excursion guide, it is in fact a plea for the preservation of the material remnants of Curaçao's colonial past. After an introduction on the geology of the park and its flora and fauna, Kristensen discusses the history of Savonet, the present state of its buildings, and its potential future importance as an educational and preservatory center for Curacao's history. Much attention is paid to the original construction and furnishing of the mansion, to the lay-out and former use of the other buildings and structures, and to the past functioning of Savonet as an agricultural enterprise. Many details are drawn from oral information, collected by the author. A list of informants is included as an appendix.

Kristensen is convincing in explaining the uniqueness of the Savonet complex and he is capable of passing on to the reader his dedication to the realization of its restauration and preservation. In fact, his enthusiasm is so compelling that one can easily forgive Kristensen for sometimes assuming that readers possess more knowledge than they actually do. What is a "kayuda"? And who in heaven's name was "our unbending general" who earned the nickname "pokhouten Leen" (pockwooden Leen) during the struggle in New Guinea?

Johannes King: Profeet en apostel in het Surinaamse bosland. HESDIE STUART ZAMUEL. Zoetermeer: Boekencentrum, 1994. vi + 241 pp. (Paper NLG 39.90)

GERRIT NOORT

Board of Mission of the Netherlands Reformed Church
2340 AA Oegstgeest, the Netherlands

The author of this doctoral dissertation was born in Kwatahede in Suriname. He completed his theological studies at Utrecht University and then returned to Suriname, where he served as minister in a local congregation and as a chaplain in the army. He now heads the Theological Seminary of the Moravian Church in Paramaribo. His ethnic background as a Matawai proves an excellent starting point for researching the life and work of

Johannes King (also Matawai), whom he calls "prophet and apostle of the Surinamese forest."

Zamuel intends first to research King as a person and second to understand his life and work against the background of the nineteenth century. After a descriptive part on Suriname society until the second half of the nineteenth century, he launches into a discussion of King. After carefully describing and analyzing primary sources, such as the "Skrekiboekoe" (Book of Fright) and "Torie vo Maripaston" (The Story of Maripaston), he devotes a part to King's theology and finally, in Part IV, traces his impact on the Suriname context in which he worked. Zamuel relates the contents of quite a few visions which were written down by King. In these visions, experienced around the middle of the nineteenth century, King's spirit was taken to heaven and hell and he was shown what it is like in both places. He also received instructions for everyday life as well as "church-life." It is interesting to see how the visions reflect both Christian "text" and non-Christian "context." In a vision of 1855, for example, we read about a message from the deceased forefathers, telling King to proclaim the gospel faithfully.

According to the Matawai there is open communication between the world of gods and humans. The Moravian missionaries were strongly opposed to this worldview and looked on demonstrations of such communication as signs of *winti*-possession. Zamuel tries to prove that King, although strongly influenced by Moravian theology, goes his own way. The analysis of the component of King's approach that derives from his Matawai cultural background, is not very detailed. The contents of Chapter 9 (King as an independent theologian) and the second section of Chapter 11 (King's influence) are rather shallow. That might be due partly to a lack of historical data, but anthropological analytical models might have helped. As a consequence it does not become sufficiently clear what exactly is meant by King's communication of the gospel "from within" local culture (p. 92). Zamuel points to King's "Dresiboekoe" (book about the use of traditional medicines), but a major part of this book is lost. The book was not given to the Moravian missionaries, but rather to relatives, because King suspected that the missionaries would not be happy with his Matawai ways. The reasoning at this point remains somewhat hypothetical (see for example p. 41). Pages 123 to 217 are devoted to King's written works. This part of the book is mainly a source-publication, partly prepared by (and now published in tribute to) the late Dr. Jan Voorhoeve. Unfortunately, the index is limited to persons only, which makes the book harder to use.